



République de la Guinée Ministère de l'Administration du Territoire et la Décentralisation

TOWARDS UNIVERSAL BIRTH REGISTRATION IN GUINEA



ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS FOR CIVIL REGISTRATION REFORM IN GUINEA FOR GOVERNMENT AND UNICEF

> CIVIL REGISTRATION CENTRE FOR DEVELOPMENT—CRC4D THE HAGUE, MARCH 2014

«L'UNICEF intervient dans le domaine de l'enregistrement des naissances en fournissant les registres d'état civil auprès de la DNEC avec un plan de redistribution sur l'ensemble du territoire. L'UNICEF souhaite intervenir dans ce secteur directement auprès des populations et des acteurs locaux dans les domaines de la formation et de la sensibilisation des populations. Afin d'améliorer la situation actuelle préoccupante de sous-déclaration des naissances, un forum avec l'ensemble des acteurs est en cours de préparation afin de définir une stratégie nationale en matière d'état civil. Pour ce faire, une étude diagnostic permettant d'identifier les goulots d'étranglements et de proposer des solutions apparaît un préalable nécessaire.» Source : European Union, 2013.

The contact point for UNICEF was Guirlene C. Fréderic (gfrederic@unicef.org).

Civil Registration Centre for Development—CRC4D 19 Koninginnegracht 2514AB The Hague The Netherlands Tel: 31 70 7113109 Email: info@crc4d.com Website: https://www.crc4d.com

The assignment to do a civil registration situation assessment and generate recommendations for government and UNICEF programming was carried out by **Jaap van der Straaten**, CEO of the Civil Registration Centre for Development—CRC4D, and **Karamo Théophile Fenano**, Focal point of Le Ministère de l'Administration Territoriale et de la Décentralisation. Jaap van der Straaten led the project. For information contact Jaap van der Straaten (jvanderstraaten@crc4d.com).

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABBREVIATIONS-3

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY-4

- 1 SITUATION ANALYSIS—11
- 1.1 VITAL SIGNS OF CIVIL REGISTRATION—13
- 1.2 ORGANIZATIONAL REVIEW—25
- 1.3 LEGAL FRAMEWORK—45
- 1.4 DEMAND-56
- 1.5 GOVERNMENT POLICY, PLANS AND INTERNATIONAL SUPPORT—66
- 1.6 COMMUNICATION FOR DEVELOPMENT—73
- 1.7 BOTTLENECKS-74
- 2 PROGRAMMING-77
- 2.1 INTRODUCTION-77
- 2.2 THE ROLE OF UNICEF IN BIRTH REGISTRATION AND ITS INTERNAL ORGANIZATION—77
- 2.3 PROGRAMMING FOR BIRTH REGISTRATION IN THE CONTEXT OF CIVIL REGISTRATION—79
- 2.3.1 ORGANIZATIONAL CHANGE-79
- 2.3.2 LEGAL CHANGE-88
- 2.3.3 STIMULATING DEMAND-91
- 2.3.4 COMMUNICATION FOR DEVELOPMENT (C4D)-93
- 2.3.5 COALITIONS AND PARTNERSHIPS-98
- 2.4 SYNTHESIS: ADDRESSING BOTTLENECKS-101
- 2.5 GOVERNMENT AND UNICEF PROGRAMMING—103

ANNEXES-104

- ANNEX 1 PERSONS AND INSTITUTIONS CONSULTED—105
- ANNEX 2 BIRTH REGISTRATION AND THE GLOBAL RIGHTS AGENDA—107
- ANNEX 3 AGE DISTRIBUTION DELAYED REGISTRATION IN KINDIA COMMUNE—110
- ANNEX 4 ESTIMATES OF THE NUMBER OF UNREGISTERED CHILDREN AND CHILDREN WITHOUT A BIRTH CERTIFICATE—111

INFORMATION SOURCES-112

ABBREVIATIONS

AIMF BUNEC C4D CEC CENI CNEC CRC CRD DHS DNEC EAC ECOWAS EDS	Association Internationale des Maires Francophone Bureau National de l'Etat Civil (Cameroon) Communication for Development Centre de l'Etat Civil (civil registry office) Commission Electoral Nationale Indépendante Centre National de l'Etat Civil (Senegal) Convention—, Committee on the Rights of the Child Communauté Rurale de Développement Demographic and Health Survey Direction National de l'Etat Civil East African Community Economic Community of West African States Enquête Démographie et de Santé
EPI	Expanded Program on Immunization (WHO)
EU GNI	European Union Gross National Income
GNI PC	Gross National Income Per Capita
ICCPR	International Convention on Civil and Political Rights
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
ICT4D	Information and Communication Technology for Development
ID IDA	Identity document International Development Association (part of the World Bank group)
IIVRS	International Institute for Vital Registration and Statistics.
IFES	International Foundation for Election/Electoral Systems
INS	Institut National de la Statistique
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
ISN	Interim strategy note
КАР	Knowledge, attitudes, practices
LDC	Least developed countries
MATD	Ministère de l'Administration du Territoire et de la Décentralisation
MDG	Millennium Development Goal
MICS	Multi-Indicator Cluster Survey
MoRES MSHP	Monitoring Results for Equitable Systems Ministère de la Santé et de l'Hygiene Publique
NADRA	National Data Base and Registration Authority (Pakistan)
OMS	Organisation Mondiale de la Santé (WHO)
PRSP	Poverty reduction strategy paper
RENACOT	Reseau National des Communicateurs Traditionels
RENIEC	Registro Nacional de Identificación y Estado Civil (Peru)
SITAN	(UNICEF's) Situation Analysis for a program country
SOWC	State of the World's Children
UN	United Nations
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
UNHCR UNSD	United Nations High Commission of Refugees United Nations Statistics Division
UNV	United Nations Volunteers
URSB	Uganda Registration Services Bureau (Uganda)
WHO	World Health Organization (OMS)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

SITUATION ANALYSIS

Guinea has almost twice the birth registration rate, **57.9% (2012)**, as expected for its income of USD 460 per capita (31%). **But**, a high number of **1 in 4** of registered children do **NOT** have a birth certificate. In Guinea, being registered but not having a birth certificate is almost equivalent to not being registered at all. Delayed registration (half a year or longer after the occurrence of the event) may also **NEVER** happen in **4 out of 5** cases. The total number of unregistered children under-5 is estimated at **821,000** (2014) and the total number without birth certificate at **1,141,000**. For the under-18 the country estimates are **2,489,000** unregistered and **3,459,000** without birth certificate.

There are serious concerns as well about the present quality of registration, about content error (by a lack of controls) and about the care given to archiving of records for permanent preservation. Death registration rates in Guinea are very low, probably below 6%. During the 2000s first a decline but thereafter a recovery of the birth registration rate occurred, though not yet back to the level of 1999. Guinea has the urban-rural birth registration differentials that one would expect, although at a higher level of registration than is the case for the peer group of LDCs. The differences between regions are large. In some regions, the "problem of the missing birth certificates" is significant. **The rich-poor disparity is stark when compared internationally.** This may be an indication that the costs of birth registration, direct and indirect, legal and illegal, deprive the poorest citizens from a legal identity, and are a major reason of inequitable service delivery.

One of the prime organizational obstacles is the lack of central control, a problem that is as old as the secularisation of civil registration in France dating from 1792. The present national responsibility for civil registration is shared in an opaque way with local government, the courts and with the health ministry, although the latter still in a nascent form. What gives pause is that Guinea is among a group of fifteen countries in Sub-Saharan Africa, all with a French past, of which only 1 in 4 had a sustained improvement in registration since the year 2000. This may indicate barriers for development in French-provenance registration systems. Decentralization policy has reinforced the centrifugal forces already built into the system. Perversely, this has given rise to a situation of laissez-faire in civil registration, compromising national as well as local good governance.

The nature of civil registration is that—unless a country and its people are rich, and/or its population density is high—the vital events will not be numerous enough to justify a granular network of registration offices that can be financially sustained. In countries such as Guinea a transformation of civil registration service organization is necessary. Guinea cannot afford more offices than the present 348; other solutions than more offices are needed.

Examples of civil registration finance illustrate that the civil registration system in Guinea shows no uniformity across the country. In Kindia revenues from civil registration are NOT needed to run the day-to-day business of the municipal government while civil registration productivity is high and archiving excellent. In the Matoto (Conakry) office revenues keep dozens of people on the payroll, but civil registration record archiving is very poor nevertheless. Both offices underreport actual registration numbers. Similarly, delayed registration is a source of revenue for the justice sector and high costs encourage the public to resort to counterfeit documents. It is therefore not a surprise that there is a great disparity between the poor and the rich in registration rates. Social transfer programs, when linking tangible benefits to a beneficiary ID, hold a promise to counter the disincentives for civil registration.

Civil registration records need to be kept forever. While there are excellent examples of civil record archiving (Kindia) they are the exception rather than the rule. The civil registers and the duplicate registers are kept across the country rather than centrally. Access to the present registers for individuals who seek an extract or for government to produce vital statistics is as good as impossible. The popular uprising in 2007 has shown that great damage can be done to registers when they are kept with little or no security. Reconstitution of registers is extremely costly—**but needs to take place**.

MATD/DNEC shares responsibility for the implementation of civil registration with the justice and health ministry. "Client ministries", the ones that would benefit from quality civil registration data, are the planning ministry and its national statistics institute, the health ministry, the education ministry and the social welfare ministry. They all have a reason to lobby the executive and the legislative to help improve the status of civil registration. These clients and the general public are unlikely to be able or willing to pay for the service what it costs. Consequently DNEC needs to make a well-documented case at budget time for civil registration as a public good. Awareness and knowledge of the critical importance of birth registration for social and economic development among national and local policy makers and planners, in the larger context of national identity management, requires improvement.

Guinea not yet looks at the modernisation of its civil registration system in a holistic way. Guinea has an electoral register, which IFES labelled as "as good as complete". The coverage of the national ID database (from 15 years and up, compulsory) is likely rather low (about 20%). The civil register, in an unlinked way spread across communes, will cover probably around 1 in 2 Guineans citizens of all ages. The investments in costly electoral registration campaigns or the introduction of a new national ID are not yet leveraged to improve all identity systems at once. The recent investment for the elections (probably close to USD 40M) and the ECOWAS commitment for investment in a new biometric national ID (probably close to USD80M, equivalent to 40% of the annual amount of international aid) illustrate that fragmented national identity management can be an expensive undertaking for a poor country.

The current legal framework for civil registration, national ID and voter registration lacks the integration and sophistication across sectors and ID systems, or provisions for the use of ICT. The legal framework for national identity management is a patchwork, for civil registration harking back to colonial, pen- and paper times and having some very fundamental flaws. As regards international law, Guinea needs to improve its implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child and its reporting to the Committee. This

lack of compliance to regular reporting also affects Committee monitoring of the development of birth registration in the country.

Guinea has never had more than small-scale support from UNICEF, Plan and AIMF for modernization of its civil registration system. International support of significance has been limited to election support and voter registration.

PROGRAMMING

Given 1) the current status of the civil registration sector, 2) the knowledge that new elections for local government and the presidency will be held in 2014/2015, 3) that a biometric national ID will be introduced rather soon and 4) that Guinea will receive more than notional financial support for civil registration reform for the first time, the conclusion that Guinea is on a crossroads is apt. Guinea can choose for comprehensive reform of its civil and electoral registration and national identification systems. Alternatively it can (continue to) make incremental and parallel improvements to these separate systems. Given the country's recently started journey towards democracy and good governance since the elections of 2010 and 2013, the choice ought to be for comprehensive reform. This will also receive staunch support from the donor community.

The immediate follow-up for MATD/DNEC and UNICEF would be to undertake the lobbying and legwork to obtain high-level stakeholder buy-in, foster the expedient constitution of the High-Level Committee (recommendation R1.2) and start work on developing the civil registration- and identification policy (R1.1).

The European Union has proposed a feasibility study of the recommendations, with a focus on obtaining proof of concept for the technological elements and the enhanced role of the health sector. The EU has as well proposed that a separate project for legal reform be developed.

Other next steps for a UNICEF project are the hiring process for a project manager and the development of a detailed implementation plan for resultsbased project planning and implementation.

Following are the recommendations arrived at in this report. They are based on an in-depth analysis of "bottlenecks" and on conclusions reached at a five-day participatory stakeholder workshop held in Conakry in November 2013. Recommendations marked Rx(.x) are recommendations proposed for incorporation within or support to an envisaged UNICEF project. The project will find an optimal balance between the introduction of structural changes and urgency by focusing on "quick wins" some of which will need a legal basis. To provide that basis it is proposed that a decree is passed to enact those changes. The recommendations are presented according to the MoRES framework (that differs slightly with the order of sections in chapter 1).

Enabling Environment—1		
Bottleneck domain	Bottleneck	Recommendations
Bottleneck domain #1	Civil registration and identification policy High-Level Steering Committee Technical Committee	 R1. Enabling environment (legal and policy framework) R1.1 It is proposed that the Government of Guinea develops a comprehensive policy for civil registration and identification. R1.2 For the development and implementation of the policy an Inter-ministerial Steering Committee ("High-Level Committee") led by the Prime Minister is proposed. R1.3 For implementation of the policy for civil registration and identification a Technical Committee led by MATD is proposed.
	Budget, subsidies and fees	 R2 Enabling environment (Legal and policy framework) R2.1 MATD is proposed to review current policy with regards to the subsidy for and support to registration offices and adopt a new policy to set country-wide uniform standards for subsidy for, support to and fees charged by registration offices. DNEC to develop realistic draft annual budgets for subsidy of and support to registration offices and move towards results-based budgeting. R2.2 Birth- and death registration within the legal timeframe to be free and late registration within the proposed grace period (see R10) to be fixed at NGF 5,000. R2.3 MATD and MJGS to agree on a countrywide uniform, low fee for the court procedure for delayed registration.
Bottleneck domain #2	Legal framework Consistency across laws Compliance with the law	R.3 Enabling environment (Legal and policy framework) Guinea needs a new, modern law on civil registration, vital statistics and identification that is in accordance with international standards. This law can replace the legal texts that are now scattered over different laws, decrees and ordinances some of which cannot even be found anymore. Such a new law could be an evidence-based law. The law could also be accompanied with regulations that serve as practical and operational guideline as well as legal foundation for, for example, fees that may require more frequent change than the main body of civil registration and identification law. The new law should provide the legal basis for digitization and the use of technology. It is proposed that the lawmaking process will be thorough, informed by international good practice and consultative, and without undue pressure to achieve quick results.

Enabling Environment—2			
Bottleneck domain	Bottleneck	Recommendations	
Bottleneck domain #2	Legal framework Consistency across laws Compliance with the law	 R10 Enabling environment (Legal and Policy Framework) A decree is proposed to: Extend the current timeframe for death declaration; Introduce a grace period for birth- and death registration; Introduce carbonless registers and notification books; Introduce a new notification form that includes internationally recommended entries for vital statistics. Extend the tasks of DNEC with the authority of approval of local civil registration computerization. Establish countrywide uniform fees for late birth- and death registration and the court procedure as well as exempt timely birth- and death registration offices to post the fees publicly and well visible to the public; Introduce the duty of all registration offices to report their production data on a regular (e.g. weekly) basis Establish the legal obligation of health staff and institutions to notify <u>all</u> births and deaths; Amend the contents of the jugement supplétif so that all information for civil registration records and vital statistics is included. 	
Bottleneck domain #3	Political situation Inclusive service delivery (Culture, Population groups)	 R12 Enabling environment (Political stability, Culture) Political stability R12.1 The registers that have been destroyed in the past decade, especially in 2007, need to be reconstituted. R12.2 A study may be done of reconstitution of records in other countries such as Côte d'Ivoire before embarking on the reconstitution project. R12.3 The services of the UNV program could be considered to manage the reconstitution process. R12.4 In order for the reconstitution to be permanent the reconstituted registers could be digitized and an electronic backup can be kept in a safe location. Culture R12.5 The proposed process to develop evidence-based law needs to lead to culturally sensitive evidence-based lawmaking. For example, when name-giving traditions can consume considerable time the law needs to accommodate such traditions. R12.6 Similarly, language and illiteracy can be important barriers to the use of civil registration services, and the service needs to respond adequately to overcome these barriers. 	

Enabling Environment—3		
Bottleneck domain	Bottleneck	Recommendations
Bottleneck domain #3	Political situation Inclusive service delivery (Culture, Population groups)	R13 Awareness Duty bearers R13.1 The "shoestring" budget for civil registration is the single-most important reason why a change of mind of politicians is urgently needed. There is a pressing need to raise awareness among policymakers of the importance of the civil registration sector as the foundation for all other identity systems and the most- preferred and affordable source for vital statistics. See also R12.2.
Bottleneck domain #6	Awareness of duty bearers Awareness of donors and NGOs	Donors and NGOs R13.2 While donors, UN organizations and NGOs already are moving towards better coordination there is still some way to go. There is also room for learning and exchange of experience within this community. The establishment of a coordination forum that would meet on a regular (e.g. quarterly) basis could be considered.

Supply—1		
Bottleneck domain #4	Services not reaching the rural poor	 R8. Supply (Organization) R8.1 In order to reach the poor, rural communities with civil registration services new ways of working need to be introduced. This first and foremost will have to be through a much-enhanced role of the health sector for the notification of vital events. It is proposed that health workers and health institutes will notify all births and deaths and will be equipped to do so. R8.2 Health workers and health institutes can be equipped with mobile phones with an application for the notification of births and deaths, as well as with newly designed carbonless paper notification books. R8.4 Since vaccination reaches about 90% of children, vaccination is indicated as the prime opportunity to either notify birth or monitor whether registration has happened. It is proposed that the mother and child booklet will include a page to monitor birth registration. R8.5 Or the mobile phone will be introduced for vaccination recording and –alerts combined with a birth registration monitoring application. R8.6 Selected civil registration offices will have to be equipped to perform mobile registration tasks on a continuous basis. R8.7 A mapping study could be carried out to determine the optimal location and a typology of offices.

Supply—2		
Bottleneck domain	Bottleneck	Recommendations
Bottleneck domain #5	Training Monitoring, audit Computeriz ation Vital statistics Supply chain	 R4. Supply (Organization) R4.1 DNEC needs to have an HR- and training department, professional training resources and a multiyear training program. R4.2 In the interim DNEC may use the Plan-developed manual containing all relevant civil registration law, which could be reprinted if needed.
		R5 . Supply (Organization) DNEC needs to have an audit department and an audit program and audit ratings. It is proposed that MATD adopts the RapidSMS monitoring tool for the production of registration offices as used in Nigeria.
		 R7. Supply (Organization) R7.1 The paper- and pencil system now used for civil registration is prone to a multitude of problems (cost, communication) such as content error, sharing, archiving and retrieval. Guinea needs to move towards a gradual computerization of its civil registration and identification system. R7.2 DNEC's tasks need to include oversight of local computerization. R7.3 In the interim, carbonless paper registration books can replace the registration books now having four parallel "volets". It is proposed that some essential supply chains will be monitored by SMS, e.g. the sending of the volets/copies for the statistics office, the sending of the notification copy to registration offices and the sending of supplies from DNEC to registration offices.
		 R8. Supply (Organization) R8.1 In order to reach the poor, rural communities with civil registration services new ways of working need to be introduced. This first and foremost will have to be through a much-enhanced role of the health sector for the notification of vital events. It is proposed that health workers and health institutes will notify all births and deaths and equipped to do so. R8.2 Health workers and health institutes can use mobile phones with an application for the notification of births and deaths, as well as with newly designed carbonless paper notification books. R8.3 The notification form contents could be adjusted to serve vital statistics purposes better than currently. R8.4 Since vaccination reaches about 90% of children, vaccination is indicated as the prime opportunity to either notify birth or monitor whether registration has happened.

Supply—3		
Bottleneck domain	Bottleneck	Recommendations
Bottleneck domain #5	Interdepartmental collaboration ("Interoperability") between 1) Civil registration and health 2) Civil registration identification (national ID, electoral registration) 3) Civil registration and justice	 R8.5 The mobile phone will be introduced for vaccination recording and –alerts combined with a birth registration monitoring application. R9. Supply (Organization—Interoperability) R9.1 In order that the intensive role of the health sector for birth- and death notification will be performed optimally it is required that MATD and MSHP forge close collaboration through a Memorandum of Understanding. R9.2 MATD and MSHP also should conduct regular meetings at directors' level. R9.3 For the interoperability between identity systems, the work of the proposed High-Level Committee (R12) and the new policy it may develop (R11) may result in an organizational integration of civil regular meetings at directoral register or to close collaboration with CENI. MATD will need to have regular meetings at directors' level integration and identification (national ID) and the electoral register or to close collaboration with CENI. MATD will need to have regular meetings at directors' level integration and integration takes place or not.

Demand—1		
Bottleneck domain #6	Incentives, disincentives Direct- and indirect costs Awareness of the general public	R11 Demand (Incentives and disincentives) Disincentives In order to address the main reasons for non- registration—distance and costs—measures are proposed to reduce or eliminate fees (see R10) and improve the outreach of civil registration service through enhanced interoperability with the health sector (see R9.1) and new ways of working of registrars in selected offices (especially in rural areas—see R8.6) as well as a review and possible reorganization of the current office network (see R8.7). A grace period for the registration of vital events (see R10) will also reduce the need for the court procedure. Incentives R11.1 It is proposed that the World Bank-funded "filets sociaux" project will include as program element a deliberate collaboration with MATD to provide beneficiaries with a legal identity.

	Demand—2		
Bottleneck domain	Bottleneck	Recommendations	
Bottleneck domain #6	Incentives, disincentives Direct- and indirect costs Awareness o the general public	 Incentives R11.2 Mobile phone penetration is quickly moving to 100% and more in the most remote villages. Since the issuance of SIM-cards requires an ID the strong demand for mobile phones raises awareness regarding the utility of identity documents. The government could use the ID-requirement for SIM-card issuance for raising awareness for the importance of the possession of identity documents. R11.3 The government could use the mobile phone network for public service messages (e.g. security and public health messaging, or reminders for vaccination etc.). R11.4 Entry in the school system is for almost all children the first time their birth certificate is required. The education sector therefore has an important role in verifying whether children are registered and initiating corrective action when needed. It is important that MATD/DNEC works with the education sector to institutionalize in a joint program the verification role of Education. R11.5 It is also desirable that the school curriculum includes material on human- and child rights, and the right of children to be registered. The general public R13.3 When the service is in place and within affordable distance of the public the government can raise awareness about civil registration, e.g. by using new media such as public messaging through mobile phone, radio and TV. This will include the information of the general public of any change in the service or the regulations and fees. R13.4 It is important that registration offices and registrars do their part in raising awareness, e.g. by information posted in the registration offices. 	

Quality of Services		
Bottleneck domain #7	Feedback general public	R6. Quality of services DNEC may consider using social media to obtain customer feedback on how registration offices perform and adopt the "U-report" message service as introduced in Uganda.

1. SITUATION ANALYSIS

1.1 VITAL SIGNS OF CIVIL REGISTRATION

REGISTRATION COVERAGE AND QUALITY

Countries are requested to submit their civil registration data to the United Nations Statistics Division, a branch of the UN Economic and Social Council, based in New York. Their data is published by UNSD on a regular basis.¹ The most recent data for Guinea is for 1994, and the only official (=government data) then given was for birth registration: **"less than 90%"**.² Just released data for 2012 shows that the birth registration rate in Guinea is **57.9%**.³ This registration rate is for children between 0 and 59 months old (between 0 and 5 years). It is important to realize that definitions of registration rates in the "official" data and the definitions of birth registration rates given in the Demographic and Health Survey (DHS) or the Multi-Indicator Cluster Survey (MICS) are different: see the box below.⁴

How birth registration	data is calculated
------------------------	--------------------

DHS & MICS rates

The "official" rate

The proportion of sampled children aged 0- 59 months whose birth is registered.	The proportion of live births that are registered within the legal timeframe during a year. This may include late or delayed registration of live births. (This rate is closer to a measure of the registration rate of children of the 0-11 months old in DHS and MICS data).
--	---

Source: Civil Registration Centre for Development (2013), p. 24

The implication of the two different ways of measuring birth registration rates is that the DHS- or MICS birth registration rate will as a rule include more late and delayed registration, and therefore be different from (higher than) the

¹ For the data access link: <u>http://unstats.un.org/unsd/demographic/CRVS/CR_coverage.htm</u>. These data has been last updated per August 2012. The delay between publication data and the period for which the data applies is 12 ½ years. Survey data on birth registration from either the UNICEF-supported Multi-Indicator Cluster Survey (MICS) or the USAID (and often UNICEF—) supported Demographic and Health surveys are published with a much shorter time lag, although these surveys are conducted only every 4-5 years while new official data in principle should be available on an annual basis.

² The source quoted is IIVRS, the International Institute for Vital Registration and Statistics. This institute no longer exists.

³ This data has not been published yet and has been obtained from Institut National de la Statistique, prior to its publication.

⁴ UNSD data on completeness are either obtained from countries (self-assessment) or from international agencies. For country self-assessment the data depends on the methodology used by the country. Countries are essentially free to choose their own definition; the "official" definition shown in the box is the one most commonly used. When in a country there is delayed registration also at age five or older the official rate will likely be higher than the DHS- or MICS rate in which late and delayed registration up to the age of 5 is included. The problem with the freedom of choice of definitions is that official rates are less suitable to compare internationally than the DHS- and MICS rates that are uniformly defined wherever they are used.

official rate. For the definition of "late registration" and "delayed registration" see the text box hereunder.

Prescribed period for registration, late and delayed registration

The period allowed between the occurrence and the obligatory registration of a vital event ("the **prescribed period** by law") **should be as short as possible**. For the reporting of deaths, public health considerations require immediate registration. For extenuating circumstances UNSD recommends that a grace period of up to one year may be allowed for birth registration. Registration after the prescribed period but within the grace period is called *late registration*. During the grace period the registration will still be within the authority of the registrar. Registration after expiry of the grace period is called *delayed registration*. Generally, delayed registration will require a judicial procedure and an age assessment by a physician.⁵

Source: Civil Registration Centre for Development (2013), p. 18

Guinea's birth registration rate of 57.9% (DHS, 2012) is high by international standards. With its income (GNI) per capita of USD 460 in 2012 one would have expected a much lower rate. The table below shows that Guinea's peer group of countries (low income countries with a GNI pc of USD 1,005 or less) has an average birth registration rate of only 32%. In other words: Guinea has a birth registration rate almost twice the expected rate.

Birth Registration Rate Averages by Country Income Groups				
Income Group ¹⁾	Number of Countries	Population Total (Millions)	Weighed Average Birth Registration Rate ²⁾	Standard Deviation as Percentage of Birth Registration Rate
Low income countries GNI pc USD1,005 or less	30 3)	695	32%	78%
Lower middle income countries GNI pc USD1,006—USD 3,975	4 5 ⁴⁾	2,408	49 %	45%
Upper middle income countries GNI pc USD 3,976—USD 12,275	27 5)	703	94%	5%
Total	102	3,806	51%	40%

Source: Cf. Civil Registration Centre for Development (2013), p. 27

More precise still, it is possible to state what the expected birth registration rate is for Guinea given its exact income per capita in 2012. See the graph on the next page. The curve shown in the graph is based on the latest birth registration rates of the 102 countries also being the basis for the table above.⁶ The formula of the curve gives an expected registration rate of 31.5%.

The first piece of information, thus, when compared internationally, is positive.

⁵ Cf. United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Statistical Office (1955), p. 88, United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Statistics Division (1998-5), p. 61 and United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Statistics Division (2000), p. 57.

⁶ The formula for the "polynomial" that fits the data is BRR= -(1.08E-6) x (GNI pc)² + (1.74E-02) x (GNI pc) + 23.7, in which BRR is the "normative" birth registration rate.



Source: Civil Registration Centre for Development (2013), p. 38

However, "**coverage error**" (the difference between the actual registration rate and 100% registration) is not the only indicator of the quality of birth registration. A second important aspect is the degree of "**content error**", viz. the degree of accuracy of the content of a birth record. In Guinea the civil registration offices still use paper registers. The registration books have four "volets"—each page of the register consisting of four parts in which, by hand, the data for a birth, death or marriage need to be filled out, *four times*. That alone is already a source of possible errors over which little or no quality control is possible.⁷

A third important quality aspect is that civil records ought to be **permanent records**—at least they need to be by international convention. In section 1.2 on the organization of the civil registration service will be shown that there are serious breaches of this requirement of permanence. Here it suffices to state that when records are NOT permanent, citizens may find themselves unable to obtain a copy conform of their birth record when they have lost their original birth certificate. Guinea's 2012 data for birth registration shows that, although 57.9% of children from 0-5 years old are registered, only 41.5% have their birth certificate.⁸ More than one out of four registered children do not have their birth certificate, and obtaining a copy is an onerous and costly procedure. See the chart on the page 15. This is almost double the world average of 1 in 7 children who lack proof of their registration.⁹

⁷ In a sample of transcribed jugements supplétifs at the Kindia registration office (n=178) 1 in 6 were missing essential information rendering the transcription of doubtful legal value. One person appeared to have been born on the 30th of February. Another person for whom a jugement supplétif was transcribed was filled out as having been born in 1914, not impossible but very unlikely.
⁸ Cf. note 3.

⁹ Cf. UNICEF (2013-3), p. 18.

FOUR "VOLETS" TO FILL OUT FOR BIRTH REGISTRATION



There is a fourth "quality aspect" of registration: the degree in which births are registered late or delayed (the definitions of "late" and "delayed" were explained above). Guinea does in fact not accommodate late registration, as it has chosen to not have a "grace period" during which registration is still possible-although done after the legal timeframe-without going to court, i.e. by a procedure which is still within the authority of the civil registrar. Guinea's Code Civil (article 192) stipulates: "Les déclarations de naissance seront faites dans les quinze jours de l'accouchement, à l'Officier de l'état civil du lieu. Toutefois, pour les naissances survenues hors du périmètre communal et en pays étranger, ce délai est porté à trente jours." In 2008, with the passing of the Code de l'Enfant (cf. article 157), the legal timeframe was extended from 15 and 30 days respectively to 6 and 8 months. More will be said about this lack of a grace period and the use of two different timeframes in section 1.2; suffices to say that both aspects of civil registration law actually do NOT constitute good practice, and the extension of the timeframe may be a "borderline case" of intending to do good while not be aware of and not heeding international technical standards.¹⁰

MISSING BIRTH CERTIFICATES, 2012

¹⁰ United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Statistics Division (2001), p. 60: "It is preferable that uniform procedures and time periods be applied throughout the country and the maximum period allowed between the occurrence and the obligatory registration of a vital event should be as short as possible to facilitate current and accurate registration. A grace period of up to one year after the event has occurred may be allowed for extenuating circumstances."



Source: Data table for 2012 provided by Institut National de la Statistique

DHS- and MICS surveys generally provide a breakdown into age sub-groups and so does the 2012 Guinea survey: birth registration rates are given for the sub-groups of 0-24 months (58.1%) and 24-59 months (57.8%). These rates are not significantly different. When older children show a higher birth registration rate the cause of that difference is likely delayed registration, for example because older children enter (pre-) school and require a birth certificate for that. In the case of Guinea it is important to note that (see the next sub-section) over the 2005-2012 period the birth registration rate has improved noticeably-from 43.2% to 57.9%. The 24-59 months old children have been born in a period (2008-2010) when birth registration rates were improving but still were lower than the 57.9% on 2012. I.e., the 57.8% measured for children 34-59 months old is a mix of children who were registered within the legal timeframe and children who have gone through a delayed registration period and obtained a jugement supplétif. But no good data is available on the percentage of children registered within the legal timeframe or thereafter, although as many as 4 out of 5 births not registered by age 5 may never be registered.¹¹¹²

Civil registration offices do not just register births, although that is the lion's share for civil registrars in developing countries. In Guinea the crude birth rate is 38 births annually per 1,000 of the population while the crude death rate is only 12 deaths per 1,000 of the population. I.e., when all births and deaths were registered the number of births registered would outnumber the number

¹¹ It is not clear why survey questions are not designed in such a way that it would be possible to assess to what extent such an important legal requirement is met (also for international law: article 7 of the CRC requires registration immediately after birth) the non-compliance with which has serious consequences as birth registration becomes almost always notoriously onerous when outside of the prescribed legal timeframe and grace period.

¹² In Kindia the birth registrations that were transcribed a verso in 2013 (until mid September) were inspected. The result is shown in Annex 3.

of deaths registered with a factor 38/12, or more than 3 to 1. This then is compounded by the fact that the birth <u>registration</u> rate (57.9%) is much higher than the death <u>registration</u> rate. No death registration rate is known for Guinea.¹³

Estimating the death registration rate in Guinea

CRC4D took two samples, one in the Matoto office of Conakry, and another in the registration office of the Kindia prefecture. In the Matoto office the statistics for 2012 showed 6,069 births registered versus 3,117 marriages and 136 deaths. In the Kindia office, for the period January through August 2013 4,202 birth were registered versus 462 marriages and 79 deaths. Interestingly the ratio between number of births registered versus number of deaths registered in Matoto and Kindia does not differ by much: 136/6,069= 2.2/100 for Matoto versus 79/4,202= 1.9/100 for Kindia. From these two samples can be deduced that **the death registration rate for Guinea may be between 3.4% (Kindia) and 6% (Matoto), or could even be below the Kindia rate**.¹⁴

One significant cause of low death registration might be that the prescribed legal timeframe for death registration is just three days. Other reasons why death registration rates are so low may lie in avoidance of cost (burial permit, burial in an approved burial ground at a fee) and fear of taxes. The few deaths that are registered may be registered as a death certificate may be required to avail of (part of) an inheritance or an insurance payment. Also, reportedly, churches may require civil registration of death before burial. The practice of same-day burial for those of the Muslim faith may be a factor. But for many obtaining a medical certificate, burial permit and a death certificate may just be too cumbersome or outright impossible.

Guinea has, for its income level, almost twice the birth registration rate expected—57.9% (2012) vs. 31.2%, but a high number of 1 in 4 of registered children do not have a birth certificate. Delayed registration (half a year or longer after the occurrence of the event) may never happen in 4 out of 5 cases. There are serious concerns as well about the present quality of registration, about content error (lack of controls) and about the care given to archiving of records for permanent preservation.

Death registration rates in Guinea are very low, probably below 6%.

BIRTH REGISTRATION COVERAGE DEVELOPMENT OVER TIME

(ey Message

¹³ The 1994 report to UNSD/IIVRS did not include an estimate of the death registration rate.

¹⁴ The birth registration rates (2012) for Matoto (part of Conakry) and Kindia differ 86.4% for Matoto versus 56.2% for Kindia. As Kindia may also be relatively urban and death registration in rural areas will be lower than in urban areas the country death registration rate may be closer to the Kindia rate than to the Matoto rate. With 65% of the population being classified as rural the death registration rate could even be below the Kindia rate. This was confirmed by data later obtained in a field survey of Kankan and N'zérékoré. In 2012 the latter prefecture registered only 93 deaths versus 6,699 births, i.e. the ratio here was only 1.4 in 100, and the death registration rate would be less than 3% here. Cf. MATD (2013)—p.5.

Data on the development of civil registration in Guinea is only available for a short period of time, viz. from 1999 (published in the UNICEF State of the World's Children publication of 2005 and for 2005 when the DHS (in French: "Enquête Démographique et de la Santé", or "EDS") survey for the first time included a question on birth registration.¹⁵ But civil registration has a longer history in Guinea than that data would suggest. The first civil registration in Guinea may have been introduced by the French, for whom it had been introduced in Saint Louis in Senegal already in 1674 by the Directeur de la Compagnie du Sénégal.¹⁶ The service was limited to those of French origin, their offspring and for the indigenous population if converted to Christianity. Later, Dakar replaced Saint Louis as the capital city of Senegal and became the seat of the French governor who also was governing Guinea. In those days civil registration was the task of the (Catholic) church. In France, the law of 30 November 1792 gave the role to the commune governments and the courts. Only in 1874 the decree of 30th January opened civil registration to the Senegalese population of Muslim faith (Muselmans). Demographic data collection has a long history among the people of the Muslim faith (the 2nd Rashidun Caliph Umar ordered a population census during his reign of 634— 644AD) and among Christians (England, the so-called Domesday book, 1086AD). Interestinaly, many countries in Northern Africa and the Middle East that were once part of the (Muslim) Ottoman Empire have complete registration. A common thread is that censuses and civil registration were in those past days conducted for the purpose of tax collection and military draft. In the Christian churches the registration of baptisms, marriages and deaths also served the purpose of income for the church and clergy. In independent Guinea the first law was passed in 1959, immediately after gaining independence from France in 1958, but the legal framework is still very much based on the French code civil of 1792 (see section 1.3). There may have been almost three centuries of civil registration history in Guinea, but no data is available on what part of the Guinean population was registered and what part was not until the estimate of 1994 (<90%) reported to UNSD New York and the data published by UNICEF for the 1999-2013 period. The registers from before independence in 1958 were brought to France and are kept there.¹⁷

The development of the birth registration rate is shown below in the chart. From 67% registration in 1999 the rate dropped to 43.2% in 2005 but then recovered to 57.9% in 2012. I.e., in 2012 the registration rate achieved thirteen years earlier was still not re-established. Political instability may have caused the drop in rates in the first half of the 2000s and an improved political environment may have caused the recovery in the latter part of the second half (in 2007 there was a popular uprising during which many registers were destroyed). In the former period the 20-year rule of president Lansana Conté was in decline. In 2008 the passing of the Child Act is an indication of

¹⁵ The data from 1999—if they are that—are from entries in UNICEF, The State of the World's Children 2005, New York 2005, p. 138. UNSD has published an earlier "official" estimate of less than 90% registration of births for 1994, but none at a later date so that no development over time can be gleaned from UNSD data.

 ¹⁶ Cf. http: www.wadekeubi.com/actualites/divers/174-le-systeme-senegalais-detat-civil-.html?showall=1
 ¹⁷ Guinea's separation from France was probably the least amicable (and earliest) among former French colonies. Among leaders of these countries Guinea's first president Sékou Touré was the least supportive to president De Gaulle's proposals to form a French "commonwealth". The withdrawal of the French administration was rather wholesale.

attention for children's issues and rights by that time—a recovery from 2007 and there is evidence that UNICEF and Plan were actively promoting the improvement of birth registration rates from the mid 2000s.



Source: Data provided by INS (for 2012); Njoka, John M. (2009), p. 47; UNICEF (2005); UNICEF (2009)

Guinea belongs to a group of fifteen countries in Sub-Saharan Africa with a French colonial past and a French provenance civil registration system. Two other countries among these, the Central African Republic and Côte d'Ivoire show a similar pattern as Guinea, i.e. a birth registration rate declining first and then recovering during the 2000s although not enough to compensate for the decline. Cameroon, Chad and Niger show declines over the 2000s. Gabon, Mauritania and Togo show stagnating birth registration rates although for Gabon at the high level of 89-90% (Mauritania at 56-59%). There are six countries within this group of fifteen that show substantial improvement: Benin, Burkina Faso, Congo Brazzaville, Madagascar, Mali and Senegal. In summary: Guinea belongs to a group of fifteen countries with a French past among which the odds are 2 in 5 for a sustained improvement over a longer period of time. The same odds apply for a sustained decline, while 1 in 5 countries do not show a significant change. Over the same period birth registration rates improved in the whole of Sub-Saharan Africa (from 42% to 49%) and among Guinea's peer group, the least developed countries (from 32% to 43%).¹⁸

Guinea has, over the 2000s, shown a decline first but thereafter a recovery of its birth registration rate—though not yet to the level of 1999. What gives pause is that Guinea is among a group of 15 countries with a French past for which the odds of improving registration rates are just 2 in 5. This may indicate barriers for improvement in the French provenance of the registration system.

VARIANCE IN BIRTH REGISTRATION COVERAGE

¹⁸ Cf. UNICEF (2013-3), p. 31

Registration rates vary across population groups. The urban population generally tends to have better registration rates than the rural population, and this is also the case in Guinea:



URBAN VERSUS RURAL REGISTRATION RATES, 2012

The disparity between urban and rural rates is of about the same magnitude as in the peer group (factor 1.6—1.7), but in Guinea both the urban and the rural rates are at a higher level. The urban population generally has more reason to be registered as a condition sine qua non to participate in urban life, for financial transactions, employment, access to services including schools, travel etc. the obstacles for registration will also be less as there will be relative proximity of registration offices, educated civil registrars etc.

Variance is also found among the regions in Guinea. The chart below shows the differentials in 2012. This graph above shows the regions ranked from highest for percentage of children 0-59 months old having been registered (86.4%, Conakry) to lowest (38.3%, Labe). The target area for the European Union grant for UNICEF (N'Zerekore) does in fact score a relatively high birth registration rate. Note that Kindia, where a field visit was conducted of which observations are used in this report, is an average performer (56.2% versus 57.9% in the country).²⁰

Before was already said that a worrisome proportion of registered children do not have a birth certificate. With the civil registration system Guinea has, obtaining a copy conform of the birth certificate is not at all straightforward. **REGIONAL DIFFERENTIALS IN BIRTH REGISTRATION RATES, 2012**

Source: Data provided by INS; UNICEF (2013)¹⁹

¹⁹ In a more recent source—UNICEF (2013-3)—the urban rate for least developed countries is 54% and the rural rate 34%.

²⁰ Field observations are consistently showing lower birth registration rates than the MICS/DHS survey data show. In MATD (2013) the rate found for 2012 in the N'zérékoré prefecture is only 37%, while the rate found for Kankan prefecture is only 21%. See also notes 23, 24 and 30 and the text box on page 24.



Source: Data provided by INS.

Registered children without a birth certificate can hardly be seen as being in a better position than children who never were registered. What is making things worse is that in some regions the proportion of registered children without a birth certificate is very substantial, e.g. in Kankan, Faranah and Kindia. This is a countrywide problem, but in some regions it is more serious than in others. It is warranted to study in depth why in Labe and Mamou these problems are relatively small, while in other regions they are large.



REGIONAL DIFFERENTIALS IN BIRTH REGISTRATION RATES AND POSSESSION OF CERTIFICATES, 2012. A RURAL PROBLEM

Source: Data provided by INS.

A similar variance as between urban and rural registration rates is found in the registration rates among the poorest 20% and richest 20% ("quintiles") of the population—see the diagram on the next page. While the Guinea data is from 2005 (these data are only available for 2005 for Guinea) and the peer group data is from the latest surveys available in 2013, the comparison indicates that there is a much larger disparity in registration rates between rich and poor in Guinea than in the peer group of least developed countries—a factor 1:4 versus a factor 1:2.1, or a disparity almost twice as large.²¹ This is an indication that the registration service in Guinea may disproportionally serve the rich segments of the population better than the poorest citizens, and this may be linked to costs of registration. Birth registration is not free of charge. Local government can charge fees for civil registration services and there is evidence that steep illegal fees may be charged "under the table" (see section 1.2). Poverty can also play an indirect role, especially for the rural poor, when the registration requires also indirect costs: travel, transport cost, accommodation cost and loss of income or loss of production. For the poor, short-term pain for long-term gain may just be an impossible trade-off. The marginal value of a Guinean Franc for a rich person is a lot less than it is for a poor person. Hence the "real" hurdle for the poor to overcome the costs is many times higher than it is for the rich.



REGISTRATION RATES FOR THE RICHEST VERSUS THE POOREST 20% OF CITIZENS, 2005 (GUINEA) AND 2013 (LDC)

None of the available data sets for Guinea for 1999, 2005 and 2012 includes a breakdown by educational level for the mother. Data for other countries shows that the higher the educational level of the mother, the higher the

Source: UNICEF (2009), UNICEF (2013-1)

²¹ The more recent source, UNICEF (2013-3)—p. 43, shows that the ratio has dropped to 1:2 in the least developed countries (28% versus 55%).

registration rates for children. Differences in registration rates by gender are insignificant.²²

Guinea has the urban-rural birth registration differentials that one would expect, although at a higher level than is the case for the peer group of LDCs. The regional differences are large too, but what is most worrying is that "the problem of the missing birth certificates" in some regions especially the rural ones—is significant. Being registered but not having a birth certificate is almost equivalent to not being registered at all. This needs study and attention.²³ For the rich-poor divide the disparity is stark in the international context. This may be an indication that costs of birth registration, direct and indirect, legal and illegal, are an important disincentive for the poorest citizens of Guinea to register their offspring. The delivery of birth registration services appears to be a serious issue of inequity.

The magnitude of non-registration and the lack of a birth certification among children and youth in 2014 has been estimated and is shown in annex 4. The total number of unregistered children under-5 is estimated at **821,000** (2014) and the total number without birth certificate at **1,141,000**. For the under-18 the country estimates are **2,489,000** unregistered and **3,459,000** without birth certificate.

²² It was for that reason surprising to see a male bias in birth registration in Kindia as well as in Matoto, Conakry. In N'zérékoré however a normal gender ratio was found (boys registered in 2012: 3,483 vs. 3,216 girls, or 1.08 : 1, which is close to the universal gender ratio at birth of 1.05 : 1. Cf. MATD (2013), p.5.

²³ It is thought that the mothers interviewed for the surveys may confuse a birth registration certificate with a certificate of birth issued by a hospital, and that shame may lead mothers to state that children are registered when they are not. In our analysis it has become clear that the possibility that the MICS/DHS survey data is overstating registration rates and the possession of birth certificates is real, and generally data from any source has a significant "error margin".

1.2 ORGANIZATIONAL REVIEW

INTERNAL ORGANIZATION

In the previous section was mentioned that Guinea's civil registration is an inheritance of colonial times, perhaps going back as early as 1674 directed from Saint Louis, the then capital of Senegal. Guinea became independent on the 2nd of October of 1958 and made a first change to its system by an ordonnance of 15 April 1959, which conferred the role of civil registrar (Officier de l'Etat Civil) to mayors and authorities in a similar role (chef de circonscription, chef de poste, president des conseils de village). The irony is that Guinea's first act to "indigenize" its civil registration law and organization so much resonates what happened in France in 1792. France's constitution of September 3, 1791, following the French revolution, stated: "the legislative authority will establish for all inhabitants, without distinction, the manner in which births, marriages, and deaths will be certified; and it will designate the public officials who will receive and maintain these files" (Tit. II, art. 7). In France, by the end of the 18th century, the municipality was considered the natural site for the exercise of "citizenship" (although that was a term not commonly used at the time), and it was for that reason that the municipality should be the place where the individual attained his civil status. However, there were many who were highly critical on the arounds that the elected rural authorities were incompetent. An inquiry into the state of the registers ordered by the ministry of Justice in 1820 showed that "there was nowhere that the registers were being correctly maintained", and "for these thirty years it was the gulf between town and country that represented the first and major obstacle to the [civil registration] law's effective operation.²⁴

Was—and is—a French civil registration system based on a by origin French legal framework suitable for Guinea? Here are some quotes in this respect:

"During the colonial period European administrators created state institutions designed to manipulate religious and ethnic diversity to their advantage. They handed minorities greater representation in colonial security forces and governments in order to give these minorities an intense stake in the colonial regime".²⁵

"The French and the Portuguese [..] also sought to categorize Africans into distinct ethnic groups, and various official documents they used, ranging from birth records to identity cards, specified ethnic membership."²⁶

However, while European law may live on in African legal frameworks, African people have a choice to respect or ignore that law:

²⁴ Cf. Noiriel, Gérard (2001), pp. 28-33. There was evidently in the French Constitution of 1791 a logical connection between article 7 that led to the civil registration decree of September 20, 1792 which designated municipal authorities as responsible for civil registration and the articles that defined the criteria of residence, parentage, age, status, etc. that had to be fulfilled to qualify as a French citizen (Tit. II, art. 2) and as a *full* citizen (citoyen actif) (Tit. III, Ch. 1, section II).

²⁵ Cf. Nasr, Vali (2013), p. 154. Nasr mentions Syria and its Alawites minority ruling as an example.

²⁶ Cf. Longman, Timothy (2001), p. 350.

"One notes an important shift here towards the inclusion of modern Western style laws as African laws and concomitant neglect of traditional African laws and cultures [..]. However, the living reality of African laws suggests that traditional law lives on today and that by merely studying modern laws as copies of Western Laws one misses critical cultural dimensions." ²⁷

Civil registration in action in Matoto and Kindia

In 2012 the commune of Matoto—one of the five communes of Congkry and the largest commune in terms of population (680,000) in Guinea-registered 6,069 births, 3,117 marriages and 136 deaths. This is an improvement over the production in 2008: births 3,595, marriages 2,086 and deaths 187.28 In the period January through August 2013 the commune of Kindia (population 550,000) registered 4,202 births, 462 marriages and 79 deaths. The difference between the two offices is stark, as in Matoto there were reported to be 32 staff (of which about 10 are seconded by MATD), while in Kindia commune there were only 3 (of whom one for archiving). In Matoto the reported fee for birth registration is GNF 3,000 (GNF 7,000 per USD), for marriage GNF 150,000 and for death registration GNF 5,000. In Kindia only for marriage registration there is a fee (GNF 50,000), which is waived when people cannot afford to pay. The numbers for Matoto seem quite low. For a population of 680,000 the number of births is about 26,000 annually. Because urban birth rates could be less than the country's 3.8% this number could be somewhat on the high side. But DHS (EDS) data for 2012 shows that Conakry has a birth registration rate of 86.4%. Matoto's registered births would be expected to be about 22,000, not just 6,000. It appears that the Matoto office is-to a serious extent-underreporting the number of births registered there. The birth registration rate would be only 27%. In Kindia the birth registration number is more credible though still low; for the administrative region of Kindia the birth registration rate in 2012 was 56.2% and therefore the birth registration number expected would be almost twice the 6,000 annually. For both offices the statistics do not reconcile with the DHS data. But clearly, staff productivity in the Kindia office is about five times as high as in Matoto. In registration offices either production is systematically underreported, or the DHS surveys get it wrong all the time, or both are true.29

As if tossing around a hot potato, the role of civil registrars was moved from the by the legal text of 1959 designated authorities to the Sous-Préfets in 1984, then in 1990 by two other ordonnances to mayors and presidents of the rural development committees (Communautés Rurales de Développement, CRDs), and subsequently in 2006 to the heads of "Collectivés urbaines et rurales." The decentralization of government introduced in Guinea from 1990 has only strengthened the grip of local government on the civil registration function, and as a result local governments can establish and charge fees for

²⁷ Menski, W. (2006), p. 492, quoted in Wata, Aimée (2013), p. 240.

²⁸ 2008 data is from a project proposal, cf. République de Guinée, Ministère du Plan et de la Cooperation Internationale, Institut Nationale de la Statistique (2010), p. 3.

²⁹ In 2001 the Association Internationale des Maires Francophone (AIMF) stated that birth registration in Conakry was only 1 in 10, and death registration was less than 2%. Cf. Panapress (2001). Link to this info (as of October 2013): http://www.panapress.com/Les-donnees-sur-l-etat-civil-de-Conakry-bientotinformatisees --13-611902-18-lang2-index.html

civil registration as a (important) source of local government revenue. Still, MATD also pays for civil registration staff seconded to the municipalities.

In the meantime MATD, the Ministère de l'Administration Territoriale et de la Décentralisation, had only a few people³⁰ in charge of civil registration at the central level before the Direction National de l'Etat Civil (DNEC) was created in 2011. DNEC carries out the civil registration functions of the ministry: 1) supplies management, recruitment (of staff paid for by MATD including those seconded to civil registration offices) and training, 3) technical and administrative control of the civil registration system (which implies somewhat of a duplication with the Justice ministry's "judiciary" control role), 4) the forwarding of civil registration documentation to designated authorities (e.g. INS), 5) awareness raising, and 6) the creation of new civil registration offices. DNEC is constrained by a lack of resources.³¹ The Committee on the Rights of the Child has stated in its 2013 Concluding observations that DNEC is not adequately equipped to fulfill its mandate (see pt. 3 below). While this is correct, the larger problem is DNEC's mandate and what it does not include, versus the mandates of other authorities and the ambiguous delineation of mandates (see pt. 2 below). DNEC management mentions as the most important problems for civil registration in Guinea:

- 1. The ubiquity of counterfeit documents
- 2. Institutional problems: the lack of DNEC authority over civil registrars in the communes
- 3. The lack of equipment: computerization (there is none functioning in the civil registration service)³² and means of transportation

Regarding the 2nd bullet it was clearly stated that DNEC would want to move from a de-centralized civil registration service to a de-concentrated civil registration service.

³⁰ Only 2-3 in a section for civil registration, according to one informant, M. Bafodé Keita, Directeur National Adjoint of the Ministère des Affaires Sociales, de la Promotion Féminine et de l'Enfance, Direction nationale de l'Education Préscolaire et de la Protection de l'Enfance before the creation of the Direction Nationale de l'Etat Civil. The creation of central offices, e.g. BUNEC (Bureau National de l'Etat Civil) in Cameroon and CNEC (Centre National d'Etat Civil) in Senegal, is an answer to the insufficiency of national management in systems of French origin. This is an insufficiency that has not been observed just recently (see text box on centralization or decentralization).

³¹ Cf. United Nations. Committee on the Rights of the Child. Convention on the Rights of the Child (2013), p. 9

³² Reportedly AIMF gave support to computerization to municipalities in 2001/2002 (as their assistance is directly to municipalities and not through the ministry) and around 2008. Evidence has been observed in the Matoto and Kindia offices. In both offices the computers cannot be used because of electricity problems. The Kindia equipment is well kept until a solution is found. The software appears of a basic kind— enabling to print certificates. This investment would by now be complete write-off. In Cameroon and Côte d'Ivoire registration communes have gone ahead with computerization to great concern of national authorities that foresee a wild-growth of systems that will be impossible to integrate with one another.

Centralization or decentralization?

The creation of central offices, e.g. BUNEC (Bureau National de l'Etat Civil) in Cameroon and CNEC (Centre National d'Etat Civil) in Senegal, is an answer to the insufficiency of national management in systems of French origin. This is a problem that has not been observed just recently. In fact already 37 years ago, in 1976, in a meeting titled "Réforme de l'Etat Civil en Milieu Africain", organized in Lomé by the then existing Organization Commune Africain et Mauricienne (OCAM) one of the recommendations was the "Creation of national centers of civil registration".³³ In another meeting of Latin-American countries (the Second Inter-American Conference on Civil registration) held in Lima, Peru, as long ago as in 1964, the recommendation was: "There should be a centralized organization if possible, and, if not, at least a supervisory body to lay down standard rules and coordinate the work." In Latin America civil registration systems have in fact been centralized in many countries, and they have been integrated with electoral systems and national ID systems ("civil identification"). All but four Latin America countries have reached registration completeness (>90%).

One of the prime obstacles in countries with a French legacy civil registration system is the lack of central control, a problem which is as old as the secularisation of civil registration in France itself, dating from 1792. With it, the present national responsibility for civil registration is usually shared in an unclear way with local government, local registration offices and the courts under the tutelage of the ministry of Justice, but rarely with the Health ministry (although it is in Guinea to some extent). The Western decentralization ideology of the late 1960s and the 1970s has added outside pressure to reinforce the decentralized status of civil registration. Perversely this has led to a sacrifice of national good governance on the altar of local self-determination, and a laissez-faire environment for local civil registration offices.

Logistics and the office network

With regards to the 3rd bullet DNEC management believes there is a proximity problem that needs to be bridged by the opening of more offices, which over a long time has been seen as one of the bottlenecks in the system. In the box (see next page) the issue of the optimal office network is addressed. Instead of jumping to the conclusion that more offices will mean more registration it is necessary to do a mapping study.³⁴ In addition MATD needs to

³³ Cf. International Institute for Vital Registration and Statistics (1982), p. 13

³⁴ For an example see: République du Cameroun, Ministère de l'Administration du Territoire et de la Décentralisation, IFORD. Yaoundé (undated). However, this study completely ignored the necessity for civil registration offices to have a minimum size in terms of workload to be financially sustainable and competent in service delivery and came up with the recommendation of 4,000 more offices required, above the more than 2,000 already existing in a country twice the size of Guinea and a population of 25 million. The study also ignored to map the actual service areas of existing offices, including the distance between the residence of users and the office. In fact an earlier substantial addition of offices (some 1,800 added to 360 existing) had already shown a perverse result. Over the 2000s the birth registration rate of Cameroon has plummeted from 79% to 61%—while the country did not suffer from the political instability that plagued many other African countries, including Guinea, and that depressed civil registration.

take a hard look at current offices and what a "model office" would look like. The examples of Matoto and Kindia show how large the differences are in staff productivity (and in fees charged). Kindia shows that an urban commune can do without the fees from civil registration to run the business of the municipality.³⁵

The cruel law of the logistics of civil registration

It is important to address the issue of the claimed insufficiency of the number of offices. Guinea has a total of 348 civil registration offices, of which 6 are secondary offices. Given Guinea's land area of 245,717 km2 this means that, on average, each office has to serve a land area of 700 km2. With people assumed equally distributed over the country that would mean an average distance to bridge of close to 10 km which can be a lot and expensive in much of the country. But more offices means less work per office, and the small workload per office is already an issue. The annual total of births and deaths is 544,000. That is per office an average of 6.5 events per working day—if all were registered. The 2012 birth registration rate is 57.9% and the death registration rate is 6% at the most. That translates in **daily less than 3** births and deaths registered per office, on average, and many offices actually having less than that to do. Admittedly, marriage registration is not included among those events, and neither are transcriptions of jugements supplétifs or other rare vital events and registration tasks. Marriage registration would only marginally make a difference. While every additional office will make registration go up it will also cannibalize on already limited workload in existing offices. More offices means that the functioning of the average office deteriorates. This is the cruel law of civil registration: vital events are rare events, and small offices are poorly functioning offices. This is why civil registration needs to piggy back on the government infrastructure already existing, especially the infrastructure offered by the health sector, and/or change from sedentary offices to offices with mobile registrars.

Civil registration is not unique for the logistics challenge of reaching the people and the people reaching the service. Such challenges are common for the distribution of goods and services, and especially so in a country where both the government and the people are poor. There are two major ways of overcoming the logistics challenge in civil registration: 1) the use of new technology, especially the mobile phone, and 2) "interoperability".

The mobile phone has taken the countryside in Africa by storm.³⁶ This would not be the case if these phones would not be working most of the time, i.e. there is also a functioning network. Governments provide spectrum to mobile

³⁵ Kindia's mayor is the president of AIFM Guinea, and he is that for an obvious reason: Kindia commune governance is a true model of good practice, not just in civil registration.

³⁶ Cf. The World Bank and the African Development Bank (2012). "Africa is rapidly becoming an ICT leader. Innovations that began in Africa—like dual SIM card mobile phones, or using mobile phones for remittance payments—are now spreading across the continent and beyond," said Tim Kelly, lead ICT policy specialist at the World Bank and an author of the report, in a statement. "The challenge going forward is to ensure that ICT innovations benefit all Africans, including the poor and vulnerable, and those living in remote areas." Cf. also: <u>http://www.smartplanet.com/blog/bulletin/africa-has-more-mobile-phone-users-than-theus-or-eu/9053</u>.

phone providers: governments own the spectrum and license the use of it. Governments have a distribution network they can use for their own work. What is especially interesting too is that the mobile phone creates a demand—by young and old alike—for identity documents in the countryside probably not matched by anything else because governments require mobile phone providers to issue SIM cards only upon presentation of an ID.³⁷ Ownership of the mobile phone has cut across class and educational levels; the threshold to the adoption of the mobile phone has been very low in comparison to the computer.

The next subsection will address the interoperability solution—the second solution of the proximity—coming down to "piggy-backing" on the service delivery infrastructure of another (government) service, especially of the health sector. In this section on the internal organization of the civil registration function we still need to address the economics of civil registration and the state of the archiving of civil registration records.

The law of civil registration implies that unless a country and its people are rich, and/or a country's population density is high, the vital events occurring will not be numerous enough to justify a granular network of registration offices that can be financially sustained. For that reason, in countries such as Guinea, a transformation of the delivery of civil registration services is necessary through 1) using the infrastructure of other government services (that of health in particular), and/or 2) transforming the way civil registration takes place by digitization, and, especially, by mobile phone notification of vital events combined with the introduction of a mobile civil registration service.

Civil registration finance

For the economics of civil registration in Guinea two aspects deserve a closer look: 1) "civil registration finance", and 2) "delayed registration finance". With regards to the former the case of the Matoto office in Conakry may serve as an example (see next page).

³⁷ It is very common to see young people selling produce along the major high ways while holding a mobile phone. The matron of Guerissoriayo village in the Kindia prefecture stated that in the village "even the chickens have a phone."

Civil registration finance— the Matoto office

The Matoto main office has 32 staff-including unpaid interns, lowly paid cleaners etc.—of which 23 were shown on a staff list posted in the office.³⁸ The Chargé d'Etat Civil is seconded by MATD, and earns GNF 1,800,000 per month. MATD pays for 9 other staff. Commune staff are reportedly earning between GNF 150,000 and GNF 250,000. Assuming that the average pay of 10 MATD staff is GNF 500,000/month, of 12 commune staff GNF 250,000/month and of other staff (10) GNF 50,000/month, the monthly payroll amounts to 10 million GNF/month, of which GNF 6.3 million paid for by MATD. Annual payroll for the commune: GNF 44.4 million. The commune provides the building for free. The office reported as its production during 2012: 6,069 birth registrations @ GNF 3,000, 3,117 marriages @ GNF 150,000 and 136 deaths @ GNF 5,000. Total gross revenue in 2012: GNF 486 million. Total net revenue for the commune: GNF 442 million (USD 63,000). A new office for the civil registration office has been built and will be available soon. There are several areas of concern. Nowhere in the office is posted what the birth-, marriage- or death registration fee is, while staff names and production numbers are. Nowhere is a comptroller or cashier function visible. And the number of birth registrations falls far short of the number of expected birth registrations-about 22,000 annually—that should have been registered in Matoto, given its population number of 680,000. What has happened to the 16,000 birth registrations not on the books? The revenue this represents is GNF 48 million (USD 7,000). And would the number of marriages officiated and registered also be underreported? It seems that a better organization of the office is needed, and better controls. It appears that the Matoto office could do well without the help of UNICEF for its registration books, should have made better use of the computers and printers that were obtained from AIFM and should have been able to procure registration books (now obtained from UNICEF) and proper storage cabinets for archiving.

The Matoto office example seems to show that revenues from fees can be substantial. Especially marriages provide a good source of income. It is difficult to see, though, who ends up receiving the revenues. Costs (salaries) are borne by MATD and the commune, registration books are provided by UNICEF and the municipality also provides the building. What is missing in this office is cash management (treasury function), an accountability system and transparency to the clients with regards to the fees charged. It was already shown that there is a substantial degree of under-registration among the poorest in comparison to the richest segment of the population. It also seems that the commune could provide birth- and death registration for free without having to sacrifice too much revenue in comparison to revenue from marriage registration.

³⁸ There is a secondary office in Matoto but this reportedly has very little activity.

AIMF computers and printers not used and no longer usable, Matoto



Delayed registration finance in Guinea

In Kindia commune—perhaps a bellwether for the country—about one jugement supplétif is performed for every 7 births registered within the legal timeframe.³⁹ Extrapolating for the country this would mean that about 34,000 jugements supplétifs are conducted annually in Guinea. Estimates of the cost of such a procedure vary between GNF 15,000 to GNF 25,000 per case not including indirect cost, with only a minor part being for legal costs like stamp duty. The total cost of and income from these court procedures annually then amounts to a total revenue between USD 85,00 and USD 120,000. If more offices were a solution to reduce delayed registration it is illustrative that from this delayed registration revenue the salaries of staff of five to seven offices of the Matoto size (c.g. with the Matoto staff productivity) could be paid, or of fifty to seventy offices of the size (and staff productivity) of the Kindia commune office. Indications are that much less delayed registration occurs than one would expect.⁴⁰ For the poor, who would be the most likely to not be registered, the direct and indirect costs of delayed registration may not be within their financial reach. The age at which people seek delayed registration (see Annex 3) seems to also indicate that one important reason may be the need for a birth certificate or a national ID ad advanced age so that travel documents can be obtained for the Hajj; 85% of Guineans is Muslim.

³⁹ This probably is a low estimate of birth registration after the prescribed legal timeframe. Off the record it is said that registration offices may conduct registration also after the legal timeframe as if the birth was within the legal timeframe, or "off-the-books", which can be for benevolent reasons, or to boost registrar or civil registration income. To some extent registration offices and courts compete to serve clients who could only served by the courts.

⁴⁰ Thus far the national identity card appears not to be commonly used by the adult population although since 1996 it has been mandatory for Guineans from 15 years and above. According to estimates by SABARI staff (SABARI was the local partner of Waymark for the electoral registration in 2013, and is on contract of the Police for support to national ID production) the percentage of eligible voters (from 18 years and above) is probably about one in five. The birth certificate is required to obtain the national identity card.

Key Message

Examples of civil registration finance illustrate that the civil registration system in Guinea shows no uniformity across the country, which must greatly confuse, and probably demotivate the public. The example of Kindia shows that revenues from civil registration are NOT needed to run the day-to-day business of a municipal government. The example of Matoto shows that revenues from civil registration can keep dozens of people on the payroll while people's civil registration records go to waste. Similarly, delayed registration is a source of revenue for the justice sector and judiciary costs encourage the public to resort to counterfeit documents. It is therefore not a surprise that there is a great disparity between the poor and the rich in terms of the registration rates of their children. Guinea would be well advised to establish free birth- and death registration services, and clearly state minimal though necessary punitive fees for delayed registration, uniformly, across the country. Modern budgeting tools, such as results-based budgeting, have to be introduced to change managerial behaviour and organizational culture in the registration offices.

Archiving

Civil registration records are permanent records—at least they should be permanent according to international standards. They have to be because civil registration records are the true and original record of people's legal identity. The loss of an extract (certificate) does not mean the loss of legal identity as long as the civil registry keeps the original record. Paper records, when properly stored, can last for centuries. However, climate conditions in many developing countries, in combination with the scarcity of resources for air conditioning, generally are not favorable for long-term storage. In a growing number of countries paper records are being digitized. Electronic records can be kept forever, notwithstanding very frequent software changes.⁴¹ Electronic records can also be easily retrieved, while locating an individual paper record may require travel to one of the many places paper records usually are kept.42

France may have "solved" the problem of the archiving of old civil registration records because before Guinea gained its independence the civil records were brought "home", to archives in Nantes, France, as were the civil registration records of other former colonies ruled by France. But records created from 1958 in sovereignty are being kept in Guinea, in its commune and court offices. The quality of archiving varies widely as the photos below clearly demonstrate. In the Kindia office the oldest records are from 1967, and they are still in good condition. However, the duplicate records kept at the court are less well kept. The Matoto office was opened only in 2002 and its oldest records are probably in a worse state than records in Kindia that are 35 years older. To add insult to injury many registers have been completely

⁴¹ CSIRO, Ernst & Young, Public Records Office Victoria, Melbourne (1999)

⁴² Countries with a French past often have a central place where duplicate records are being kept, like the ministry of Justice or the National Archives. However, the completeness of these central registers often is leaving much to be desired because of a shortage of resources to transport the documents.

destroyed in the popular uprising of early 2007. Nothing has been done so far to reconstitute these lost records.



Archiving in the Kindia office (below left) and the Matoto office (top and below right)

(ey Message

Civil registration records need to be kept forever. While there are excellent examples of civil record archiving (Kindia) they are the exception rather than the rule. The civil registers and the duplicate registers are kept across the country. In Haiti duplicate registers are kept in a central place (at the National Archives) and many of them have now been digitized. The same is needed in Guinea. The example of the 2007 popular uprising has shown that great damage can be done to registers when they are kept with little or no security (as was the case in Côte d'Ivoire as well). Reconstitution of registers is extremely costly. Access to the existing registers for individuals who seek an extract or for the government to generate vital statistics is as good as impossible.

INTEROPERABILITY

Interoperability of co-implementing ministries; client ministries

The civil registration task is often a shared responsibility of various branches of government. When it is, management of the function and the accountability for its implementation may be complex. In more advanced stages identity management systems (civil registration, national identity cards, voter registration, fiscal- and social security numbers, issuance of passports, etc.) tend to become more integrated. When citizens have identity documents that come from different systems they may actually be not identical as far as the personal identity information is concerned. With the introduction of "egovernment" (government services delivered electronically) such differences are becoming more visible. For e-government the civil registration data are a cornerstone; it is the civil registration system (population register)⁴³ with which all other government registers are aligned. In developing countries where systems are still pen- and paper-based the distribution and exchange of documents often suffers from a lack of resources (and know-how) for the sharing of these documents. Electronic systems can solve much of these highcost logical and transactional problems.

As stated above, the Ministère de l'Administration Territoriale et de la Décentralisation (MATD) and its Direction National de l'Etat Civil (DNEC) are the main responsible government authority for civil registration. DNEC carries out the civil registration functions of the ministry: 1) supplies management, recruitment (of staff paid for by MATD including those seconded to civil registration offices) and training, 3) technical and administrative "control" (although there is a large degree of ambiguity about what this "control" means) of the civil registration system (which implies somewhat of a duplication with the Justice ministry's "judiciary" control role), 4) the

⁴³ A population register is a register based on the civil register but organized by the address, residence of citizens. A civil register, generally, will be a register organized by the location where the vital events occur. Both, in principle, will include all citizens as well as permanent residents and vitals occurring to foreigners within the country's territory. An ID database will include all citizens (and foreigners when residing in the country in some countries) issued an ID that have been issued a national ID. In Guinea the population of 15 and above would have to be in the national ID database. The electoral register includes, in principle, all citizens (and residents) eligible to vote on the next day of elections.
forwarding of civil registration documentation to designated authorities (e.g. INS), 5) awareness raising, and 6) the creation of new civil registration offices. The ministry is also responsible for local government, which by law is responsible for the implementation of the civil registration task. MATD pays some of the civil registration staff (e.g. in the Matoto registration office about 10 out of 32). While MATD had less than a handful of civil registration staff about five years ago, it now has about 25.

The **Ministère de la Santé et de l'Hygiene Publique (MSHP)** issues declarations (notifications) of birth and death when births are occurring in health facilities. This, at least, is what is generally understood. However, the law does not seem to provide the basis for that. In the law is stated that, when the parents cannot declare the birth, the next in line to declare the birth is the health sector when there has been an involvement with the birth or death. The health ministry is a **co-implementer** of the civil registration function, for that reason. Nothing in current law requires that the health sector issues certification of births (unlike what applies to deaths) when they take place in a health facility or are assisted by a midwife, but in practice this happens in maternities, though coverage is not known.⁴⁴ There is also not a good way in a paper-based system to monitor whether it takes place. In the Code de l'Enfant (2008) was included that civil registrars are granted access to the books kept in maternities for births occurring in the facility.

Code de l'Enfant Guinéen

Article 159 : La naissance de l'enfant sera déclarée par le père et/ou la mère ou à défaut des parents, par les médecins, sages-femmes ou autres personnes qui auront assisté à l'accouchement; et lorsque la mère aura accouché hors de son domicile, par la personne chez qui elle aura accouché. L'acte de naissance sera rédigé immédiatement.

Code Civil

Article 195 : Toute personne qui, ayant assisté à un accouchement, n'aura par fait la déclaration prescrite par l'article ci-dessus, sera punie d'un emprisonnement de 6 mois et d'une amende de 300 francs guinéens ou de l'une de ces deux peines seulement.

The health ministry receives support from the World Health Organization (WHO/OMS), which across the world supports the modernization of civil registration systems because well-functioning civil registration systems are an important source of vital statistics. The health ministry is not only a co-implementer of the civil registration task; it also is an important <u>client ministry</u> as prime customer of vital statistics. The current status of coverage and content error in many African civil registration systems still requires a fallback to alternative data collecting methods, such as the population census and household surveys. Also, WHO has an observatory for the application of technology by the health sector across the globe, and collects information on the development of "m-Health"—that is the use of mobile phone

⁴⁴ The obligation of the health sector is not clear (needs to be clarified).

applications for public health. In August 2013 a workshop was held in Guinea to collect information on the use of mobile phones for health in Guinea.

A peculiar role for the health ministry in Guinea is its responsibility for the prenuptial certificate, a task which in a largely Islam country could be with a ministry for religious affairs, or otherwise it is often found as a role for the justice ministry (which in Guinea is responsible for divorce matters).

Before it has been noted that death registration is very limited in Guinea certainly not more than 6% of all deaths are registered, and probably that is a high estimate. While there is a law on burial which requires a burial permit the law is not enforced. It appears that deaths are mostly registered when this is needed to sort out an inheritance, obtain an insurance payment or as a requirement of the church. In all other cases the likely reason for not registering a death is that there is a personal cost and no individual benefit, or even there may be a fear of tax consequences following from the registration of death. A consequence of this is also that if the deceased carried a national ID this ID will not be surrendered (as part of the death registration procedure), which compromises the reliability of the national ID system.

Hospitals print their own birth declaration forms. Registration offices have different customs with regards to whether they will keep the certificate (Matoto for example) or will return it to the parent (Kindia). The proportion of births in health facilities in Guinea is 39%. A lot more children would be reached if birth registration would be linked to vaccination, because, for DPT1, no less than 86% of children get that vaccination. A win-win between MATD and MSHP could be achieved when a <u>mobile phone application for birth notification</u> (not birth registration, which would remain a task for the civil registrar) would be linked to the use of the mobile phone for a digital recording of vaccinations (see diagram next page).⁴⁵

The **Ministère de la Justice** has an important role in the development of legal amendments and new laws, including the legal framework for civil registration and other identity systems. The courts that are under the ministry's tutelage are responsible for conferring legal authenticity to the registration books used. That makes the justice ministry a <u>co-implementer</u> with MATD of the civil registration function. Delayed registration procedures require a court decision: the jugement supplétif (an estimated 30,000 or so annually in Guinea). The ministry is also responsible for divorce documents. The courts in Guinea have an archiving responsibility; in countries with a French past the courts typically have to keep a duplicate register the documents for which the courts obtain from the registration offices. Because jurisdictions of communes and courts change over time a common problem is that the location of records will depend on how old a record is and what at the time of the vital event registration the jurisdictional delineation was. National registers do not have this problem.

⁴⁵ UNICEF has supported an initiative to digitize vaccination records in China, while UNICEF Mozambique has the successful web-based Village Reach project for EPI. UNICEF Uganda is supporting the development of a mobile phone application for cold chain management.



The footprint of the health sector in Guinea

Haiti's National Archives

Haiti has a French origin civil registration system very similar to that of Guinea. However, elections in 2006 led to a decision to establish the National Identity Office (Office National d'Identité) that introduced a national ID for all Haitians eligible to vote to use for the election. Financial and technical support was obtained from Canada, the Organization of American States, the US and the European Union. The project, completed in 2012, included the digitization of 16 million paper civil registration records held by the National Archives to make them better searchable, better preserved and ultimately suitable for accessing through the Internet. A next step contemplated is the creation of "ONIEC", the Office for National Identification and Civil Registration).

The Ministère des Affaires Etrangères is a true co-implementer of the civil registration function since embassies and consulates abroad have a civil registration task for the Guineans residing abroad. Guinea's management of these events occurring abroad is very common but not necessarily the best way. By international convention each country has an obligation to register vital events occurring within their territory, irrespective the nationality of the persons involved. I.e., the foreign country where a vital event occurs to persons with the Guinean nationality will have to issue the registration documents they issue for their own citizens as well. What does need to happen in that country, depending on Guinea's requirements, may be that the local registration documents need to be legalized locally, which means that the host country confirms that the documents are true and official. An official translation by a sworn translator may be required. The role of the embassy could be to assess the adequacy of such documents and clear the way for (later) registration in Guinea. In Guinea MATD may need to have a bureau responsible for such overseas vital events.

The **Ministère du Plan** is the main <u>client</u> ministry for civil registration data as it is responsible for the **Institut Nationale de la Statistique (INS)**, with its **Direction Démographie et Conditions de Vie des Ménages**. However, INS has not received the "volets" from MATD since 1980. INS therefore depends on the population census and household surveys for its demographic data. Guinea's national civil registration completeness levels have not been close to 90%—which is the level at which the use of data for vital statistics becomes truly possible. However, it would have been possible during the 2000s to use the data from the communes of Conakry, which had a completeness level close to 90%. The logistics challenge would also have been manageable. It is only now that INS has started such work on the Conakry data.⁴⁶

Another client ministry is the Ministère de l'Ensignement Pre-Universitaire et de l'Education Civique—the education ministry. It is important for schools to enroll children of the same age in school, in first grade (this in fact starts at preschool which is under responsibility of the social welfare ministry). Age can be ascertained from the birth certificate. It is worldwide convention for schools to ask to see the birth certification (and proof of immunization) for school entrants. It is also important that school documents, certifying that children have passed an exam or evaluation, are issued in the correct and official name of the child. For the country it is important to monitor school participation. For this it is necessary to compare the school-age population with the children or youth who are actually enrolled and/or attending school. Such data cannot be produced in Guinea. The annual survey which is done by the Direction Générale de la Planification des Statistiques et du Développement de l'Education does not, but could include a question whether children in school have a birth certificate. The education ministry has also a good footprint in the country, with a school with literate staff in almost any village. Teachers could be advocates for birth registration. The importance of birth registration and child rights deserves to be included in the primary and secondary school curriculum, of which the country has been reminded by the Committee on the Rights of the Child. In the Guerrisoriaya village none of the children in preschool had a birth certificate. The education sector has an important "gate-keeping" role to play.

The Ministère d'Etat des Affaires Sociales de la Promotion Féminine et de l'Enfance is also a <u>client ministry</u> as the work done with vulnerable children and children in special circumstances as well as with children offered for adoption is complicated by the common lack of identity and age data. But the ministry is also a potentially very important <u>quasi co-implementing</u> <u>agency</u>. Social transfer programs are about to be introduced in Guinea with international support (The World Bank), and some smaller programs are already underway, including programs with UNICEF involvement (aiming at improving girl's education). These social transfer programs are aimed at the poorest of the poor. They cannot be implemented without beneficiary identities, but they also should not be implemented without establishing beneficiary legal identities. The UNDP Commission on the Empowerment of

⁴⁶ There is an intractable problem though. Guinée's civil registration procedures for delayed registration imply that for a delayed registration NOT the same data is collected as is the case for a timely registration, and the data that is mentioned in the jugement supplétif is only available at the courts. Only a relatively small proportion of jugements supplétifs is transcribed at the registration offices, and they also do not collect the data conform a timely registration record.

the Poor has established the importance of legal identities for poor people to escape poverty.⁴⁷ Social transfer programs hold the promise of providing a tangible benefit associated with civil registration which has been lacking and has without doubt been the single most important reason for underregistration among the poor. The poor cannot afford short-term pain (financial sacrifices) for long-term gains.



Pre-school children in Guerrisoriaya—all without birth certificate

Key Message

MATD now shares its responsibility for the implementation of civil registration with the justice and health ministry. While the role of the justice sector could be reduced, the role of the health sector could be strengthened. The use of new digital technology can enhance the interoperability between the three ministries and reduce the justice's controlling and archiving role. "Client ministries", the ones that would benefit from vital statistics generated by a well-functioning civil registration system, are the planning ministry and its national statistics institute, the health ministry, the education ministry and the social welfare ministry. They all have a reason to lobby the executive and the legislative to help improve the status of civil registration. More than any other ministry the social welfare ministry holds one of the keys to success: social benefits that could act as a tangible incentive for the public to be registered and register their children.

⁴⁷ Cf. Commission on Legal Empowerment of the Poor and United Nations Development Programme (2008)

Interoperability within the ID sector

Of essential importance is that government agencies responsible for different identity systems work together. Better still, the important identity systems could be brought under one roof. The modernization of civil registration in Guinea needs to be seen in the larger context of the modernization of national identity management. In Guinea at present MATD is responsible for civil registration. The **Police** is responsible for the national ID. The electoral register is the responsibility of the Commission Electorale Nationale Indépendente (CENI), in which MATD represents the government. It is especially for the registration of voters that large amounts of money are invested because of expensive field operations (mobile teams visiting the villages). In the village of Guerrisoriaya all eligible voters have a voter's card—an illustration of the effectiveness of these enrolment campaigns.⁴⁸ This operation, conducted by the South–African firm Waymark and the local ICT firm SABARI, was reportedly done at a cost of USD 35-36 million⁴⁹, an amount which probably to a large extent has been made available by the international community. IFES reports that according to their observations the electoral register is "pretty much complete". The extent of coverage of the national ID system is estimated at 20%. The number of police offices that can issue national IDs is limited, their equipment is outdated and in 2013 the special paper used for the IDs had been out of stock for seven months.⁵⁰ In Guerrisoriaya village it was reported that less than 10% of the villagers of 15 (the eligibility age for the national ID) and above had the national ID. "The national ID is hardly needed in daily life," according to the villagers. That the country could afford to not be able to issue national IDs for seven months is indeed an indication that the national ID may not be the must-have identity document it is supposed to be. But the examples of Cameroon, Haiti, Kenya, Nigeria and other countries show that national IDs are increasingly used for elections. Ethiopia and Cameroon, for example, have (re)written their laws to codify this integration. In Sudan it has been in the law already for some time. Donors also balk at the prospect of having to continue to foot the bill of costly electoral registrations and voter registration updates. In stead, costly operations to issue IDs and construct ID databases could be used to improve related registers. The links between the systems make it possible to reduce content errors and inconsistencies over time. With elections being or becoming a regular fact of life it is the registration efforts around elections that lend themselves for improvement of the completeness and accuracy of other identity systems as shown in the diagram below (see page 43).

The diagram shows how the various identity systems can help each other to achieve registration completeness in all. In the process a functioning

⁴⁸ This should not be misinterpreted as representative for the country. The electoral observation mission of the EU has reported serious flaws in voter card distribution and other short-comings. Cf. Mission d'observation electorale de l'Union Europeenne Republique Guinée. (2013).

⁴⁹Cf. <u>http://guineaoye.wordpress.com/2013/08/17/south-african-firm-waymark-continues-to-fuel-misgivings-about-guineas-legislative-elections/</u> (accessed October 2013). In Haiti, which has a population about as large as Guinea, the 2005-2006 project for the issuance of the national ID as voter's card had a cost tab of USD 49 million. In Yemen UNDP estimated the electoral registration there at USD 36 million, ex local government costs, for a population of about 25 million.

⁵⁰ According to SABARI staff paper for 5 million ID cards had been made available in 1998. The ID cards have a validity of five years. The stock of 5 million cards was only depleted by early 2013. Given the size of the population, mortality and the five-year validity of the ID the estimate of only 20% having the ID in 2013 seems not way off the mark.

population register can be created. The virtuous circle starts at the voter registration (from 2013) but could also start when a new national ID is launched as currently is happening in many countries. If it is electoral registration, records from that operation could flow to the national ID database. When more adults have an ID the registration of births, deaths, marriages and divorces becomes easier and more accurate because many more informants, parents, or the people marrying or having a divorce would have received an ID as voters card. In this case it is the voters card that helps the civil registration processes. Complete death registration provides the opportunity to require IDs of the deceased to be surrendered, so that these IDs are no longer in circulation and the national ID database is kept up-to-date.

In Guinea the replacement of the current national ID by a new biometric ID, together with similar action in the other member states of ECOWAS, offers a new launch pad for integral improvement of coverage of ID systems (cf. also next section on the legal framework). In March 2013 the ECOWAS, of which Guinea is one of the fifteen member countries, announced that all member countries would introduce biometric identity cards that would include the same information as on passports and would in future be used to allow travel between the member countries.⁵¹ The introduction of a new biometric card in Guinea, which could imply an investment of around USD 80 million⁵², could be used to review the present organizational division of labor between authorities, viz. between MATD (civil registration and representation in CENI, electoral registration) and Police (national ID).⁵³

⁵¹ ECOWAS is the Economic Community of West African States. The member states are Benin, Burkina Faso, Cabo Verde, Côte d'Ivoire, Gambia, Ghana, Guinée, Guinée-Bissau, Liberia, Mali, Niger, Nigeria, Senegal and Sierra Leone. EAC, the East African Community of which Burundi, Kenya, Rwanda, Tanzania and Uganda are members has similarly decided that all member countries should issue national IDs for withincommunity travel. This has led to much pressure on especially Tanzania and Uganda, which are trailing much behind the other countries. Uganda has just been allowed to use its voter card until the national ID issuance has been completed.

⁵² The recently announced new ID project in South Africa costs USD 14 per card. For a smaller population as in Guinea cost per unit will be higher. USD 80 million is based on 5.5 million Guinean citizens of 15 years and older, at a unit cost of USD 14.50 per card.

⁵³ See for example for the weaknesses of the police and judiciary system in Guinea: Landinfo. Oslo (2011)



Looking at civil registration in a holistic way:

Source: CRC4D

There are a number of countries in Africa that have brought integration to their civil registration and ID systems in terms of government organization as well as legal framework, among which South Africa, Kenya and Ethiopia, while other countries such as Sudan and South Africa have had that integration already for a longer time. In Asia (e.g. Thailand and Malaysia) and especially Latin America such integration is very common. The example of Haiti shows that the introduction of a new national ID can be folded into the creation of a voter list and production of IDs that can be used for the elections. Cameroon has done so and Nigeria will do so from 2015. However, it is important to realize that only a well-functioning civil registration system can undergird electoral and national ID systems (that include just citizens from a certain age—18 and 15 years old in Guinea) and on a continuous basis can generate the identity papers that accommodate enrolment in the electoral register and the national ID system, or generate the vital statistics the country needs for all citizens from birth to death. In Uruguay national IDs are issued for newborns together with the birth certificate. In other countries national identity numbers are issued for newborns.

The difference between a population register and a civil register is that the latter records vital events where they occur while the former is organized by residence of the people.⁵⁴ This would not make a difference if civil registration

⁵⁴ In fact the law is unclear where vital events should be registered. The law states that the vital events should be registered by the registrar "in lieu", but does not clarify whether "in lieu" means the registrar in the place of the occurrence of the event or in the place of the residence of the individual(s) to whom the event occurs (when different)!

were complete, accurate, digital and online. But it still is paper-based, and consists in fact of 348 local registers that are not connected or consolidated. This needs to be solved by digitization. The population-cum-civil register is the only ID system not yet digitized. A computerization project supported by AIMF appears to have been largely unsuccessful and the reasons for this failure need to be studied. Failure or not, there is no future for identity management—including civil registration—without computerization.

Note that currently Tanzania and Uganda are working hard on the issuance of national IDs because of agreements within the economic union they are part of, together with Rwanda and Kenya. The national ID can in future be used as travel document for travel between these countries. In India the single largest project to issue unique national ID numbers (the so-called *Aadhaar* project) is on the way and aimed to curb corruption in the distribution of government benefits. The Asian Development Bank has just approved a USD 430 million loan to Pakistan, part of which is for improvement of the completeness of the national ID system, enhancing the targeting of social transfers and government benefits. Costly as these operations are, they are seen as investment with a very short payback period in terms of reduced spillage of benefits along the way to the beneficiaries.

It is still very uncommon for countries to look at the modernisation of their civil registration system and see it in the larger context of the "ecology" of identity systems that they have in place. Guinea has an electoral register, which IFES labelled as "as good as complete" (suffrage: 18 years; 5,094,644 voters according to the EU). The coverage of the national ID database (from 15 years and up, compulsory) is likely rather low, estimated at 20%. The civil register will cover probably around 1 in 2 Guineans citizens of all ages (although many records have been destroyed, many individuals have no certificate to prove their registration and individual records are hard to retrieve). The costly electoral registration campaigns (2013: USD 40M) and the introduction of a new biometric national ID (CRC4D estimate: USD 80M) can be leveraged to populate and reduce content error in all identity systems at once. As civil registration and the electoral register already are under MATD, the transmigration of the national ID system to MATD should be considered since combined responsibility is good practice in many countries across the world, including in countries in Africa (e.g. South Africa, Kenya).

key Message

1.3 LEGAL FRAMEWORK⁵⁵

NATIONAL LAW

Civil registration law

Since independence (1958) Guinea's civil registration law has evolved. The following legal texts have meant changes to the legal framework.

- 1. The in 1959 issued **Ordonnance N°. 28/PRG/du 15 avril 1959** gave the role of Officier d'état civil (civil registrar) to maires, chefs de circonscription, chefs de poste and présidents des conseils de village.
- 2. In **1962** the National Assembly passed law to regulate the registration of vital events as part of the **Code Civil (CC**). The CC contains the following with regards to civil status:

a. TITRE VII: DES ACTES DE L'ETAT CIVIL

- i. CHAPITRE I: DISPOSITIONS GENERALES, Article 170 à 191
- ii. CHAPITRE III: DES ACTES DE MARIAGE ET DE LEUR TRANSCRIPTION, Article 201 à 218
- iii. CHAPITRE IV: DE LA TRANSCRIPTION DES JUGEMENTS PRONONCANT LE DIVORCE OU CONSTATANT LA NULLITE DU MARIAGE, Article 219 à 221
- iv. CHAPITRE V: DES ACTES DE DECES, Article 222 à 237
- v. CHAPITRE VI: DES ACTES DE L'ETAT CIVIL CONCERNANT LES MILITAIRES ET MARINS DANS CERTAINS CAS SPECIAUX, Article 238 à 241
- vi. CHAPITRE VII: DE LA RECTIFICATION DES ACTES DE L'ETAT CIVIL, Article 242 et 243

b. TITRE XI: DU MARIAGE

- *i*. CHAPITRE I: DES CONDITIONS NECESSAIRES POUR CONTRACTER MARIAGE, Article 280 à 292
- ii. CHAPITRE II: DE LA CELEBRATION DU MARIAGE, Article 293
- iii. CHAPITRE III: DU MARIAGE DES GUINEENS A L'ETRANGER ET DES ETRANGERS EN GUINEE. Section 1: Mariage des Guinéens à l'étranger, Article 294 à 296
- *iv.* CHAPITRE IV: DES OPPOSITIONS A LA CELEBRATION DU MARIAGE, Article 297 à 304
- v. CHAPITRE V: DES NULLITES DE MARIAGES, Article 305 à 314
- vi. CHAPITRE VI: DE LA POLYGAMIE, Article 315 à 319
- vii. CHAPITRE VII: DES PREUVES DU MARIAGE, Article 320 à 323
- viii. CHAPITRE VIII: DROITS ET DEVOIRS DES EPOUX, Article 323 à 332

⁵⁵ CRC4D is not aware of any other earlier review of the civil registration legal framework. Observations here are limited to the headline elements of civil registration law. In the context of a modernization programme for civil registration or identity management in the country an elaborate legal review would be needed and benchmarking with other countries. The law should give legal foundation to a modernized system designed on the basis of organizational rather than (only) on the basis of judicial considerations.

- ix. CHAPITRE IX: DES OBLIGATIONS ALIMENTAIRES, Article 333 à 339
- x. CHAPITRE X: DE LA DISSOLUTION DU MARIAGE, Article 340
- xi. CHAPITRE X: DU DIVORCE. Section 1: Des causes de divorce, Article 341 à 359

For birth and death certificates see also the Code l'Enfant; similarly for the age at marriage see the Code l'Enfant (Art. 268).

- In 1965 Décret N°. 142/PRG/du 14 Avril 1965 clarified the laws of 1962 with regards to the status of registrar, requirements for civil registers, their use and the legal timeframe for the declaration of birth and death.
- 4. Ordonnance N°. 019/PRG/SGG/90 du 21 Avril 1990 with regards to the organization and functioning of communes
- 5. Ordonnance No. 092/PRG/SGG/90 du 22 Octobre 1990 with regards to the organization and functioning of rural development communities (CRD)
- Law L/2006/AN passed by the National Assembly with regards to local collectivities, Article 29 alinéa 9, Article 153, 154 and 155 with regards to civil registration
- Law L/2008/AN passed by the National Assembly (Code de l'Enfant Guinéen—C de l'E). Chapitre 6: Les actes de naissance et décès. Les actes de naissance: Article 157 à 165. Les actes de décès: Article 166 et 167

Observations with regards to civil registration law

Art. 192 & 193 Code Civil (CC):

The legal timeframe of 14 and 30 days (extended to six and 8 months) from birth for registration is not uniform for the country. This is not in compliance with international (United Nations) standards. There is no grace period, which UN recommends should be one year (including the legal timeframe of 6 or 8 months, although these periods seem too long), during which birth registration would still be an administrative (civil registrar) duty; the registration would be called *late*. Registration after the expiry of the grace period should be a more onerous procedure, involving the courts (though it could be another more demanding procedure), as the facts around the birth are harder to establish, while the procedure should also act as a deterrent of delayed registration. Sometimes suggestions are made that late and delayed registration should not be more demanding than timely registration; such suggestions are generally counterproductive. UNSD recommendations are to keep legal timeframes short (two months) to enhance coverage and accuracy. Guinea's legal timeframe thus could be too long, and the optimal timeframe could be determined by study of registration behavior (also in connection with time-consuming name giving traditions)⁵⁶ and testing.

⁵⁶ Extending the legal timeframe is not the only possible solution for birth registration because name-giving practices require time. In India given names (pré-noms) can be registered for a period of 15 years, for example, and Trinidad-Tobago has likewise amended the law to accommodate time-consuming naming customs.

The CC does not state where the birth should be declared other than "à l'officier de l'état du lieu". Within the context of civil registration it is essential to clarify whether "lieu" refers to where the child was born, or to the residence of the mother, father or parents. Common practice is the place where the event took place. Within the context of the organization of responsibilities for civil registration it is important to clarify whether the civil registrar has authority to register events that occur within her or his jurisdiction, or has authority to register vital events that occur to residents within the jurisdiction of the civil registrar.

Art. 194 CC:

The declaration of births procedure does not comply with UN standards. The persons who are allowed to declare the birth are mentioned in the UN standards: father or mother, defined next of kin, health staff, others. Good practice—applied to some extent in Guinea although seemingly without a legal basis—is to also include in the procedure a notification of birth, generally issued by a health practitioner, giving the registrar more crosscheck information for accurate information. There is a practice of birth notification ("certification of birth") in hospitals/maternities that print their own forms. The legal requirement in place for this does not seem to be very clear and hence is not understood very well.⁵⁷ Given that Art. 194 already provides for a role by law for birth (CC also does so for death in Art. 222) a legal amendment to establish a notification role for the health sector is recommended.

Art. 196 CC:

The information to be included in the birth registration record does not distinguish between legal information (filiation, birth date and place etc.) and statistical information (e.g. birth weight, birth order, etc.) and neither is there an indication in the law that the record kept in the register could have different content from the certificate issued. All four "volets" have the same content. This is not optimal practice. For example: there is no reason why registration information used for statistical purposes would need to be included in the certificate. The information required in the birth certificate and birth record (the two are identical in Guinea) does not include the nationality of the parents, while UN standards require that. When the nationality of the parents is included on the birth certificate the nationality of the child follows automatically, in combination with the place of birth.

The Code Civil does not speak about the legal duration of archiving of birth records, which is understood to mean that they need to be kept forever. The Code Civil also does not speak about the inclusion of information of death in the birth record, which opens the possibility of identity theft.⁵⁸ There is an article in CC with regards to the legal requirement for any of the mentioned declarants of birth to declare the vital event or otherwise be punishable by law. This article is not implemented, as is generally the case in countries with substantial incompleteness of their birth registration coverage, but it is a United Nations recommendation that such articles and sanctions are in the

⁵⁸ This led to the infamous "Canoeman" case in Britain. Cf.

⁵⁷ Art. 194 gives the health sector (or any non-health person present at the delivery outside of the home of the mother) perhaps responsibility for <u>declaration</u> ("et lorsque la mère aura accouché hors de son domicile, par la personne chez qui elle aura accouché"), but the registration offices do not treat the hospital forms as declaration forms as substitute for any other declaration.

http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/John_Darwin_disappearance_case

law. The CC does not state how declarants or informants would have to identity themselves.

Art. 222 & Art 223 CC:

With regards to death the registration article in fact implies that no burial is possible without a death certificate, and no death certificate can be issued without a medical certificate of a health practitioner. The legal time frame is only three days. Religious rules with regards to burial may require same-day burial. This would mean for many that the legal rules are hard to reconcile with religious prescriptions. Unfortunately this article appears to be ignored in over 94% of deaths occurring in the country. In the SAGE social transfer program in Uganda one of the benefits included in the programme is a benefit given when a death occurs. This may be an incentive for the family of the person passed away to come forward and register the death, while for he programme it helps to remove people who are no longer alive to be moved from the "benefit roll". In Kenya no death registration will take place unless the national ID of the deceased is surrendered.

Art. 157 & 158 C de l'Enfant (C de l'E):

These articles extend the legal timeframe for birth registration to 6 and 8 months. (See observations before re Art. 192 & 193 of the Code Civil) including the lack of clarity with regards to where vital events should be declared.

Art. 159 C de l'E:

Here it is now the mother and/or the father as first in line to register the child, i.e. the mother has now equal right as has the father.

Art. 160 C de l'E:

Cf. observations Art. 196 CC (same observations). What is a good addition however is the following:

Il est tenu dans les hôpitaux, maternités ou formations sanitaires publics ou privés un registre spécial coté et paraphé sur lequel sont immédiatement inscrites, par ordre de date, les naissances qui surviennent.

La présentation de ce registre peut être exigée à tout moment par l'Officier de l'état civil du lieu où est situé l'établissement ainsi que par les autorités administratives et judiciaires.

However, nowhere do the Code Civil or the Code de l'Enfant Guinéen speak about a certificate issued by hospitals, maternities or health facilities. An example of such a "declaration" is shown in the photograph below. Terminology used in Guinea is at odds with international standards.

REPUBLIQUE DE GUINEE Travail-Justice-Solidarité DECLARATION DE NAISSANCE IN Je soussign (Médecin - Sage Femme) ai l'honneur de porter à la connaissance de Monsieur l'officier de l'Etat Civil, la naissance de l'enfant NOM Sexe : Férr Nom de la mère Profession Nom du Profession Quartier archie 201 Survenue le A la maternité SAINT-GABRIE de MATOTO, Conakry ENFANT NE nature DISPENSAIRE

Because less than 40% of deliveries take place in health facilities (and less than that in the 1990s), UNICEF supported the introduction of "Cahiers de Villages" in 1995 with the purpose to have a local record of births and deaths which just as the hospital records could be used by civil registrars to include those vital events their civil registers. The cahiers could also be seen as a way for local communities and their leaders to discharge their duty under the law to report vital events if the father would or could not. But the cahiers have no legal basis and are all but gone out of use

Art. 166 C de l'E:

For the dignity of children and their parents as well as for the collection of vital statistics re perinatal mortality it is good practice that for children who die

before their birth is registered a birth- and death registration needs to take place, and—as is required by law—a medical certificate is issued. One could imagine though that in a rural setting and for poor citizens it might be highly unlikely that the law could be complied with.

Art. 268 C de l'E:

Guinea has followed up on a CRC recommendation to change the previous difference in required age for girls and boys for marriage, but still is critical about the possibility left for marriage at lower age when the parents consent to it.

Art. 271 C de l'E:

This article speaks about children turning "emancipé" at age 16, affording them certain rights. The use of the age of 14 in some other instances, of 16 for "emancipation" and the national identity card, and 18 for suffrage can be confusing.

The Code de l'Enfant Guinéen also does not speak of a sharing of information with the statistics bureau, as is the case for the Code Civil.⁵⁹

What appears to be missing is a clear set of implementation regulations of civil registration law, besides the law itself. Such regulations help to bring all relevant information together, present the information in understandable language, and in that way help registrars in performing their duty and MATD in developing training material for induction and refresher training of registrars. Regulations, by their nature, can be easily amended, while laws require more onerous and time-consuming procedures. Civil registration law does not provide for a distinction between legal and statistical information recorded and is not particularly geared towards the generation of vital statistics. Neither does the legal framework anywhere allude to the electronic age.

Nationality law

Key Message

The Code Civil regulates nationality:

- a. TITRE II: DE LA NATIONALITE, Article 20 à 29
- b. <u>TITRE III</u>: DE L'ATTRIBUTION DE LA NATIONALITE GUINEENNE A TITRE DE NATIONALITE D'ORIGINE, Article 30 à 45
- c. <u>TITRE IV</u>: DE L'ACQUISITION DE LA NATIONALITE GUINEENNE, Article 46 à 94
- d. TITRE V: DE LA PERTE DE LA DECHEANCE DE LA NATIONALITE GUINEENNE, Article 95 à 108
- e. <u>TITRE VI</u>: DES CONDITIONS ET DE LA FORME DES ACTES RELATIFS A L'ACQUISITION OU A LA PERTE DE LA NATIONALITE GUINEENNE, Article 109 à 141
- f. <u>TITRE VII</u>: DU CONTENTIEUX DE LA NATIONALITE, Article 142 à 169

⁵⁹ The 1965 decree on the forms used can nowhere be found. It is possible that this decree would speak of sharing documents with INS.

Observations with regards to nationality law

The legal framework still does not give equal rights to mothers and fathers to pass on nationality to their children. Children at the age of 18 who got their Guinean nationality through the mother can renounce it; this is another indication of discrimination.

Election law

Election law is laid down in the **Constitution** and the **Code Electoral** (Loi organique N°. 91/012/CTRN portant Code Electoral modifié par les lois organiques N°. L93/038/CTRN Du 20/08/1993 et L/95/011 CTRN Du 12 mai 1995 L/2010/..../NT du 22 avril 2010.).

Art. 2:

The **Commission Electorale Nationale Indépendante (CENI)** is the organization responsible for the organization of elections. It works with the support of the technical resources of MATD.

Art. 3:

All those with Guinéens nationality are eligible to vote when they reach the **age of (eighteen) 18** on the day of the closure of voter registration prior to the election.

Art. 8:

A voters list is created for every commune and a copy of this list is shared with CENI to be used for **"Ie fichier general des électeurs"**.

Art. 12:

States what information of the voter is included. **Ideally such to be included** information would coincide with the information on in a birth record or in a national ID record.

Art. 17:

The electoral lists are updated by each commune from the 1st of October until the 31st of December each year.⁶⁰

Art. 18:

"The electoral lists are permanent". They are updated through revision and a request for revision can be made upon sowing of the national ID, a passport and a few other types of IDs. The birth certificate is not among these ID documents.

Art. 32 ff.:

CENI is responsible for design and production of the **voter cards**, and the decision to **replace the card by a new one**, to be reported to MATD. The duration of the validity of the card is decided by CENI. For the parliamentary elections of 28 September 2013 the card used was produced by South-African firm Waymark, with local assistance of the SABARI firm. The cost of producing the cards reportedly was USD35-USD36 million.

Art. 188: The voter card is issued without cost.

 $^{^{\}scriptscriptstyle 60}$ IFES reports that these updates, in reality, do not take place.

Observations with regards to election law

It appears that the coverage of the electoral registration is virtually complete although that is thanks to substantial outside help for voter register updates rather than through the official annual updates of the electoral lists that reportedly are not carried out as they should. That is not surprising either. Neither CENI nor MATD receive information on deaths, and other vital events that may affect the electoral register's content. MATD may just not have the capacity or means to process duplicate records from 348 offices, if they ever reach MATD. The duplicates for INS were not passed on to the national statistics office for 33 years. CENI, the 348 registration offices and the few Police offices issuing ID cards could as well be imagined to be located on different planets (without modern-day electronic means of communications) in terms of their data exchange, lacking an operational national identity management framework.

National identity (card) law

The legal framework for the national identity card is laid down in:

- 1. Le Décret 254 du 09 Septembre 1995
- 2. La circulaire sur la procédure d'établissement de la carte d'identité nationale

Observations with regards to national identity (card) law

The national identity card (Carte Nationale d'Identité-CNI) was introduced in 1995 and is mandatory for all Guinean citizens from 15 years of age. Among the (identity) documents to be shown is the birth certificate (or jugement supplétif). The card is valid for five years. The Police (resorting under the Ministry of Security) are responsible for the issuance of the national ID. The decree of 1995 mentions a national database, as well as unique numbers (15 digits) issued to the cardholders. The coverage of the CNI system is estimated at about 20%. The office infrastructure for the issuance of the CNI is limited (only at prefecture level; there are only 7 prefectures besides Conakry) which for many citizens means that large distances need to be bridged to arrange for their national ID. In 2013 there was a stock outage during 7 months. Such problems naturally do not help to enforce the mandatory character of the card. The Police are receiving technical assistance from SABARI, a local ICT firm. Reportedly the French company SAGEM, now part of the Safran group of companies, has been associated with an upgrade of the present national ID card (see section 1.2). The introduction of a new ID may well require a review of the ID law. In fact, Guinea could use the opportunity of the introduction of the new ID for the reorganization of national identity management and for law development to initiate and jumpstart such a new integrated approach.

Key Message

In Guinea the current legal framework for national identity management (civil registration, national ID and voter registration) as well its current organization lack the integration and sophistication possible across sectors, ID systems and use of affordable modern information and communication technology. The recent investment for the elections (probably close to USD 40 million) and the ECOWAS commitment for investment in a new biometric national ID (probably close to USD 80 million) illustrate that national identity management can be an expensive undertaking for a poor country. The new national ID could be a harbinger of necessary change towards modern and integrated national identity management. Good practice examples from across the world show that it is possible to organize the various identity systems in an integral and modern way and create the legal basis for that.

INTERNATIONAL LAW

The registration of births is a key child right in the Convention on the Rights of the Child (Articles 7 and 8, see also annex 2). Guinea has ratified the Convention on the Rights of the Child on 13 July 1990. Guinea is also a State Party to the African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child. In 2011 Guinea acceded to the Optional Protocol to the Convention on the Rights of the Child on the sale of children, child prostitution and child pornography. In 2009 and 2013 respectively the Committee on the Rights of the Child gave its concluding observations on Guinea's first and second State party reports to the Committee.⁶¹ Guinea is now requested to submit its next "3rd to 6th report" by 2017, i.e. it will then have submitted only half the number of reports (three) that it should have submitted (six). One of the main pieces of progress is that the Committee's recommendation to bring together fragmented legislation for children in one children's code has resulted in the Code de l'Enfant Guinean, adopted in 2008. With regards to birth registration the Committee in 1999 stated that insufficient measures were taken by the State party in the area of birth registration and as well that there was a lack of awareness of registration procedures, especially in rural areas. The interesting aspect of this is that in 1999 no data was available on the coverage of birth registration, whether urban or rural (other than the UNSD data for 1994 that birth registration was "less than 90%"). The State Party report may have contained that information, but at the time only anecdotal information could have been available. The State Party report of 2012 also contains some surprising mistakes. It does not seem to be quite correct in its rendering of the laws that govern civil registration or the contents of those laws.⁶² It states that the legal timeframe for births is two months, rather than six.⁶³ In its Concluding observations re the 2nd State party report it is mentioned that only 1/3 of children is registered at birth, while the EDS (2005) data known by then give a

⁶¹ Cf. United Nations, Committee on the Rights of the Child, (2009) and (2013).

⁶² Cf. United Nations. Committee on the Rights of the Child, (2012), p. 13, pt. 104

⁶³ lbid, p. 13, pt. 101

number of 43.2%.⁶⁴ The Committee correctly points out the difficult access to registration centers "due to their location" as well as the high cost of birth certificates, especially for poor families. The Committee encourages the State Party to strengthen its efforts to expand and expedite the process of birth registration, interestingly, and sagely, through the effective functioning of DNEC and by lowering the costs of birth certificates. That the Committee would encourage a central body to expand and expedite the process of birth registration especially in the rural areas is interesting because it is unusual; the common recommendation would be decentralization. Rather "run-of-the-mill" is the Committee's recommendation "..that the State party launch extensive [CRC4D italicization] awareness-raising programmes, including campaigns on the importance of birth registration, on the process of registration and the benefits thereof." It seems controversial at the least to give such recommendations that would require substantial use of resources in a very poor country when the evidence that such programmes would have impact is assumed rather than based on evidence. CRC4D's own observations in a rural area of the country are that there is no lack of awareness among the rural poor but rather a custom of relying on rational thought processes that guide poor people's decisions whether they would want to have an identity document at the cost and for the benefits they perceive, and whether they could afford the instant cost.

In the exchange between Guinea and the Committee on the Rights of the Child many other issues are discussed that are linked to birth registration. For example, Guinea has improved gender equity with regards to the legal minimum age for marriage. But underage marriages will be more frequent among the rural poor of whom the children are the least likely to be registered, thus age is uncertain. The very definition of the child is linked to the ability to know the age of that "child", or person. Child labor, child trafficking, child prostitution, children in armed conflict, children in conflict with the law, etc.—the list goes on; the lack of identity papers and government identity records for many of these children affects the ability to implement successful policies. The Committee mentions the low level of spending of the government on education (and health) but the lack of granular demographic data makes it very hard to determine school participation, for example. The Committee mentions the desirability that human/child rights education is included in the curriculum of primary and secondary school, which indeed is one way in which the education sector can make a contribution to improvement of registration rates.

⁶⁴ Cf. United Nations. Committee on the Rights of the Child, pp. 8-9, pt. 44. The birth registration numbers are not included in the EDS (2005) publication, however. Rather, the Committee should have expressed its concern that this 43.2% meant a sharp drop from the number of 67% in 1999.

Guinea needs to improve its implementation of its obligations under the Convention on the Rights of the Child. It also needs to improve its reporting to the Committee since by the next round Guinea will have only submitted 3 of the 6 reports it should have submitted since 1990. The good news that registration has improved from 2005 through 2012 was not yet known when the CRC wrote its Concluding observations of 2013 and a too low registration rate (1 in 3 children) was reported. The CRC generally correctly identifies the problems with regards to birth registration (especially those with regards to DNEC, and the plight of the rural poor). It is with regards to the interventions proposed that the CRC may have been less well "sage", e.g. when "extensive awareness raising campaigns" are recommended without evidence that they would help.

55

Key Message

1.4 DEMAND

The analysis in previous sections has also provided insights with regards to the demand of the Guinean population for birth registration and for identity documents in general. Key findings are:

- 1. Effective demand for birth registration services is high—about twice what would be "normal" for Guinea's level of development. But not conducting delayed birth registration is very common: while about six in ten births are registered within the first five years, less in one children not yet registered is registered after that.
- 2. Data available for delayed birth registration does not show that parents are led by a need for registration around primary school entry age or primary school exam age.
- 3. Data shows that the disparity in registration rates between the poorest and richest quintiles in Guinea is extreme by international standards. Poverty is severe in Guinea (almost 6 in 10 people live from an income below the poverty line), and for many in the countryside registration services are remote and therefore expensive.
- 4. Data shows that birth registration rates across the spectrum by 2012 have recovered since 2005. This could be related to a generally improved security situation in the country in recent years, especially since the successful democratic elections for the presidency of 2010.
- 5. Low birth registration rates do not mean that people do not value identity documents. Probably over 90% of the adult population cooperated to be registered and be able to vote. The gender balance in the electoral register is probably better than is the case for the national ID. The electoral register likely holds more than two times as many Guinean citizens as there are in the civil registers, held somewhere across the country in 348 civil registration offices, and it will also hold substantially more (4 to 5 times as much) "active" records than present in the national ID database, the reasons for which are that voter registration is 1) low-threshold: brought close to where people live, low-cost and less onerous than (delayed) civil registration or application for the ID (for which there are only few issuing offices outside of Conakry) and 2) people feel there is a real purpose (benefit, incentive) to registration as voter.
- 6. The 348 offices across the country imply an average service area of 700 km2 per office. In Egypt such an area would have on average of over 3 registration points.⁴⁵ In Egypt, birth- and death registration points are located in health establishments and run by health staff. The interoperability between the civil registration authority and the ministry of health in Egypt is real while in Guinea that same interoperability is still not laid down in civil registration law but for births in health facilities does exist in a nascent way in the form of the "birth certification" documents issued

⁶⁵ In fact, given that most of the Egyptians live near the Nile, the density of registration offices is (much) higher and service areas are much smaller still than country averages indicate.

by maternities. Egypt has universal coverage of births and deaths (it had, at least, prior to the instability brought on by the "Arab Spring").

7. Application for national IDs, while mandatory at the age of 15, may show a tendency for postponement and "delayed identification", until required. This is an indication of 1) how many people behave with regards to obligations put onto them by government and government enforcement of such obligations, and 2) awareness of such obligations. It appears that delay of registration and identification in Guinea has become part of the normal state of affairs. The government (judiciary) also appears to have settled for that situation: reportedly "corners are cut" with respect to requirements for witnesses.

Given the above findings it appears that a great majority of Guinean adults are well aware of the need and benefits of enrolment in identity systems, and—by extension—of the need to register births. The incentives to do so within the legally "prescribed time" are there as well—but "in time" for Guinean citizens does not coincide with what Guinean civil registration and national ID law has determined as being "in time". Civil servants applying the law seem to agree, as national ID coverage (a mandatory ID requirement) appears to be low. Also, for many poor Guinean citizens the costs (mostly in terms of travel cost and the cost of their time away from home) are prohibitively high while immediate benefits for timely registration (or timely application for the national ID) are often not felt.

Birth registration colliding with African culture⁶⁶

"Déclarer les naissances à l'état civil équivaut à faire **des sacrafices** ressenties comme une contrainte injustifié en tempest en argent. En effet, la naissanceest un événement majeur dans la vie d'un Africain et à cette occasion des cérénomies nombreuses sont prévues aux cours desquelles les parents, en particulier le père, doit offrir des cadeaux à sa femme, à sa bellefamille, et aux invites. Dans les milieu urbains, cette cérémonie est l'occasion d'offrir des parures et des vêtements neufs à l'accouchée. L'effort supplémentaire que la loi exige des parents de se render au bureau de l'état civil est de toute evidence au-delà de leurs forces. Et les populations ne sont pas encoe convaincues de l'importance meme de declarer la naissance. C'est pourquoi **la sanction seule ne devrait pas suffire.** Elle devrait être accompagnée d'un effort permanent d'éducation et de sensibilisation, d'une part, et de l'adaption de la loi aux réalité sociales et culturelles, d'autre part."

Raising awareness—often seen as the way to enhance demand—may be largely ineffective because people's behaviour appears to be informed, fully rational and in their best interest. Rather the problem is one of insufficient incentives as well as present disincentives leading to late birth registration or no registration at all. Evidence to that effect seems to have been ignored by

⁶⁶ Cf. Wata, Aimé, p. 246

local policy makers and the donor community alike, and it might be for that reason that this year the Committee on the Rights of the Child issued their Concluding Observations for Guinea and said among some more reasonable things:

"that the State party launch extensive awareness-raising programmes, including campaigns on the importance of birth registration, on the process of registration and the benefits thereof."

But there is no evidence of who is not sufficiently aware. If it is the poor and rural people who are the least likely to register their children and they were made aware of the importance, registration process and benefits, would it make any difference (do we have the evidence it would?) or could there be other ways that would be more cost-effective?

There is interesting relevant material available from years ago. In 1982 the International Institute for Vital Registration and Statistics summarized this from the recommendations from twelve conferences held across the world between 1954 and 1982 (note the use of "incentive" in the first sentence and of "motivate" in the last sentence):⁶⁷

"In most of the developing countries there exist little or no incentive for individuals to register vital events. However, these countries have urgent need for vital statistics based on registration of vital events for national development planning and for study of social change. Civil registration should represent a felt need for the whole community, and should be an institution that is a part of the national process of development planning. Conscious support should be developed at top governmental levels for adequate staffing and funding of all activities leading to the improvement of the civil registration system. Means must be developed to motivate the population to register vital events."

Policies to enhance incentives ("motivate") and eliminate or reduce disincentives for timely registration (and identification) should be informed by common sense and lessons that can be learned from Guinean and international experience.

- <u>Cost</u>. The single most important disincentive to timely birth registration is cost—direct in the form of "official" or "in-official" fees, or indirect for bridging the large distances for many Guinean people to the nearest registration office. The Kindia good practice example shows that Guinea would be well advised to abolish fees for timely birth- and death registration. And for indirect costs, a solution such as the one used in Egypt—piggy-backing on the "footprint" the health sector has in the countryside—can be considered, given that civil registration law already provides the "green shoots" for that interoperability.
- 2. <u>Benefits</u>. For the many poor Guinean citizens cost is key, but benefits are important as well. Guinea is embarking on the introduction of a substantial social safety net program supported by The World Bank including one sub-programme UNICEF is associated with for the promotion of girl's education. By their nature these programs are targeting the same people as the ones that are least likely to register. See below under "social

⁶⁷ Cf. International Institute for Vital Registration and Statistics (1982), p. 3. There is also an interesting cultural pattern between different continents visible in the views of registrars, summarized crudely as follows. Latin America: "It's the government's fault." Africa: "It's the people's fault." Asia: "Require the people to be registered when they use government services."

transfers to create demand". In addition, primary education is perceived by many as a valuable government service worth the cost of registration. Cash transfers from the government are the only government service for which it is both reasonable for the government and beneficial for the recipient to insist on establishing the identity of the recipient as providing the beneficiary with an identity is legally empowering the recipients, setting them and their offspring on a path towards self-reliance.

- 3. <u>Gender and coverage</u>. When identity systems are not seen in isolation but in a holistic way, benefits perceived from registration for one system can be "short-circuited" to other systems by removing the separation between those systems. Because many among the older generations will not have been registered, the registration of their offspring is made more onerous as parents have no ID. Voter registration cards can help in that regard, or the field operation needed for the introduction of the new biometric ID. If voter registration would be gender-neutral while national ID issuance is biased towards males, the use of national IDs for elections would be a possibility to establish a better gender balance in the national ID system.⁶⁸
- 4. Law and law enforcement. When the law is not being obeyed by large numbers of people—including duty bearers who are supposed to implement the law—the lawmakers need to rethink the law and law enforcement. Note that DNEC management quotes counterfeit documents as the number one problem. Sanctions and their enforcement for violating the law deserve a place, but the incentive route may prove more successful and may reduce the persuasion to fall back on counterfeit documents.
- 5. <u>Awareness</u>. As an element within an intelligent package of a variety of measures raising awareness and advocacy ("C4D", i.e. communication for development) deserve a place. But C4D itself needs to be intelligent as well in targeting the people and actors who need to be on the receiving end of it. For example, there may be a problem for people to distinguish between the hospital certification of birth and a birth (registration) certificate. Also the reasons for the gulf between registration rates and actual birth certificate possession need to be investigated to establish how awareness raising may have a place to close this serious gap.

This review provides indications that among different segments of the population, demand is affected by the variance in the availability and physical, financial and social accessibility of services. Given the still too low level of coverage of civil registration outside of Conakry, it is believed that generic measures that "lift all boats" may initially be benefiting many more deserving people than any "targeted approach" could be expected to achieve. However, social and cultural factors that facilitate or obstruct birth registration should be identified, including people's perceptions of self-efficacy and confidence to demand services. The levels of integration and inclusion of children from traditionally marginalized groups also need to be examined. The data reveals that only one in five children of 0-59 months of

⁶⁸ In countries such as Cameroon, Haiti, Kenya, Oman and Pakistan national IDs have been used and promoted for use for voting. If this were done in Guinea the favorable gender balance in the electoral register would spill over to the national ID system.

age from the poorest families is registered. This may require moving beyond the investigation of Knowledge, Attitudes and Practices (KAP), to include a social-anthropological study at community, household and kinship group levels. However, the data available points to the predominance of physical and financial barriers for access to civil registration services for poor families located in remote areas lacking transportation infrastructure. The EU-funded UNICEF project, scheduled for implementation in Guinée Forestière that is one of the poorest districts in Guinea, will include interventions to remove or reduce those physical and financial barriers.

While the general public is the prime client of civil registration services it is by no means the only actor exercising demand, or being a potential customer. Any agency, private or public, depending on credible information with regards to the identity of citizens, is a customer of the civil registration service or will be. The government at large is an important customer whether it is for school entry or availing of benefits from the "National Solidarity Fund" planned for, i.e. from social transfer programs. These programs could become the most important "customers" vying for the services of DNEC and registration offices—at least, they should be (see below).

The legal identity of citizens is so essential for the normal functioning of society that it is a **public good** of which the national value exceeds what the public can afford to pay or will avail of for individual benefit at a cost "the market can bear". It is for that reason that governments subsidize—in fact contribute from tax Francs on behalf of citizens—the service. The national statistics office, INS, is a customer for data that it can use to produce statistics on the population. The private sector depends on credible identity information for contracts, for the opening of bank accounts, for issuance of SIM cards for mobile phones, etc. A well-functioning civil registration system and population register, that holds all citizens young and old, is cornerstone to e-government.

The High-Level Panel of Eminent Persons on the Post-2015 Development Agenda has confirmed civil registration as a public good. This panel has recommended that under goal 10 ("Ensure good governance and effective institutions") the first illustrative target would be: "Provide free and universal legal identity, such as birth registrations". This is further explained as follows:

"Government is responsible for maintaining many of society's central institutions. One of the most basic institutional responsibilities is providing legal identity. Every year, about 50 million births are not registered anywhere, so these children do not have a legal identity. That condemns them to anonymity, and often of being marginalised, because simple activities—from opening a bank account to attending a good school—often require a legal identity."⁶⁹

⁶⁹ High-Level Panel of Eminent Persons on the Post-2015 Development Agenda (2013), p. 50

What is important for DNEC is to know the clients and potential clients of the civil registration service. DNEC should be aware that its clients are unlikely to be able or willing to pay for the service what the service costs. Consequently it needs to make a well-documented case each time government decides on budgets, whether it is for the central service or for registration offices run by the communes. Civil registration is a public good and the legal identity of all has been firmly established for the post-2015 development agenda by the High-Level Panel of Eminent Persons as essential element to achieve good governance and effective institutions (goal 10).

SOCIAL TRANSFERS TO CREATE DEMAND

Key Message

Social transfers have been proven as an effective means to ensure that the benefits of growth reach people living in chronic poverty and that intergenerational poverty cycles are broken. They are regular and predictable grants, usually in cash, provided to vulnerable households or individuals. Evidence from existing social transfers in developing countries suggests that they can help tackle hunger, increase incomes, improve the education and health of the poorest families, promote gender equality and contribute to empowering poor people. In addition there is evidence that social transfers can contribute to growth and development of local markets.⁷⁰

The large-scale implementation of social transfer programs has been endorsed by major aid agencies, including the World Bank in its 2006 World Development Report, entitled "Development and Equity", and recently in its new strategy for 2012-2022.⁷¹ The High-Level Panel of Eminent Persons has firmly included these programs in the post-2015 development agenda under its first goal "End poverty".⁷² A publication in which the total magnitude of social transfer programs is mapped, the title of which speaks of a "quiet revolution", comes to an estimated *500 million beneficiaries* of these programs.⁷³ The authors write about the World Bank:⁷⁴

"The World Bank developed a social protection strategy in the mid-1990s as a response to the impact of structural adjustment on developing countries and the failure of its 'social dimensions' initiatives. The Bank's Social Protection Group, initially focused on labor market and pension reform, and safety nets, but more recently it has supported a wider range of instruments including cash transfers. The Bank is now a major player in social protection, leveraging change through technical assistance and financial support."

⁷⁰ Cf. Department for International Development (2005)

⁷¹ Cf. World Bank (2006) and The World Bank (2012-1)

⁷² Cf. High-Level Panel of Eminent Persons on the Post-2015 Development Agenda (2013), p. 33

⁷³ Barrientos, Armando et al. (2008)

⁷⁴ lbid, p. 11

Another recent reaffirmation of the importance of establishing identity has come through the work of the (UNDP) Commission on the Legal Empowerment of the Poor. The Commission was the "first global initiative to focus on the link between exclusion, poverty, and the law."75 The Commission proposes strategies for creating inclusive development initiatives that will empower those living in poverty through increased protection and rights. In its 2008 report is stated that "everyone has the fundamental right to legal identity and is registered at birth" in the context of delineating the 'first pillar' of its recommendations relating to access to justice and the rule of law. Identity, according to the Commission, is a key condition for legal empowerment of the poor. A prime domain in which legal identity will have the most powerful effect of unleashing the development potential of the poor is the area of property rights. One of the lead persons of the Commission is Hernando de Soto, the President of the Institute for Liberty and Democracy, whose book "The Mystery of Capital" according to The Times (London) is a "blueprint for a new industrial revolution."⁷⁶ De Soto convincingly shows that the legal framework in developing countries has not kept up with realities, and stifles growth and development. The extralegal economy to which the poor are confined is waiting to be unshackled through legal development, which needs to include the legal identity for individuals currently still operating in the extralegal sphere.

Social transfer programs are most effective when integrated within a social protection strategic framework, which in turn is part of the national poverty reduction strategy. The best results are achieved when they are complemented by other actions: accessible and well-functioning health and education services, local development and employment opportunities. One UNICEF paper on social protection policy⁷⁷ calls for four broad sets of interventions aimed at reducing social and economic risk and vulnerability, extreme poverty and deprivation affecting women and children disproportionately: 1) Protective interventions that offer relief from economic and social deprivation and include humanitarian relief in emergencies and targeted cash transfer schemes; 2) Preventive interventions that include mechanisms such as health and unemployment insurance as well as noncontributory pension schemes; 3) 'Promotive' interventions that enhance assets, human capital and income earning capacity among the poor and marginalized, including skills training and employment guarantee programs, and 4) Transformative interventions aimed at addressing power imbalances that create or sustain economic inequalities and social exclusion. These include legal and judicial reform, legislative processes, policy review and monitoring, budgetary analysis and reform and social and behavioral change. It is no hard to see that within all four sets of interventions the legal identity of the poor is a key element as programme condition and/or as programme outcome.

⁷⁵ Cf. Commission on the Legal Empowerment of the Poor and UNDP (2008)

⁷⁶ De Soto, H. (2000). Note that Simon Szreter (cf. note 80) has made the link between legal identity and the industrial revolution in his article.

⁷⁷ Cf. UNICEF (2008)

A social safety net for Guinea⁷⁸

Despite its vast natural wealth, poverty is widespread in Guinea. Spending in the social sectors is considered low by international standards. The poverty rate has increased dramatically over the past decade and a half. The rapid poverty assessment survey (2007-2008) estimated the poverty incidence at 53 percent. Contrary to trends observed in other African countries the incidence of poverty in Guinea, after a decline between 1994 (62.2 per cent) and 2002 (49.1 per cent) increased to 53 per cent in 2007 and 58 per cent in 2010. Guinean households are increasingly vulnerable to shocks, particularly fluctuations in food and oil prices and employ different coping mechanisms. The majority of people rely on subsistence agriculture and the informal sector for employment and income. Over two-thirds of the labor force relies on the agricultural sector as a primary source of income.

After years of military dictatorship and instability, Guinea's first democratically elected president assumed power in December 2010. The new President was elected on a platform of a radical break with the practices of the former military regime. Its vision is to transform Guinea's political and economic governance, in order to start reaping and sharing the benefits of its very rich agricultural and geological endowment in an equitable and inclusive way. The government, keen to contain this potential risk while advancing the reform process, is making a special effort to show quick and tangible results, decidedly in urban and potentially volatile areas. Households lack adequate risk-coping instruments. They rely either on informal solidarity networks, which are ineffective in reducing poverty and tend to collapse during large-scale and generalized shocks, or resort to detrimental coping mechanisms affecting their future growth. Interventions aimed at reducing poverty and vulnerability are largely driven by donors and non-governmental organizations on an ad hoc basis. A recent review conducted by the World Bank identifies two types of interventions in the country: a public work program in Conakry as an emergency response to the 2008 crisis and WFP school feeding programs. According to this review, these interventions are very limited in scope.

The return to civil government provides a window of opportunity to implement propoor economic and social policies. For the first time, Guinea, a fragile state, is attempting to design a coherent safety net package of interventions to support vulnerable households who have historically lacked risk management mechanisms to weather shocks. The government recently published an updated version of its Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP), which defines in detail the reforms and actions to be initiated in 2011-2012. Extending safety nets to fight poverty, improve living conditions, and extend access to and coverage of basic social services is one of the themes that figures prominently.

It is this context that the World Bank will be launching a social transfer project of, initially, USD 25 million. The proposed project is consistent with the policy dialogue and is aligned with the priorities of Guinea's Interim Strategy Note (ISN) for Fiscal Year 2011-2012 and the Bank's new Social Protection Strategy 2012-2022. The ISN is closely aligned with the main pillars identified in the PRSP. It advocates a two-stage approach towards social protection: in the short term, assisting the poorest and most vulnerable population groups to weather the negative effects of reforms and rising prices, while moving towards developing a comprehensive safety net system in the medium to longer term.

⁷⁸ Cf. The World Bank (2012-2) and Republic of Guinea. Institute Nationale de la Statistique (2008)

Accuracy and efficiency in "targeting" are, in economically advanced countries, achieved through reliable and complete civil registration and identification systems. Population registers provide information partly relevant to the qualification of recipients for social programs such as age, gender, number of dependents and addresses. The use of IDs helps to allocate transfers accurately and avoid fraud.

Targeting depends on the nature of the social transfer program. "Meanstesting" can be used to determine the economic status of potential beneficiaries, though it is complicated to implement in practice. Targeting, alternatively, can be on a particular area where there is a high incidence of poverty, such as in an urban slum. "Community-based targeting" is used when community members identify the poorest or most vulnerable themselves. "Self-targeting" is when a below-market wage is set for a program, for which needy individuals can opt to join.

Most important, though, it is to see (improved) civil registration as a result of rather than as a tool for social transfer programs. A key condition for legal empowerment of the poor, the target group of these social safety net programs, is their legal identity. Legal empowerment is what will wean the poor off social transfer programs, and if identity is a key condition to achieve that then beneficiaries obtaining a legal identity, i.e. civil registration, should be as much a deliverable of a social transfer program as are the social transfers.

Social protection has for long been recognized as a fundamental human right and is incorporated in Articles 22, 23 and 25 of the Universal Declaration of Human Rights. While there are many definitions of social protection, it is generally considered to be a sub-set of public actions that address risk, vulnerability and chronic poverty.

The link between civil registration, social security and development has in fact a very old history: "Identity registration at birth is a UN proclaimed human right. However, it is not available in many of the world's poorest countries today. A national system of identity registration following rules set by the state has existed from 1538 in England and was used by individual citizens to verify their property and inheritance rights and by local communities to verify social security claims. This facilitated the effective functioning of a nationwide social security system and a mobile market in both labor and capital, contributing to Britain's pioneering process of economic development. Today identity and vital registration systems should also be a high priority for development policy as a democratic institution vital for turning the liberal rhetoric of rights into a reality of empowered individuals."⁷⁹ England's nationwide social security system was established through the Poor Laws of 1699 and 1701.

⁷⁹ Cf. Szreter, Simon. (2007)

The mobile phone revolution

Very few inventions of the modern world may have entered the smallest and poorest villages quite at the dazzling pace the mobile phone has gotten into the hands of the African people. Indeed, as a matron in Guerrisoriaya village mocked, "even the chickens in the village have a mobile phone". Mobile phones go beyond being a means of communication: they are guickly becoming a means of money transfer, bringing the bank as close as within the palm of the hands of people. The World Bank recommends the mobile phone as one of the means to transfer small amounts of cash transfers to beneficiaries, solving the nightmarish alternative of physically moving money and finding that the transaction costs are still too large to make it many people's worth their while to pick up the cash. But mobile phones do need a SIM card, and SIM cards are issued when the applicant can show an ID. Those are the rules of almost all countries. There is probably no better example and demonstration of the experience of the satisfaction of having a tangible "benefit" (being able to use a hand phone) associated with having an identity document in the remotest places of the poorest countries. Change is coming, and governments aiming for break-through service deliveries will do well by taking a leaf from the book of the private sector.

Guinea's social transfer programs, expanded with support from The World Bank, target citizens that are the least likely to be registered and the most likely to lack a legal identity. Because a legal identity in its own right is empowering the poor it is absolutely logical and warranted that social transfer programs include efforts to enroll beneficiary household members in the national ID system, or in the civil register through late or delayed registration. This will establish the direct link between civil registration and civil identification with tangible benefits the current absence of which is in all likelihood the single most important reason why people do not register or apply for the national ID. It also makes a link between two goals for the post-2015 development agenda: the 1st goal to "End poverty" and the 10th Goal "Ensure good governance and effective institutions". The integration of government service delivery with the quickly growing penetration of the mobile phone among all social classes is also recommended.

1.5 GOVERNMENT POLICY, PLANS AND INTERNATIONAL SUPPORT

Government policy and plans

There is not yet a written government policy or plan for civil registration or national identity management. The government could consider developing such a policy as for example was done recently in Kenya and Uganda among the developing countries and in Ireland, England and Wales as well as in Australia (for the aborigine population) among rich countries. The introduction of a new biometric ID (ECOWAS decision) could be used as a steppingstone for developing a national identity management policy and action plan. The process of developing a policy and a plan allows broad consultation and inputs and can subsequently lead to amendment of the legal framework.

The general policy framework and environment have considerably changed and improved since the successful presidential elections in 2010 and the elections for the legislative on the 28th of September 2013 (admittedly held only after a few postponements). There is a sense of a new dawn and a perspective of more equity-focused, pro-poor government policies.⁸⁰

In 2008 the Code de l'Enfant Guinéen was passed. The most important change this new law brought for civil registration was the extension of the legal time frame of 14 days or 30 days to 6 months or 8 months from birth. This is an example of new policy passed through a law. While a period of 14 days originally is les than the generally recommended 2 months for developing countries, 6 months seems to have overdone it, and UN standards were not taken into account in other respects as well (grace period, one legal timeframe rather than two). However, the Child Act moved a little further into the direction of establishing a role for the health sector—not far enough, but a start. This Child Act has shown Guinea's ability for resolve and ability to develop and enact laws competently.

In the meantime, however, the on-going decentralization measures have had an impact on the distribution of power between the centre and the communes, impacting on the ability of MATD to have (more) control over the registration offices. This is a, perhaps not fully understood, problem among the advocates that champion decentralization. For good governance at the central and the local level—paradoxical as it may sound—a deconcentrated civil registration service is best.⁸¹ Fortunately the creation of DNEC is evidence that there is understanding that civil registration requires a well-functioning central organization. Recommendations for such national centres date from decades ago, and have been (only recently) put into practice in Côte d'Ivoire (I'Office Nationale de I'Identité, ONI), CNEC in

⁸⁰ See for example The World Bank (2012-2).

⁸¹ One of the still rare official acknowledgements of the adverse effects of decentralization on civil registration is, for neighboring Sierra Leone, found in The World Bank (2013), p. 37: "..registration rates did not increase significantly after devolution [as a result of the Local Government Act of 2004—CRC4D], as it increased sharply in some local council areas where specific campaigns were undertaken (most with UNICEF support) and dropped sharply in others."

Senegal and BUNEC in Cameroon. One of the tasks that DNEC has not been given, but should be given urgently, is control over computerization of civil registration countrywide. Guinea cannot afford to have an uncontrolled local development of fragmented digitization of its civil registration system.

Past international support

International support for civil registration development—small in scale—dates from the early 2000s. Financial and technical support over this period has come from the Association Internationale des Maires Francophone (AIMF)⁸², Plan Guinea (with support from Plan Japan), UNFPA and UNICEF. Plan, UNFPA and UNICEF have collaborated with various local and other international NGOs in the support given to MATD (or directly to the communes: AIMF), e.g. with Tostan, Sabou and the Reseau National des Communicateurs Traditionelles (RENACOT). The AIMF support has been for the computerization of registration offices. In neither of the two offices visited (Matoto and Kindia) the AIMF computer equipment was found in a working condition, although in Kindia this was due to not functioning solar panels while the equipment was stored in the best possible way. The hard- and software seemed to be especially meant to print certificates. UNICEF and Plan formulated a number of projects to assist the Government of Guinea to improve its registration especially at the local level. UNICEF has supported MATD in the printing of the registration books. Although the amounts allocated were not sufficient to assist the government in large-scale transformation, they were planned to help the government to carry out registration on a pilot scheme in demonstration areas that were hoped could be expanded to cover the whole country on a gradual basis. From a cursory review of project documents it appears that the very problem of these projects may haven been that too many things were planned with too small budgets. No doubt the activities will have created more awareness where they were conducted. UNICEF reports, although erroneously, that registration rates would have improved between 2005 and 2010 from 28% to 43% (while the actual numbers should have been from 43.2% in 2005 to 57.9% in 2012, but UNICEF could not know this in 2012):83

21. Le taux d'enregistrement des naissances (EN) a progressé et la prise en charge des enfants victimes d'abus s'est améliorée. Grâce aux efforts conjugués, l'EN est passé de 28 % à 43 % entre 2005 et 2010. Le système communautaire de protection des enfants se bâtit progressivement grâce à la mise en place de plus de 200 comités locaux de protection. Le cadre juridique a été renforcé notamment par l'adoption de 11 textes d'application du Code de l'enfant, la signature et la publication de cinq arrêtés interdisant et réprimant l'excision/MGF.

⁸² In 2002 a meeting of AIMF with country delegations of Benin, Guinée, Mali, Niger and Senegal decided to create an international observatory for civil status ("Observatoire International de l'Etat Civil"). Other countries mentioned that would be part of this are Burkina Faso, Cameroun, Congo, Côte d'Ivoire and Togo). It is not clear to what extent this observatory is functioning. Cf. AIMF (2003).
⁸³ Nations Unies (2012)

While Guinea is a very poor country it has also received relatively little development aid. The amount of aid per person of USD 20 and 4% of GNI is extremely low by international standards. See the graphs below. Total net aid for Guinea was less than USD 200 million in 2011.



Source: OECD/DAC Database. Beneficiary view, http://www.aidflows.org

Guinea's most important donors are shown in the following diagram (average 2007-2011):



Guinea - Sources of ODA: Top 10 Donors of Net ODA Disbursements (average for last 5 years in US\$M)

Source: OECD/DAC Database. Beneficiary view, http://www.aidflows.org

The top donors were France, the EU and the United States. UNICEF is shown among the top ten donors; it is very uncommon for UNICEF to make it to top ten in these country lists, which shows on the one hand how relatively important UNICEF is as a partner of Guinea (Plan Guinea would have made the list as well), but also how little the country receives from regular donors. IDA (The World Bank) makes it in this list only to the 9th place, behind UNICEF in 7th place.

Planned UNICEF Support⁸⁴

UNICEF will substantially increase its assistance to Guinea. The 2013-2017 agreement implies a financial support of around USD 20 million annually, of which about USD 1.4 million annually for child protection, covering also support for birth registration:

Programme de pays, 2013-2017

Tableau budgétaire récapitulatif

(En milliers de dollars É.-U.)

Composante du programme	Ressources ordinaires	Autres ressources	Total
Santé de la mère et du jeune enfant	9 128	18 372	27 500
Nutrition	3 427	12 073	15 500
Enfants et le VIH/sida	3 427	6 083	11 575
Eau, hygiène et assainissement	3 427	7 073	10 500
Éducation de base de qualité	4 927	11 573	16 500
Protection de l'enfant	3 431	3 708	7 139
Politiques sociales, plaidoyer, suivi et évaluation	2 877	3 823	6 700
Intersectorielle	5 496	2 865	8 361
Total	36 140	65 570	103 775

The programmatic planning for birth registration is explained in the following paragraph from the country programme for 2013—2017:

36. Protection de l'enfant. Cette composante du programme mettra l'accent sur la mise en place de mécanismes d'EN et l'implication des enfants dans toutes les actions les concernant. Une attention particulière sera accordée au développement d'une politique de protection sociale pour les enfants les plus défavorisés en collaboration avec plusieurs partenaires. Des mesures programmatiques spécifiques seront prises pour combler les lacunes et les défis rencontrés par les adolescents dans une optique d'amélioration de leurs conditions de vie, de promotion d'opportunités et de consolidation de la paix, avec un accent sur la réinsertion socioprofessionnelle des adolescentes à risque. Les résultats poursuivis sont : a) les programmes et budgets en faveur des enfants les plus vulnérables sont renforcés; b) un système de gestion entre les niveaux central et sous-préfectoral est mis en place pour suivre l'EN, et des informations sur les violences faites aux enfants sont régulièrement produites et utilisées pour la prise de décisions; et c) les enfants et les jeunes bénéficient d'une réponse multisectorielle et sont réintégrés et les familles adoptent un comportement favorable à l'EN et à la réduction des MGF/E et des grossesses précoces. Tous ces résultats seront atteints grâce à la mise en place d'un système de protection des enfants renforcé.

⁸⁴ Cf. note 3.

Planned WHO support

The World Health Organization has been a stakeholder in and active champion of civil registration improvement since the founding of the organization. Civil registration is the recognized source of vital statistics, provided it has reached sufficient completeness, accuracy and timeliness. Over the past few years an initiative from Asia, a collaboration of WHO with the University of Queensland funded by the Australian development assistance, has led to the conducting of country assessments across the world.

Planned Plan Guinea Support⁸⁵

Plan has agreed with the government to spend over EUR 52 million (USD 70 million) in the 2013-2017 period, or about USD 14 million annually. In Plan's programme about USD 9 million is earmarked for a "Safe, secure and empowering environment", covering work on birth registration. Plan actually has set itself as goal to increase birth registration rates in 65 communes in its programme areas from 57% to 90%.

Planned European Union—support⁸⁶

The European Union has formulated a programme with the Government of Guinea to strengthen local government, including the implementation of the civil registration task. The European Union characterized the existing problems in the civil registration task, as shown in the text box below.

The intended EU project with MATD in Guinea is everything but an exception across Africa and beyond. In 2012 UNICEF was successful in applying for a EUcontribution to a project to support Yemen, the "Promoting Equity and Legal Identity for Children in Yemen Through Improving Civil Registration (2012-2015)" project. The \$3.7 million project will focus on strengthening systems at central and decentralized level, as well as improving planning and monitoring, capacity development and service delivery. In the same year UNICEF successfully applied for EUR 6 million funding for civil registration improvement two Asian (Myanmar, Pacific Island countries) and four African countries (Burking Faso, Nigeria, Mozambigue and Uganda). This EU-UNICEF programme has graduated into a strategic partnership now know on the same title as the grant proposal: "Breaking with Broken Systems". A study tour of 15 countries to observe innovative interventions in Uganda in September 2013 is an example of expansion of this partnership. Across the world in 2012 no less than 75 UNICEF offices reported work on birth registration. Major EU support is given to UNICEF Nigeria for civil registration while also in Senegal EUsupport is used for the improvement of the civil registration system.

⁸⁵ Cf. Plan Guinea (2013)

⁸⁶ The European Union suggested that an analytical study be done to inform the work UNICEF would do with MATD: L'UNICEF intervient dans le domaine de l'enregistrement des naissances en fournissant les registres d'état civil auprès de la DNEC avec un plan de redistribution sur l'ensemble du territoire. L'UNICEF souhaite intervenir dans ce secteur directement auprès des populations et des acteurs locaux dans les domaines de la formation et de la sensibilisation des populations. Afin d'améliorer la situation actuelle préoccupante de sous-déclaration des naissances, un forum avec l'ensemble des acteurs est en cours de préparation afin de définir une stratégie nationale en matière d'état civil. **Pour ce faire, une étude diagnostic permettant d'identifier les goulots d'étranglements et de proposer des solutions apparaît un préalable nécessaire.**

La réalité du terrain de l'Etat Civil⁸⁷

La Direction Nationale de l'Etat Civil relève du Ministère de l'Administration du Territoire et de la Décentralisation (MATD) et est chargé de l'encadrement de l'état civil en Guinée. Le taux d'enregistrement des naissances s'élève à 43% aujourd'hui contre un objectif de 65% en 2012.

Les dysfonctionnements concernent principalement:

- le manque de moyens financiers, humains et matériels au niveau central et au niveau des CL,
- les difficultés de gestion des différentes institutions,
- une corruption généralisée,
- l'absence d'un système d'archivage et de lieu adéquat de conservation des registres,
- le manque de formation des agents d'état civil,
- l'accessibilité difficile des populations aux centres d'état civil,
- le manque de sensibilisation des populations,
- la pratique courante d'établissement de "vrais-faux" documents d'état civil.

Cette situation a des conséquences importantes sur les conditions de délivrance et la fiabilité des documents concernant l'état civil ou l'identité des personnes.

Les jugements supplétifs de déclaration de naissance sont, dans leur ensemble, estimés sujets à caution dans la mesure où ils sont rendus « à la demande », sans vérification aucune, sur la seule base du témoignage de deux personnes.

The European Union also supports institutional strengthening of the INS, while the EU will be one of the contributors to the funding of the 2014 population census (which will include a question regarding birth registration).

Planned World Bank support

In the previous section the important USD 25 million social transfer project of the World Bank has been discussed. It is important that links of this project with civil registration modernisation are recognized and used in a good way, to the benefit of both. World Bank management in Guinea has expressed a very positive attitude towards this recommendation towards interoperability. The Bank has also expressed interest in supporting civil registration modernisation through other channels (viz. good governance, cf. also what was earlier said about Goal 1 and Goal 10 in the post-2015 development agenda) than the social transfer project.

⁸⁷ Europlus, [Unknown date], p.1
The African Ministerial Process

While Guinea has been absent from regional civil registration conferences in the past the country has been well presented at the meetings held more recently in Tanzania (2009, INS and MATD), Ethiopia (2010, 1st Ministerial meeting, presentation done INS, MATD) and South Africa (2012, 2nd Ministerial meeting, INS and MATD). The Ministerial Process has brought the ministers responsible for civil registration together in order to harness a Pan-African high-level political commitment to break with the broken civil registration systems of the continent. This process is supported by a Core Group of organizations: the African Union, the African Development Bank, the United Nations Economic Commission for Africa, UNICEF, WHO, UNFPA, UNHCR and Plan. In 2013 a capacity-building workshop was held in Botswana for potential consultants from the continent, while support is given to country assessments of their civil registration and vital statistics systems. UNICEF has been an important supporter of this process in its early stages and is heavily invested in its on-going journey.

Private sector support

(ey Message

Orange Guinea has prepared budget for 2014 to support the development of applications for and the use of the mobile phone for m-notification, and has expressed interest in working with MATD and UNICEF for this purpose. Orange France has worked on this in several West African countries, including in Burkina Faso, Côte d'Ivoire and Senegal. The UNICEF health section is well advanced with another project with Orange Guinea for the use of the mobile phone for health applications. These initiatives resemble the successful public-private partnership between the Uganda Registration Services Bureau (URSB), Uganda Telecom and UNICEF that led to the development of the Mobile Vital Registration System there.⁸⁸

UNICEF Guinea has given support to the development of civil registration at least from the early 2000s. Through the years UNICEF's support to civil registration development in Guinea has been modest but consistent, while UNICEF's work has accelerated across Africa and beyond. UNICEF has gained broad and in-depth experience worldwide in what works and what not. A major step change in support has now been made possible by the award to UNICEF of EUR 1.2 million for civil registration development in Guinea. MATD will need much more support though, which MATD's international partners—besides UNICEF also the European Union, WHO, Plan, The World Bank and others such as AIMF, Tostan, local NGOs and private sector partners such as Orange Guinea—can and will provide.

⁸⁸ Cf. <u>http://www.unicef.org/infobycountry/uganda_70674.html</u> and Uganda Registration Services Bureau (URSB), European Union and UNICEF (2013)

1.6 ANALYSIS FOR COMMUNICATION FOR DEVELOPMENT®

Traditional social marketing approaches usually limit C4D situation analyses to conducting formative research, usually in the form of Knowledge, Attitudes and Practices (KAP) studies at community level. This tends to limit the information and data collection to the individual, household and community level, without adequately investigating and analysing the **context** in which certain population groups are consistently neglected and left outside the purview of social services. Therefore, it is important to expand the scope of information and data collection and analysis by using the social-ecological approach, to include contextual issues and the complex interaction of policy, legislative, systemic, social, economic and personal factors in determining the provision of services, their physical, financial and social accessibility and consequently, the extent to which they are utilized and demanded.

In previous sections the analysis of civil registration and national ID coverage data has shown substantial variance in rates, especially between rich and poor but also between regions, and in availability and accessibility of the civil registration service. This warrants the study of attitudinal aspects of the civil registration delivery system and whether some population groups are left and/or "pushed out" due to discriminatory behaviours of policy makers, managers and service providers, based solely on the socio-economic class, ethnicity or minority status of the person seeking the service. This should be part of a civil registration strategy going forward. The data has shown that physical and financial barriers are the predominant reason why especially the poorest families in Guinea are left out of the civil registration system. These obstacles can be overcome by new measures that break new pathways to reach these Guinean citizens.

Awareness and knowledge among national and local policy makers and planners of the importance of birth registration as critical for social and economic development requires improvement. Civil registration needs to be seen—and worked on—in a more holistic way seeking costs savings and synergy between identity systems—whether they are the civil registration, electoral registration or national ID ("civil identification") system. Measures should aim at attitudes towards the rights of specific groups (the poor, girl children and women, minority populations, refugees). These measures should be informed by the views and voices of these groups about the adequacy of policies, legislation and enforcement mechanisms are responsive to their situation and to the unique problems they may face.

⁸⁹ Cf. Civil Registration Centre for Development (2013), pp. 50 ff. The consultancy underlying this report could not include extensive site surveys for reason of limited availability of local consultants to conduct the required fieldwork as well as because of the elections for the legislative. It is important to note that the processes of conducting the C4D review and analysis, identifying strategic options and developing the C4D strategy must also be undertaken in close collaboration and coordination with key stakeholders and partners. It could be considered that this element be included in the design of the EU-project implementation plan.

1.7 BOTTLENECKS

For a workshop held by MATD, UNICEF and WHO with stakeholders and partners (about 100 participants in all) the bottlenecks for the development of Guinea's civil registration system were summarised and categorised into eight major groups, as shown in the box below.⁹⁰

Main bottleneck areas

- 1. Organization
- 2. Reaching the rural poor
- 3. Interoperability (overall)
- 4. Legal framework
- 5. Demand (incentives and disincentives)
- 6. Enabling (and disabling) environment
- 7. Awareness
- 8. Interoperability civil registration-health

These categories of problems ("bottleneck areas") are briefly described below:

- 1) **Organization** refers to the internal organization of the civil registration service, including organization and management at different levels (central: MATD/DNEC) and local: communes, as well its external organization and external links within the government at large, especially with health, the police (for the national ID) and with the electoral body, CENI (for electoral registration). This area of attention is divided into sub-issues, two of which (cf. 2 and 3 below) stand out to the extent that they are a main issue in their own right:
- 2) Service infrastructure not reaching the poor and rural population in an equitable way addresses the very inequitable way civil registration serves the poor, and why that is.
- 3) Interoperability refers to the degree in which the civil registration service works with (potential) co-producers of civil registration services: the police, CENI and the ministry of health. Full interoperability means all production partners work as if it were one well-functioning organization. Because of the potential and importance of the civil registration-health link an eighth bottleneck area was added, see below.
- 4) The legal framework refers to the civil registration law and the regulations that go (or not go) with it, but it also refers to other body of law relevant for civil registration: constitution, identity (national ID) law, law on nationality, election law, public records law, electronic communication law, decentralization law, etc. ⁹¹

⁹⁰ The workshop was held in Conakry from 25 through 29 November 2013. Workshop materials including the presentations done by participants on the bottleneck analysis can be accessed through this link: https://app.box.com/s/jj3t9hqgfrpirkwzjhxx

⁹¹ The legal framework in a broad sense, while discussed separately, is also part of the enabling (or disabling) environment.

- 5) **Demand. Incentives and disincentives** are the factors that either impede or reduce registration (disincentives such as direct and indirect cost) or, on the other hand, the positive stimuli to seek registration: government services and benefits such as cash transfers, voting right, education and employment. Also incentives such as the ability to use a mobile phone or open a bank account, or travel.
- 6) **Enabling (or disabling) environment** represents factors that are external to the civil registration system. Examples of those factors are the geography of the country, culture and ethnicity, and political stability.
- 7) Awareness relates to the extent to which stakeholders in civil registration those who make use of the service but also those who deliver the service or create the conditions for service delivery (think of budget)—know the individual and social benefits of registration and the individual and social cost of non-registration.
- 8) **Civil registration-health link** refers to the degree in which the civil registration service works with (potential) co-producers of civil registration services, in this case the ministry of health. Full interoperability means that the two partners work as if it were one well-functioning organization.

Grading the bottlenecks by relative importance

Workshop participants, divided into eight groups in each of which all primary stakeholders (civil registrars, judiciary, health staff, etc.) were represented. The groups discussed and validated the eight major bottleneck categories, and could, if they felt the need, rephrase their major bottleneck area (and report the amendments they had made). Subsequently they discussed possible solutions for their bottleneck area and presented their findings in plenary. Before and after this group work and plenary presentations individual participants were requested to rate the eight bottleneck categories by their relative importance and the relative feasibility of solutions to the bottlenecks, as follows:

- 1) Rate the importance of each problem area as follows: Give score 5 to "extremely important", 4 to "very important", 3 to "important", 2 to "not so important" and 1 to "not important".
- 2) Rate the difficulty of solving the problem area as follows: Give score 5 to "extremely difficult", 4 to "very difficult", 3 to "difficult", 2 to "feasible" and 1 to "very feasible".

The consolidated result of individual ratings combined for before and after group work and plenary presentation is shown in the table below.⁹²

⁹² The before (n=87) and after (n=50) group work rating of problems areas by importance and solutions by feasibility showed some interesting differences. Perceived average importance of bottlenecks rose slightly, while the perceived average feasibility of bottleneck resolution remained unchanged, but variance in feasibility of bottleneck solutions rose notably. This is a logical outcome since the problems had been presented clearly before group work (and the various presentations were remarkably "consensual"). Participants not so much questioned the identified problems but rather focused on discussion of solutions, hence insights and views developed and a learning process took place. On a scale of 1—5 (least to most important) participants rated problems on average between 4 and 5 for degree of importance, i.e. between "extremely important" and "very important". On a scale of 1—5 (most to least feasible)

Stakeholder rating of importance of bottlenecks

Bottleneck area	Importance of bottleneck			
1 Organization	1	4.5		
2 Reaching the poor	5	4.0		
3 Interoperability overall	6	3.9		
4 Legal framework	4	4.0		
5 Demand	7	3.8		
6 Enabling environment	8	3.5		
7 Awareness	3	4.1		
8 Interoperability MATD-MHSP	2	4.3		

Legend: Green—Most important, Yellow—Intermediate importance, Red—Least important

The result of the grading of the bottlenecks is that, overall, stakeholders consider organization and the interoperability between the civil registration and health sectors most important. They also consider the "health link" one of the most promising areas for improving the service; they see this as "low-hanging fruit" as it were. The feasibility of making the organizational changes necessary is rated as of intermediate feasibility—not too hard, but also not easy to accomplish. The outcome for the health link is both encouraging and "expected". During the workshop both the expert presentation stressed the possibilities and worldwide practice, and participants themselves suggested links to vaccination before the expert made the same point.

A very common finding is that stakeholders mention awareness as a relatively important bottleneck area. This is a finding that needs to be contextualized: the important stakeholder group of clients of the civil registration service was not very well represented (although every individual present is of course a client of the system as well). Workshop participants are also somewhat inconsequent: if awareness were one of the most important problems, demand should be as well while the latter is rated as second least important, more important only than the enabling (or disenabling) environment (major aspects being political stability and security, culture and geographical factors). Stakeholders rate the enabling (or disabling) environment and awareness on the same level-being the most immutable conditions for the civil registration service. It should be stated that in the description of the awareness bottleneck area ("Awareness relates to the extent to which stakeholders in civil registration—those who make use of the service but also those who deliver the service or create the conditions for service delivery ([think of budget]—know the individual and social benefits of registration and the individual and social cost of non-registration.") possible "blame" was given not just to the users of the civil registration service, but also to those delivering the service or creating the conditions for service delivery.

Workshop participants discussed at length the possible solutions for the bottlenecks presented in this section. Those solutions and their grading according to the perceived complexity of implementation are discussed in section 2.3.

participants rated feasibility of resolving bottlenecks between 2 and 3, i.e. between "difficult" and "feasible". The only notable shift in relative importance was in bottleneck area 4 (legal framework) which moved from rank 3 to 4 to rank 6. Overall the relative ranking was minimally affected.

2. PROGRAMMING

2.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter sets out how to translate the outcomes of the situation analysis and synthesis into birth registration programmes. UNICEF's programming processes are based on UN principles and approaches to programme planning, monitoring and evaluation. It is recommended that, in order to strengthen the system as a whole, UNICEF addresses birth registration in the broader context of civil registration, in collaboration with a wide range of country stakeholders—first and foremost with MATD/DNEC, the justice and the health ministry.

2.2 THE ROLE OF UNICEF IN BIRTH REGISTRATION AND ITS INTERNAL ORGANIZATION⁹³

UNICEF's overall programme and where birth and civil registration fit in

UNICEF's Medium Term Strategic Plan (which ends in 2013) focuses UNICEF's programming on contributing to the equitable achievement of the MDGs. It gives guidance on this through five Key Focus Areas and related Key Result Areas. Birth registration is part of the Key Result Area "Strengthening Child Protection Systems" that contributes to the Focus Area of Child Protection.

In most UNICEF offices birth registration is part of the Child Protection area of work within the Medium Term Strategic Plan of UNICEF.⁹⁴ In some offices, birth registration is located within the Planning, Social Policy or Health clusters, but it resides in the Child Protection section in the Guinea office. Wherever birth registration is located, it is important for UNICEF offices to recognize that the value of birth registration goes beyond child protection, and is also critical to social protection, strengthening good governance, and contributing to the generation of stronger national data.

Birth Registration should be viewed as a key systems-strengthening intervention contributing to two of UNICEF's major crosscutting strategic objectives:

1. **Improving Governance:** by ensuring that all children are counted and thereby strengthening the quality of vital statistics and demographic data

⁹³ Cf. Civil Registration Centre for Development (2013), pp. 56-57

⁹⁴ CRC4D's draft guide for birth registration programming—cf. Civil Registration Centre for Development (2013)—was issued under the new name of "A Passport to Protection. A Guide to Birth Registration Programming", cf. UNICEF (2013-2).

to enable governments to improve the planning of interventions for children (including the sectors in which UNICEF works).

2. **Furthering equity:** by ensuring a legal identity for all children, reaching the most vulnerable in society and removing barriers to health, education and development opportunities, citizenship benefits and participation in e-governance.

UNICEF programming for birth registration is becoming more tightly integrated with the other sectors in which UNICEF works. The health sector has unrivalled national reach through its service infrastructure. Collaboration with the health sector offers an opportunity to bring civil registration services closer to people and to coordinate birth and death information from hospitals and health facilities. Beneficiary identity is an essential ingredient for the operation of social transfer schemes, which by their nature are designed to assist the most vulnerable who are the least likely to be registered or to have a legal identity, and whose graduation from these safety nets could not be envisaged without their empowerment through registration. The Education and Health Sections of UNICEF Guinea are both involved in activities that include the improvement of birth registration. The Guinea office has no separate Social Protection section, a domain also covered across sections. For example, the World Bank's social transfer program includes the promotion of the education of girls.

Due to its CRC mandate, governments look to UNICEF to assist them with birth registration. UNICEF's convening role in relation to birth registration has been well established at the country, regional and global levels, particularly in responding to the Concluding Observations of the Committee on the Rights of the Child on State Party Reports. See also sections 1.3 above and 2.2.2 below. Because of the political developments in Guinea it has been difficult to comply with the reporting requirements of the Committee.

UNICEF's work on maternal and child health and the protection of women's rights, also give it an interest in promoting the generation of more accurate data on the mortality of children and women, and marriage registration. However, until now, UNICEF country offices have not generally engaged with broader civil registration programming at the country level, apart from a few initiatives in South Asia on countering early marriage through promotion of registration of marriages. This is about to change witness the new and more comprehensive birth registration programming guidance issued by UNICEF New York.⁹⁵ Birth registration discourse is now broadening to include civil registration as a whole, because it is not feasible or logical to address only one component of the system to the exclusion of the others. The World Health Organization has been the main agency involved in strengthening death registration and improving methodologies for recording cause of deaths. Other UN agencies that have a stake in the promotion of civil registration and strengthening national vital statistics include UNFPA (especially population census), UNHCR (refugees and internally displaced persons) and UNDP (election support and national ID systems).

⁹⁵ Cf. UNICEF (2013-2).

2.3 PROGRAMMING FOR BIRTH REGISTRATION IN THE CONTEXT OF COUNTRY CIVIL REGISTRATION

Programme design and implementation should be based on the situation analysis process described in Chapter 1, and on results-based programming processes. The most important recommended actions for government and UNICEF fall under five key intervention domains, where each intervention corresponds to an important component of the civil registration system. These are:

- Organizational change
- Legal change
- Stimulating demand
- Communication for development
- Building coalitions and strengthening collaboration

2.3.1 Organizational change

Below is a checklist⁹⁶ for review of aspects of organizational reform. The situation analysis presented in the previous chapter and the participatory work of stakeholders with MATD/DNEC management at the workshop in Conakry (held 25-29 November 2013) has covered much if not all of the points mentioned in this checklist.

MAIN AREAS OF INTERVENTION FOR ORGANIZATIONAL REFORM - CHECKLIST

Optimal control and development of the service network

- Central control of civil registration systems
- Local registration offices dependent on a national office
- Proximity of the service to the population

Interoperability

- Adequate organizational, and human and financial resource arrangements
- Adequate control of the civil registration service being offered
- Civil registration and health
- Civil registration, national IDs and other registries

Digitization and the use of ICT

- ICT as part of an integrated approach with adequate resourcing
- Organizational redesign that allows optimal use of appropriate technological solutions, such as mobile phones
- Ensuring technological solutions are secure
- Legal provision for digitization

Resources

- Adequate provision in the state budget
- Coordinating international technical and financial support

⁹⁶ Cf. Civil Registration Centre for Development (2013) p. 59 (this differs slightly from the final version, cf. UNICEF (2013-2), p. 87).

Leading reform

For the parliamentary elections of 2013 in Guinea about USD 40m was spent. The ECOWAS decision (2013) to introduce biometric IDs in the 15 Member Countries will—as the East African Union experience is taken as example lead to a rush to implement an ID project which may cost about USD 80m.⁹⁷ New elections for local government (before or in 2015) and the presidency (2015) will require new investments.⁹⁸ These amounts could be compared to the total annual amount of aid for Guinea, viz. USD 200m only. Instead of continuing with a separation of civil registration, national ID and electoral registration Guinea is in a position to embed its civil registration reform within a broader program that includes the three registration systems. Kenya, Ethiopia and Sudan all have a legal framework that covers civil registration and national ID in one law. Cameroon, Haiti and Kenya have used, and Nigeria will use from 2015, their national ID for elections rather than a special election ID. In Ghana officials now speak of one register for the population and a national data center is being built. Donors can be expected to be more willing to support an integrated civil registration and identification reform program than they would support fragmented projects. Against this background it is recommended that organizational change will be given the required high-level leadership directing a thorough and encompassing process for policy development and legal reform (for legal reform see the next section).

Note: The numbering of recommendations follows the MoRES determinant framework and therefore differs slightly from the sequence of sections in chapter 1.

It is proposed that the Government of Guinea develops a comprehensive policy for civil registration⁹⁹ and identification (R1.1)

For the development and implementation of the policy an Interministerial Steering Committee ("High-Level Committee") led by the Prime Minister is proposed (R1.2)

For implementation of the policy for civil registration and identification a Technical Committee led by MATD is proposed (R1.3)

Achieving standardization and quality

Recommendations—1

The civil registration task is one of the most important tasks local government currently performs. However, there is a great variance in the quality of service delivery, in fees charged formally and informally, in staff productivity and staff skills. There is also a start of local computerization, potentially setting an irreversible trend towards a very fragmented electronic system. The integrity of the civil status system is so important nationally that either local government agrees to follow stringent countrywide uniform standards, or the civil registration service will need to be reorganized into a de-concentrated service over which MATD has full control. Electoral registration and national ID are national responsibilities; they cannot be based on a civil registration

⁹⁷ This cost estimate is based on public information for the South Africa biometric ID project.

⁹⁸ The European Union has already earmarked EUR12m for those elections.

⁹⁹ Vital statistics need also development but their development will be only possible when civil registration is improved to reach close to completeness (>90%), timeliness and little content error.

system that is as diverse locally as is the case now, and accountability for the performance of which is opaque. International standards (United Nations Statistics Division) prescribe strong national controls and standards for the type of civil registration service Guinea has. In order that DNEC can exert a minimum of control, local registration offices will need to also report production data (cf. R5). Below are three recommendations that are aimed to establish more uniformity in service conditions across civil registration offices for their operational expenditure as well the fees they charge the public.

MATD is proposed to review current policy with regards to the subsidy for and support to registration offices and adopt a new policy to set countrywide uniform standards for subsidy for, support to and fees charged by registration offices. DNEC is proposed to develop realistic draft annual budgets for subsidy of and support to registration offices and move towards results-based budgeting (R2.1).¹⁰⁰

Birth- and death registration within the legal timeframe should be free and <u>late</u> registration within the proposed grace period (see R10) to be fixed at NGF 5,000 (R2.2).¹⁰¹

MATD and MJGS to agree on a countrywide uniform, low fee for the court procedure for <u>delayed</u> registration (R2.3).

Operational improvements

It is necessary to put in place the means for achieving satisfactory performance of registrars and registration offices, and for generating the management information that DNEC needs to perform its tasks competently including through feedback loops directed at registrars and registration offices concerning their performance, The following recommendations R3—R6 all aimed at these objectives.

Recommendations—3

Recommendations—2

Guinea needs a new, modern law on civil registration, vital statistics and identification that is in accordance with international standards. This law can replace the legal texts that are now scattered over different laws, decrees and ordinances some of which cannot even be found anymore. Such a new law could be an evidence-based law.¹⁰² The law could be accompanied with regulations that serve as practical and operational guideline as well as legal foundation for, for example, fees that may require more frequent change than the main body of civil registration and identification law. The new law should provide the legal basis for digitization and the use of technology. It is proposed that the lawmaking process will be thorough, informed by international good practice and consultative, and without undue pressure to achieve quick results (R3).

¹⁰⁰ Results-based budgeting is a program budget process in which: (a) program formulation revolves around a set of predefined objectives and expected results; (b) expected results would justify resource requirements which are derived from and linked to the outputs required to achieve results; and (c) actual performance in achieving results is measured by objective performance indicators.

¹⁰¹ Alignment with UNICEF policy (cf. UNICEF (2013-2)) would be a reason to exempt all forms of birth <u>registration</u> from fees but charge a (limited) fee for the court verdict (jugement supplétif; cf. R2.3).

¹⁰² Evidence-based law is legislation based on scientific evidence. For example, setting the legal timeframe for registration would be based on evidence of people's behavior with regards to registration in relation to their resources, cultural practices (e.g. name-giving) etc.

DNEC needs to have an HR- and training department, professional 9 training resources and a multiyear training program (R4.1). In the interim DNEC may use the Plan-developed manual containing guidelines for civil registrars (to be reprinted if needed—R4.2).¹⁰³ DNEC needs to have an audit department and an audit program and audit ratinas. It is proposed that MATD adopts the RapidSMS monitoring tool for the production of registration offices as used in Nigeria (R5).¹⁰⁴

DNEC may consider using social media to obtain customer feedback on how registration offices perform and adopt the "U-report" message service as introduced in Uganda (R6).¹⁰⁵

Diaitization

The computerization project funded by the Association Internationale des Maires Francophones (AIMF) has failed. Reportedly there are new local computerization attempts. Computerization needs to be led by MATD, since uncoordinated local computerization initiatives in Côte d'Ivoire and Cameroon have shown to be counterproductive. Computerization also needs to be phased in gradually, from office to office. Notwithstanding disappointing experiences the digitization of civil registration will need to happen. There is too much evidence that the current paper- en pencil system is one important reason for the failings of the civil registration service, and a lack of management information and control. Guinea needs the national civil register to become the basis for the electoral register and the issuance of national IDs. Also, since 1980 the volet for statistical use has not reached the Institute Nationale de la Statistique. As a result it has been impossible to harness the vital statistics resource that civil registration is. For the country's planning and budgeting vital statistics need to be produced as soon as registration is complete (>90%); this could start for parts of the country that have reached registration completeness, e.g. Conakry (such a start has now been made by INS in Conakry).¹⁰⁶ There is no possibility to run a biometric national ID system as required by ECOWAS without computerization. If the civil registration and the identification functions are combined in one office (rather than as now is the case in two different offices)¹⁰⁷ the computerization (with online connectivity) for the biometric national ID could benefit the computerization of the civil registration function.

¹⁰³ Cf. Ministère de l'Administration de la Territoire et de la Décentralisation, Direction National de l'Etat Civil. Guide des Officiers de l'Etat Civil et des Agents Auxiliaires, Conakry (2011)

¹⁰⁴ This tool is used by Nigeria. Cf. http://rapidsmsnigeria.org/br

¹⁰⁵ Cf. http://www.ureport.ug

¹⁰⁶ A serious problem for this is that jugements supplétifs do NOT contain the same information as the birth- or death record but much less. Also, only a small part is transcribed at registration offices (and even for those cases there is no procedure in place to collect the missing data to create complete birth- or death records).

¹⁰⁷ There are 348 civil registration offices and 41 police offices with a national ID issuance function (in fact there are even less than 41 offices that can print the ID).

multitude of problems (cost, communication) such as content error, sharing, archiving and retrieval. Guinea needs to move towards a aradual computerization of its civil registration and identification system (R7.1). DNEC's tasks need to include countrywide oversight of local

computerization (R7.2). In the interim, carbonless paper registration books can replace the

registration books now having four parallel "volets". It is proposed that some essential supply chains will be monitored by SMS, e.g. the sending of the volets/copies for the statistics office, the sending of the notification copy to registration offices and the sending of supplies from DNEC to registration offices (R7.3).

The paper- and pencil system now used for civil registration is prone to a

Security concerns related to civil registration

The security of civil registration and identity documents has become an international concern. This has led to substantial efforts by INTERPOL and other law enforcement agencies to gather intelligence on counterfeiting, identity theft and other identityrelated crime. Concerns are voiced regarding the security of data transmission via cellular networks.

The widespread use of the same networks for moving mobile money is evidence that there is a considerable degree of security of those networks. A recent study came to the following conclusion regarding the security of cellular networks compared with the Internet¹⁰⁸: "To date, incidents from malware and other identified danaers that have occurred against handheld devices have been limited when compared with those against desktop and networked computers."

Another study concluded "...the mobile banking channel has the potential to be more secure than traditional online banking."¹⁰⁹ The security of data stored or transmitted electronically should also be compared with the security of the traditional modes of storage and transport of paper documents.

Reaching the rural poor

In 2012 Guinea's rural birth registration rate was 48.8% and the urban registration rate was 82.6%. In 2005¹¹⁰ the poorest 20% of families had registered only 21% of their children, while the richest 20% had registered 83%. This is a very stark inequality by international standards for countries in Guinea's income peer group. The under-registration problem is especially a rural problem, while Guinea's rural population accounts for 65% of the total. This data indicates that especially the poor in rural areas may just be unable to afford the time and direct and indirect cost of birth registration. (Death registration is well below 10% anywhere in Guinea). The response is often to propose more registration offices. Guinea has 348 registration offices. If all

¹⁰⁸ Cf. U.S. Department of Commerce, Gaithersburg MD (2008)

¹⁰⁹ Goode Intelligence, London (2012)

¹¹⁰ For 2012 is no birth registration rate by wealth quintile data available.

citizens should have a registration office at 5 kilometers distance or less, Guinea would need 3,130 offices—almost ten times the actual number. The current number of rural births and deaths registered annually is only 260,000. This is equivalent to only 3—4 vital events¹¹¹ per work day per existing office on average, with on the one hand offices having more to do but also quite a number that have (much) less to register than 3 to 4 events per day. <u>Adding</u> more offices will only create more offices that will have too little to do to be competent, to have division of labor, to receive regular training, to get supplies in time or to be viable for computerization.

The solution is not more offices but offices that have large service areas that they can <u>effectively</u> serve. The proposed method is that health workers (including midwives and traditional birth attendants or community health workers) will become responsible for the notification of <u>all</u> births and deaths¹¹² and registration offices have a duty to follow up with registration within the legal timeframe. Mobile registrars can serve communities every eight months (or more frequently) and be still within the current legal timeframe for birth registration; of course the preference would be for a visit every two months or even more frequently. For birth- and death registration a grace period is also suggested to be introduced, while the current legal timeframe for death registration (three days) is too short and needs to be extended.

The role of health workers can also be linked to vaccination because the current DPT1 immunization rate is 86%, i.e. almost 9 in 10 children will be at least once in contact with a health worker. That moment can be either suitable for birth notification and/or for follow-up monitoring whether birth registration has actually taken place. The latter could be included in the mother- and child carnet.

For any civil registration office (civil registration and identification office if civil registration and ID services are merged) a business case needs to be made. Civil registration offices, according to international standards, do not need to follow local government organization for their optimal location. Since there are obvious service gaps, a mapping study is needed to compare the present office network with the network that would be optimal in terms of proximity to the whole population.

To solve the serious problem of the inequity in service delivery in Guinea the recommendations below are made. These recommendations are the core elements for a feasibility study proposed by the European Union before they are put into practice.

¹¹¹ Admittedly birth- and death registration are not the sole activities in a civil registration office but they are an acceptable proxy for the caseload since apart from marriage registration in the urban area other registration and miscellaneous activities of the registration office are dwarfed by birth registration alone.
¹¹² While hospitals now issue certificates of birth there seems to be no legal basis for this. The sole legal obligation these institutions and staff have is to declare births when parents fail to do this.

New ways of working need to be introduced to reach the poor, rural communities with civil registration services. This first and foremost will have to be through a much-enhanced and legally supported role of the health sector for the notification of vital events. It is proposed that health workers and health institutes will <u>notify all births and deaths</u> and will be equipped to do so (R8.1).

Health workers and health institutes can use mobile phones with an application for the notification of births and deaths, as well as with newly designed carbonless paper notification books (R8.2).

The notification form contents could be adjusted to serve vital statistics purposes better than currently is the case (R8.3). Since vaccination reaches about 90% of children, vaccination is indicated as the prime opportunity to either notify birth or monitor ("gate-keeping function") whether registration has happened. It is proposed that the mother and child booklet ("Carnet de Santé") will include a page to monitor birth registration (R8.4).

Recommendations—8

The mobile phone could be introduced for vaccination recording and – alerts combined with a birth registration monitoring application (R8.5).

Selected civil registration offices will have to be equipped to perform mobile registration tasks on a continuous basis (R8.6).

A mapping study could be carried out to determine the optimal location and a typology and designation of civil registration offices (R8.7).

La Cl	PN, l'Accouchement et la Césarienne sont gratuits
	Carnet de Santé
NOM de	l'Enfant :
	(En majuscules)
Prénoms	
	(Au complet dans l'ontre de l'état civil)
A :	
	le santé est un document qui réunit tous les événements médicau: epuis la grossesse jusqu'après la naissance
	un lien entre les différentes personnes qui interviennent pour la e médicale préventive et les soins de la grossesse et de l'enfant.
la sage-fen	as de le présenter lors de chaque visite médicale afin que le médecin me et l'infirmière puissent prendre connaissance de son contenu, rs observations et les traitements éventuels prescrits.
Emportez-I	e en voyage. Surtout ne l'égarez pas.

Carnet de Santé:

To be used to record whether registration has taken place, and a birth certificate has been issued

Interoperability: major partners

The <u>health sector</u> plays an important role in the civil registration process in a majority of countries because of its involvement in the vital events of birth and death. In Guinea the 2008 Child Act includes new regulations that are aimed at the intensification of the role of MSHP. The health sector is one of the prime clients for vital statistics (especially for data on mortality) that can be generated by a well-functioning civil registration system. The currently still low coverage of "birth declaration" ¹¹³ (to be rephrased into the term "notification") of vital events by the health sector should be provided with the means and resources to perform this task competently. The health sector is already using mobile phones for reporting of health- and epidemiology data.

Evidence of the impact of interoperability with the health service

A recent study providing quantitative evidence of the positive relationship between birth registration and public health campaigns was carried out in Ghana, where registration rates have improved substantially.¹¹⁴ However, the impact needs to be measured over the long term. An on-going project in Uganda in which civil registrars have been placed in more than 130 hospitals which have been linked to the registration system, may provide important evidence in the near future.

The integration of civil registration, **national ID and electoral systems** is a worldwide trend. Guinea could learn from other countries and leap over early learning complications that other countries have overcome. Important national savings could be achieved through integration of systems and reduction of duplications. An important implication for integration is that a national civil register and a national population register¹¹⁵ will replace the current local scope civil registers.

The **justice ministry** is an important partner for the civil registration sector and will by nature remain so to the extent that civil registration requires the support from the justice sector. However, current tasks such as "coter" and "parapher" of registration books or the archiving of copies of the records of registered vital events are based on a tradition older than two centuries that has no place and justification anymore in the present. There is a general consensus that the role of the justice sector in civil registration needs to be reduced.

¹¹³ In Guinea the term "declaration" is used for certificates issued by hospitals for birth and death. This is an uncommon and confusing use of terminology, and the term "notification" is more apt. The term "certification" should be consigned to the issuance of certificates of vital events by the civil registrar. ¹¹⁴ Cf. Fagernäs, Sonja. Brighton (2012)

¹¹⁵ A population register is organized according to the residence (address) of citizens (and permanent residents); a civil register is (usually) organized by the place where vital events occur.

Examples of best practice integration of civil registration and ID systems

Ethiopia, Malawi, Kenya and Sudan have all developed new civil registration and national ID legislation in one law. This is optimal legal practice, provided that only one agency is responsible, or if two they are optimally interoperable as is the case in the Americas. In the Americas in general the integration of civil registration and national ID systems is better than in Africa or Asia.¹¹⁶ ¹¹⁷ In Uruguay new-borns (99% of whom are born in hospital)¹¹⁸ receive a unique identity number, a birth certificate and a national ID before being released from hospital.

The above leads to the following recommendations for interoperability.

In order that the intensive role of the health sector for birth- and death notification will be performed optimally it is required that MATD and MSHP forge close collaboration through a Memorandum of Understanding (R9.1).

MATD and MSHP also should conduct regular meetings at directors' level (R9.2).

For the interoperability between identity systems, the work of the proposed High-Level Committee (R12) and the new policy it may develop (R11) may result in an organizational integration of civil registration and identification (national ID) and the electoral register or to close collaboration with CENI. MATD will need to have regular meetings at director's level with the Police and CENI irrespective whether this organizational integration takes place or not (R9.3).

Selected current tasks of the Justice ministry could be eliminated by decree, or reduced (e.g. grace period) or bound by a transparent countrywide standard (cost of the jugement supplétif). The jugement supplétif should record all the information contained in a birth certificate, including the data for statistical use (R9.4).

Recommendations-9

¹¹⁶ According to data from CLARCIEV (the association of civil registrars in Latin America), among twenty Latin American countries fourteen (70%) have a single agency responsible for both civil registration and national ID. Among them a substantial number has an electoral body responsible for civil registration and national ID, which is optimal integration—when used in people's interest.

¹¹⁷ The integration in Latin America has also led to the term "civil identification" getting hold, while it is not a common term anywhere else in the world. Cf. <u>http://clarciev.com/</u>

2.3.2 Legal change

Key Recommendations for Legal Reform—Check list

- Evidence-based legal change
- Civil registration law may need comprehensive revision
- Civil registration and national ID systems may need to be brought under one legal
 umbrella
- Civil registration law should be culturally, socially and religiously sensitive and inclusive
- Provisions for the digital age need to be covered by civil registration law or related law

National law

The current legal framework for civil registration (and national ID) is no longer—and perhaps has never been—fit for purpose since Guinea acquired its independence. Guinea's transformation into a democratic country with regular elections and its regional economic integration with other member countries of ECOWAS provide compelling reasons to revisit the legal framework for civil registration and identification. It is necessary that a new law will bring together legal texts that are now scattered across different laws, decrees and ordinances some of which cannot even be found anymore. What still is fit for purpose can be retained but otherwise the new law will need to incorporate the legal foundation of a new organizational, integrated design of the civil registration and (adult) identification functions currently performed by MATD, the Police and CENI.

Recommendation-3

Guinea needs a new, modern law on civil registration, vital statistics and identification that is in accordance with international standards. This law can replace the current legal texts. Such a new law could be an evidence-based law.¹¹⁹ The law could also be accompanied with regulations that serve as practical and operational guideline as well as legal foundation for, for example, fees that may require more frequent change than the main body of civil registration and identification law. The new law should provide the legal basis for digitization and the use of technology. It is proposed that the lawmaking process will be thorough, informed by international good practice and consultative, and without undue pressure to achieve quick results (R3).

It is important that a necessarily thorough and time-consuming process of drafting of the new law does not delay the urgent reform of the civil registration and identification system. Also, some of the organizational changes proposed require to be tested first before they are framed into law. The development of a new vision on the organization civil registration, vital statistics and identification, and the organization of electoral registration, will require time. Only when a clear vision on the new organizational design has been developed the law could be drafted. However, "quick fixes" of the current legal framework and current organization of the civil registration

¹¹⁹ Evidence-based law is legislation based on scientific evidence. For example, setting the legal timeframe for registration would be based on evidence of people's behavior with regards to registration in relation to their resources, cultural practices (e.g. name-giving) etc.

services are necessary and possible. It is desirable that during a transitional period a number of new rules will apply to address the most pressing bottlenecks in the system, to be put into effect by a transitional decree. These bottlenecks are shown in recommendation R10. See also R2.2 and R2.3.

There has been a start of local computerization with help from international NGOs. Negative experience in Cameroon and Côte d'Ivoire warrants that the central government prevents any uncoordinated computerization from taking place in order to avoid an almost irreversible process of creating a patchwork of systems that cannot be linked in future.

A decree is proposed to:

1) Extend the current timeframe for death declaration;

2) Introduce a grace period for birth- and death registration¹²⁰;

3) Introduce new carbonless registers and notification books;

4) Introduce a new notification form that includes internationally

recommended entries for vital statistics purposes;

5) Extend the tasks of DNEC with the authority of approval of local civil registration computerization projects;

6) Establish countrywide uniform fees for late birth- and death registration and the court procedure as well as exempt timely birth- and death registration from the levy of a fee and the introduction of the obligation of

registration offices to post the fees publicly and well visible to the public;

Recommendations—R10 7) Introduce the duty of all registration offices to report their production data on a regular (e.g. weekly) basis

8) Establish the legal obligation of health staff and institutions to notify all births and deaths:

9) Amend the contents of the jugement supplétif so that all information for civil registration records and vital statistics is included (R10)

In advocating for legal change, UNICEF works with members of parliament at the national level, and with the regional economic commissions (in this case UNECA), and the Inter-Parliamentary Union and UNSD at international level. All of these bodies are sources of legal advice. To remain well informed about safeguards and regulations, ensuring that travel documents are genuine and secure through a strong foundation in civil registration, UNICEF works with INTERPOL and the International Civil Aviation Organization (ICAO). Both organizations acknowledge the crucial role that civil registration plays in the provision of secure travel documents through strong travel documentation systems. The International Development Law Organization (IDLO) may help with legal reform, and UNHCR and the Soros Foundation have relevant legal expertise on issues regarding refugees, asylum-seekers and stateless people. UNICEF can help MATD/DNEC access the appropriate expertise for legal change.

¹²⁰ The UNSD-recommended grace period for birth and death declaration is 12 months, which include the legal timeframe for declaration of birth (6 or 8 months now) and death (3 days now). Within the grace period late declaration of vital events are still within the registrar's authority; only after the grace period delayed declaration of vital events requires a court procedure.

International law

In section 1.3 Guinea's status with regards to reporting to the Committee on the Rights of the Child was discussed. A new report is due in 2017. Guinea needs to improve its implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child. It also needs to improve its reporting to the Committee since by the next round Guinea will have only submitted 3 of the 6 reports it should have submitted since 1990. The good news that registration has improved from 2005 through 2012 was not yet known when the CRC wrote its Concluding observations of 2013 and a too low registration rate (1 in 3 children) was reported. The CRC generally correctly identifies the problems with regards to birth registration (especially those with regards to DNEC, and the plight of the rural poor). It is with regards to the interventions proposed that the CRC may have been less well "sage", e.g. when "extensive awareness raising campaigns" are recommended without evidence that they would help. See the next section.

IMPLEMENTATION OF THE CONVENTION OF THE RIGHTS OF THE CHILD ARTICLES 7 AND 8 AND THE CRC REPORTING PROCESS: PREPARING FOR 2017

Governments of countries that have ratified the Convention are required to report to, and appear before, the Committee on the Rights of the Child periodically to be examined on their progress with regards to the advancement of the implementation of the Convention and the status of child rights in their country. Their reports and the Committee's written views and concerns are available on the Committee's website. UNICEF plays a key role in the reporting process with regards to Articles 7 and 8 since the organization is recognized as one of the best-informed UN agencies with regards to the status of birth registration in the country. The UNICEF-supported MICS surveys, and the USAID-supported DHS surveys conducted regularly help to include in the reporting process the key indicators for the birth registration situation in the country. This is now the case for the data that just have become available from the survey conducted in Guinea in 2012. UNICEF's SITAN is another possible source of information for the status of birth registration in the country.

UNICEF has developed its own handbook for the implementation of the CRC (cf. UNICEF. New York (2007-2). For the implementation of all the articles the handbook presents the following checklists:

- Checklist for general measures of implementation
- Checklist for specific issues of implementation
- Reminder about general principles and other related articles

The checklist for specific issues is detailed and a very useful tool, especially for the review of the organization of civil registration and the legal framework.

Guinea is well on the way to report progress in birth registration rates by 2017. When a reform process is set in in 2014 and "quick fixes" are made in the next few years Guinea could report progress and an agenda for reform going well beyond birth registration rates alone.

2.3.3 Stimulating demand

The stimulating demand – intervention checklist

- General improvement in the civil registration service
 - o Near to where people live
 - Free or at reasonable cost
 - o Procedures that are transparent, clear, simple and culturally sensitive
- Incentives, such as social transfer programmes
- Services that are tailored to marginalised groups

In developed countries registration coverage is complete since there are both strong incentives to register and strong disincentives to not register. It is not impossible to reside illegally in developed countries but the consequence is a deprival of most government benefits and services as well as private services for which an ID is required (e.g. banks). In a developing country such as Guinea those incentives and disincentives are largely absent. In stead there are incentives for the public and officials for fraud when controls are largely absent, officials are paid low salaries and procedures and costs for delayed registration dissuade the public from respecting the law. Often fraud is not in the form of counterfeit documents but the issuance of genuine documents by officials "outside of the official circuit" or in conflict with the law (e.g. registering birth as within the prescribed timeframe, while the registration is actually delayed). The best structural response is to streamline and professionalize the civil registration service and perform regular controls and audits.

Incentives

The social transfer project to be introduced shortly by the government with help from the World Bank provides a first opportunity to link identification with a tangible, pecuniary benefit of registration, as is so common in developed countries. It is an opportunity not to be missed. It also provides an opportunity for the use of the mobile phone for small amount cash transfers and the popularization of the mobile phone as a means to avail of "banking services" by the poor. In relation to this the government could enhance the verification of identity documents at the moment of issuance of SIM-cards,¹²¹ and tighten the multiple use of a single ID for the acquisition of SIM-cards.

The education sector is the single most important "gate-keeper" when it comes to the entry of unregistered children to the school system. The right to education implies that the lack of a birth certificate cannot be a reason to refuse a child school entry, but MATD and the Education ministry should have a joint program to enroll unregistered children in a court procedure for delayed registration, while the curriculum needs to include education in human- and child rights (a recommendation made to Guinea by the Committee on the Rights of the Child).

¹²¹ For Nigeria's National SIM card Project biometrics were used. Cf. Gelb, Alan and Julia Clark. Washington (2013), p. 30

Disincentives

In order to address the main reasons for non-registration—distance and costs—measures are proposed to reduce or eliminate fees (see R10) and improve the outreach of civil registration service through enhanced interoperability with the health sector (see R9.1) and new ways of working of registrars in selected offices (especially in rural areas—see R8.6) as well as a review and possible reorganization of the current office network (see R8.7). The introduction of a grace period for the registration of vital events (see R10) will also reduce the need for the court procedure.

Costs of registration and certificates

To reach universal birth registration UNSD recommends that when registration is within the time period prescribed by registration law no fee should be charged for registering births. The same applies to marriage and death registration. UNICEF's Implementation handbook for the CRC states that certificates should be free, at least for the poor. UNSD considers fees for extracts of the register (certificates) acceptable, and recommends a higher fee for certificates issued when registration is later than the prescribed period.

The highly successful Registro Nacional de Identificatión y Estado Civil ("RENIEC") in Peru charges fees for most of its services (civil registration and national IDs) but provides new-borns with their birth certificates and first identity cards (also issued from birth) for free. It should be kept in mind though that even when no fee is levied birth registration or obtaining a certificate rarely is without cost: often there are costs for travel, costs for accommodation and costs of lost income.

It is proposed that the World Bank-funded "filets sociaux" project will include as program element¹²² a deliberate collaboration with MATD to provide beneficiaries with a legal identity (R11.1).

Mobile phone penetration is quickly moving to 100% and more in the most remote villages. Since the issuance of SIM-cards requires an ID the strong demand for mobile phones raises awareness regarding the utility of identity documents. The government could use the ID-requirement for SIM-card issuance for raising awareness for the importance of the possession of identity documents (R11.2).

The government could use the mobile phone network for public service messages (e.g. security and public health messaging, or reminders for vaccination etc.) (R11.3).

Recommendations—11

Entry in the school system is for almost all children the first time their birth certificate is required. The education sector therefore has an important role in verifying whether children are registered and initiating corrective action when needed. It is important that MATD/DNEC works with the education sector to institutionalize in a joint program the verification ("gate-keeping") role of Education (R11.4).

It is also desirable that the primary school curriculum includes material on human- and child rights, and the right of children to be registered. (R11.5)

¹²² The beneficiaries of this social protection project are by definition those that are the poorest citizens who are the least likely to be registered. Cash support has proven to be an effective means to break the cycle of intergenerational poverty. The identity of beneficiaries is essential for the implementation of the transfer program. A legal identity for beneficiaries is also one of the empowering opportunities offered by the program. The World Bank has reacted positively to proposals to seek synergy between civil registration development and this social protection program.

2.3.4 Communication for development (C4D)

Using C4D strategies to strengthen birth and civil registration programming: Check list

- Strengthening the identification and analysis of who is being left out and why
- Analysing both the technical and inter-personal capability of frontline workers
- Building a broad coalition of partners to develop and implement advocacy strategies for birth registration
- Developing appropriate strategies and techniques for raising awareness and fostering positive change in attitudes and social norms
- Mobilizing children and young people
- Supporting demands for transparency and accountability

UNICEF uses a combination of strategies including advocacy, social mobilization and a mix of community and household level interventions, to facilitate the process of behaviour and social change. C4D is increasingly being used to:

- (a) Garner political support to shape and implement policies and ensure adequate allocation of resources, by amplifying community voices and connecting them to upstream policy advocacy;
- (b) Motivate and mobilize civil society, community- and faith-based organizations and social networks to help traditionally excluded groups to claim their rights;
- (c) Raise awareness, foster positive attitudes, social norms and practices for decision-making and
- (d) Actively empower households and communities to demand accountability and good governance at local, provincial/state and national levels.

Building on UNICEF's guiding principles and based on the human rights based approach to programming (HRBAP), particularly the rights to information, communication and participation enshrined in the Convention on the Rights of the Child (Articles 12, 13 and 17), the values and principles that guide UNICEF's C4D work include, among others:

1. Facilitating enabling environments that:

- a. Create spaces for plurality of voices/narratives of community
- b. Encourage listening, dialogue, debate and consultation
- c. Ensure the active and meaningful participation of children and youth
- d. Promote gender equality and social inclusion

2. Reflecting the principles of inclusion, self-determination, participation and respect by ensuring that marginalized groups (including indigenous populations and people with disabilities) are prioritized and given high visibility and voice.

UNICEF uses a social-ecological model that focuses on the complex inter-play of (i) national and international policy, legislation and systemic factors and (ii) social, economic and personal factors, all of which influence both the provision and uptake of services, and determine the extent to which we can affect sustainable social transformation.

The social-ecological model necessitates an integrated approach in which C4D acts as the binding thread between policy and programme work, ensuring cohesion, mutual reinforcement and synergy across all policy, programme and communication work. The following points highlight the areas in which the use of C4D tools and methods may be particularly useful in promoting birth registration.

Strengthening the identification and analysis of who is being left out and <u>why</u>. For instance: inadequate or exclusionary policies or legislation and weak enforcement systems that lead to the benign neglect or active exclusion of certain groups of the population (e.g. ethnic minorities and children with disabilities); lack of political will and/or a lack of understanding among policy makers regarding the importance of birth registration in national planning; social norms and practices that facilitate or obstruct registration at the time of birth; economic conditions and related concerns that prevent resource-poor families from accessing distant facilities; etc. Based on the analysis, communication strategies can be developed to address the key issues.

Analysing the technical and inter-personal capability of frontline workers in acting as *informants* of births and in creating awareness of, and receptivity towards, birth registration among families and communities. Appropriate C4D strategies can be used to foster positive attitudes and to strengthen the technical and inter-personal skills, commitment and confidence of frontline workers in promoting birth registration.

Building a broad coalition of partners to develop and implement advocacy strategies for birth registration. UNICEF should work with partners including civil society, faith-based organizations and the media, to develop and implement strategies to raise the profile of birth registration as a critical part of national policies and plans, create political will, and mobilize resources for the strengthening of birth registration.

Developing appropriate strategies and techniques for raising awareness and fostering positive change in attitudes and social norms. The investigation of personal beliefs, value systems and social norms of households, communities and social groups vis-à-vis naming a new-born and registering her birth should inform such strategies. Analysis should include the perspectives of people on the importance or not of birth certificates in their lives.

Mobilizing children and young people to help create awareness and understanding of both the value of birth registration and of the process of registering a child's birth.

Supporting demands for transparency and accountability by supporting of civil society organizations to strengthen the capacity of communities and households in the delivery of services at local, provincial and national levels, and to influence provincial and national policy.

It is rather common that the target group for the raising of awareness is the general public because it is seen to be insufficiently aware of the importance of civil registration. However, this assumes that a lack of public awareness is the (main) cause of under-registration. If, however, registration doesn't take place because of failings of the service on the one hand and rational decision-making on the part of the public on the other, no amount of awareness raised will make a difference. The awareness and agency of all stakeholders should pass the test of adequacy rather than the awareness and agency of the (potential) users of the service alone.

One important way in which registration offices can improve their image is by posting the official fees in a prominent place in the office. MATD/DNEC can insist they do so. The development of easily understandable messages on posters could help convey to the general public what the fees are, and which services are exempt from any fee.

Enabling environment

Political instability over the past decade, and especially in early 2007, has led to the destruction of civil registration records. Thus far no activity has been undertaken to reconstitute these destroyed records, which by law is required. Experience in other countries such as Côte d'Ivoire can be brought to bear on project design.

Guinea has several major and smaller population groups that use different languages and may be subject to discriminatory treatment by government officials. Also, some traditional practices may not be well accommodated by current law, e.g. time-consuming name-giving traditions. India, Trinidad-Tobago and Senegal are examples of countries that have made special provisions for delayed giving of first names (given names). See the box below.

Political stability

The registers that have been destroyed in the past decade, especially in 2007, need to be reconstituted (R12.1).

A study may be done of reconstitution of records in other countries such as Côte d'Ivoire before embarking on the reconstitution project. (R12.2).

The services of the United Nations Volunteer (UNV) program could be considered to lead the reconstitution process (R12.3).

In order for the reconstitution to be permanent the reconstituted registers could be digitized and an electronic backup can be kept in a safe location (R12.4).

<u>Culture</u>

Recommendations—12

The proposed process to develop evidence-based law needs to lead to culturally sensitive evidence-based lawmaking. For example, when name-giving traditions can consume considerable time the law needs to accommodate such traditions (R12.5).

Similarly, language and illiteracy can be important barriers to the use of civil registration services, and the service needs to respond adequately to overcome these barriers (R12.6).

Duty bearers

The "shoestring" budget for civil registration is the single-most important reason why a change of mind of politicians is urgently needed. There is a pressing need to raise awareness among policymakers of the importance of the civil registration sector as the foundation for all other identity systems and the most-preferred and affordable source for vital statistics (R13.1). See also R12.2.

Donors and NGOs

While donors, UN organizations and NGOs already are moving towards better coordination there is still some way to go. There is also room for learning and exchange of experience within this community. The establishment of a coordination forum that would meet on a regular (e.g. quarterly) basis could be considered (R13.2).

The general public

When the service is in place and within affordable distance of the public the government can raise awareness about civil registration, e.g. by using new media such as public messaging through mobile phone, radio and TV. This will include the information of the general public of any change in the service or the regulations and fees (R13.3).

It is important that registration offices and registrars do their part in raising awareness, e.g. by information posted in the registration offices (R13.4).

Name giving and birth registration legislation

Customs often determine when and how a child can be named. In some cultures the prerogative of naming a child is that of the grandparents. If they are not alive or live in a distant place, the naming of the child may be delayed beyond the time prescribed by law for registering births.¹²³

To address this problem, some countries are now allowing for births to be registered without a name, making it possible for names to be added to the record later. Section 14 of India's 1969 Registration of Births and Deaths Act provides for parents or guardians of a child who has been registered without a name to add the name within a prescribed period. This information can be given either <u>orally or in writing</u> to the registrar who is bound to enter the name in the register.

In 2012, Trinidad passed a Birth and Death Registration (Amendment) Bill in which a new section permits recording of the name at <u>any time</u>, on application to the registrar with the set of prescribed supporting documents. Persons older than 18 can make this application themselves.

These laws demonstrate that the name is only one part of the identity of a child. Information in the record on the parents and the date and place of birth makes it easy to ensure that the possibility of error is negligible. On the other hand the risk of "content error" increases greatly when the registration in its entirety is delayed for reasons such as delayed naming.

¹²³ Communication from UNICEF Uganda regarding customs for naming children in Central and Western parts of Uganda.

2.3.5 Coalitions and partnerships

Building coalitions and strengthening collaboration for birth registration—Check list

National level

- Working with civil society organizations and NGOs to promote the role of children, families and communities
- Supporting government to mount coordinated multi-sector response between and among government agencies, local and national civil society and international organizations
- Coordinate advocacy

International level

- Supporting participation in and providing technical assistance to regional and international inter-governmental meetings
- Partnerships for international advocacy on birth registration
- Facilitate bilateral and multilateral learning and support, both north/south and south/south

National level

In a multi-faceted endeavour, such as strengthening civil registration, each stakeholder should support the elements best suited to its capacity. UNICEF should work in partnership with civil society organizations and (I)NGOs to promote the role of children, families and communities as primary stakeholders who can contribute to the dissemination of understanding on the importance of civil registration and contribute their views and perspectives on the design of culturally sensitive civil registration systems. Local NGOs are an important bridge between families, communities and the government agencies responsible for registration and invaluable sources of local know-how that should inform policy-making.

UNICEF has a key role to play in **supporting government to bring about a coordinated**, **multi-sector response** to strengthening the civil registration system in which all stakeholders participate. In many countries, coordination between government agencies with responsibility for civil registration is particularly challenging. Coordination mechanisms may exist between ministries but they are not always effective. In Guinea UNICEF will help MATD and DNEC develop partnerships with the Ministry of Health (notification role), the Ministry of Social Welfare (for integration civil registration and social transfer programs; social and child protection issues), the Ministry of Education (gate-keeping function, child rights curriculum), the Ministry of Security (Police; national ID) and the Ministry of Justice (modernizing the role of the ministry in civil registration).

UNICEF can coordinate advocacy to concerned ministries and agencies, including exposure to good examples from other countries. UNICEF can also work with the higher levels of government to ensure that a strong signal of the importance of civil registration, together with a requirement for regular reporting, could also facilitate better coordination—this applies especially to the proposed High-Level Steering Committee. Commitments made by the government to bodies like the Committee on the Rights of the Child or to meetings of Heads of State, as in the case of the African Union¹²⁴, could also result in higher levels of commitment to joint action on civil registration.

¹²⁴ Declaration and Medium Term Plan of Action adopted at the Meeting of African Ministers Responsible for Civil Registration, organized by the Economic Commission for Africa, the African Union Commission and the African Development Bank, Addis Ababa, August 2010.

Working with Parliamentarians for Birth Registration

Parliamentarians can ask tough questions, demand answers and hold governments to account. Each major function that parliaments perform has the potential to further the cause of children and the support civil registration. Now Guinea has just elected a new parliament opportunities to harness parliamentarian support for civil registration reform have opened up.

Main areas for Parliamentary partnership

1. Law making and law revision. A new law is needed to improve the quality of the service and make registration available free of cost and easily accessible to all families.

> **South Africa** incorporated child rights including the right to a name and nationality from birth in their 1996 Constitution¹²⁵. This places civil registration within the over-arching legal framework for the country.

> Recent revisions of law in **Kenya**, **Sudan and Ethiopia** bring civil registration and national IDs under a single law.

> Law reform should be evidence-based and consultative. The involvement of academics, practitioners, civil society and the general public enriches understanding, broadens awareness and strengthens networks and partnerships.

2. Budgeting. Adequate funds from core government budgets are essential to strengthening civil registration. Parliamentarians can monitor how the budgets are utilized and review results. In particular, MPs can call attention to discrepancies between the civil registration budget and the budget for ID and electoral systems and how in Guinea substantial savings are possible through a well-functioning civil registration foundation.

3. Monitoring birth registration rates. Parliamentarians can throw a spotlight on areas where governments need to do more, as in the case of regions or population groups where the registration rates are low. They can ask for information about why registration rates are low and what governments plan to do to improve them.

Engaging with parliaments¹²⁶

There are both formal and informal entry points across a parliament's work. Department committees have this responsibility in some Parliaments, specialized committees, informal caucuses or working groups in others. It is essential that Parliamentary procedures are studied and the political situation is assessed before a strategy of engagement with Parliament is initiated. This seems an auspicious time for engagement of the new Parliament in Guinea.

Initiating Parliamentary partnerships

It is desirable that contacts with the Parliament should be initiated through the office of the UNICEF Representative in the country office and is followed through by a clearly identified focal point.

Briefings

A good first step is start with briefings of Parliamentarians. They can be made aware of the disaggregated registration levels in their own constituencies and what this means to the children they are responsible for. The latest data for 2012 are very useful for this in Guinea. Field trips to places where children's birth is registered are a useful way for them to understand the problems and help find solutions. As the examples in this report show observation of examples of good and not so good practice may not require a trip outside Conakry.

¹²⁵ Article 28, Constitution of the Republic of South Africa

¹²⁶ Examples of dedicated parliamentary forums for children include: Children's Parliamentary Caucus in Zambia: the Turkish Parliamentary Child Rights Monitoring Committee, The Parliamentary Committee for Children in Mauritius, the Korean Parliamentary League on Children, Population and Environment and the Korean Friends of UNICEF at the National Assembly of the Republic of Korea.

Regional and international intergovernmental meeting

In Africa, UNECA, the African Union and the AfDB organised the first Civil Registration Ministers Meeting in Addis Ababa in August 2010 as a response to inadequate understanding of the importance of civil registration and vital statistics at higher levels of government. The meeting attended by over 40 ministers resulted in a Declaration and Plan of Action. A core group of UN agencies—UNHCR, UNFPA, UNICEF and the Health Matrices Network of WHO—came together to support the process. UNICEF has been playing a catalytic role in the Core Group. A second ministerial meeting, in which several ministers of health also participated in recognition of the role of the health sector in strengthening civil registration and vital statistics, took place in Durban, South Africa in September 2012. This Ministerial meeting has now been elevated in official status by the African Union with a mandate to report progress to the Heads of State and Government once every two years. It has been agreed that all countries will prepare "costed national plans of action reflecting country priorities mainstreamed into the national development plans and programmes" to be "implemented with support from the Secretariat and partners."¹²⁷ Guinea has been present at both ministerial meetings.

UNICEF can facilitate bilateral and multilateral learning and support between countries, both north/south and south/south, Countries in Latin America (for example Chile, Peru and Uruguay) as well as in Asia (for example Malaysia and Thailand), which have state-of-the-art civil registration and identity management systems, offer an ideal learning ground for countries in need of civil registration reform.¹²⁸

Examples of Parliamentary Partnerships for Birth Registration

Indonesia

UNICEF was one of the founders of the National Consortium on Civil Registration in 2001 and remained an active member until the Law on Population Administration was approved in 2006. The Consortium played a key role in providing technical input to the law. UNICEF provided technical assistance to the parliamentary team by hiring a consultant for one year to provide day-to-day technical inputs to lawmakers, and follow up on all parliamentary processes surrounding the law. UNICEF brought in international experts on birth registration to make accessible international good practices on the issue. At the policy level, UNICEF also provided technical support to the development of local laws on birth registration, with over 30 UNICEF-supported districts having adopted legislation on free birth registration by January 2007.

Uganda

A petition to Parliament about child abuse led the Parliamentary Committee on Gender, Labor and Social Development to invite the Uganda Registration Services Bureau (URSB) in 2010 to present its views on the petition. The petition mentioned ten points in relation to birth registration, and made five suggestions, including a change of the law and the development of a national policy on birth registration. URSB reported that it had hired a legal consultant who had made suggestions for changes in the law, which were discussed in a national consultative workshop. The Minister of Justice, having received the suggestions for change of the law, required the development of a National Policy first. URSB requested UNICEF for assistance in the development of the National Policy on Birth Registration, which was provided. UNICEF gave financial support, resulting in a draft policy and a discussion in a consultative workshop early 2012.

¹²⁷ Statement of Ministers, 2nd Conference of African Ministers Responsible for Civil Registration, Durban South Africa, 5-7 September 2012.

¹²⁸ Cf. for example: Triangular Cooperation Program Brazil. (2009). South-South cooperation examples are those between NADRA Pakistan and civil registration authorities in Nigeria and Sudan in Africa.

2.4 SYNTHESIS: ADDRESSING BOTTLENECKS

In section 1.7 the rating of the importance of bottleneck areas by workshop participants was presented. The result of the rating of the feasibility of solutions (consolidated results of ratings before and after group work) is as shown in the box below.¹²⁹

Feasibility of solution		
4	2.5	
5	2.5	
7	2.6	
3	2.5	
2	2.4	
6	2.6	
8	2.6	
1	2.3	
	4 5 7 3	

Stakeholder rating of solution feasibility of bottlenecks

Legend: Green—Most feasible Yellow—Intermediate solution feasibility, Red—Least feasible

Putting the interoperability between MATD and the health sector in practice is considered the most feasible pathway to registration improvement, followed by stimulating demand. Interoperability overall is considered harder to tackle (intimating that the integration between registration and identification systems is perceived more "daunting" than collaboration with health). But by combining the two interoperability bottleneck areas this could be perceived as the 2nd most promising area for civil registration improvement and the consultants would concur. We would agree also that perhaps least promising areas for results are the "enabling environment" (here not including the policy and legal framework, but the political and security environment, culture and tradition, and obstacles in geography) and awareness raising (when targeted to users of the system, without the service being offered more adequately, indeed most likely a futile undertaking).

Combining the rating for relative problem importance and relative solution feasibility we have come to the following table of the results combined:

¹²⁹ In section 1.7 the before (n=87) and after (n=50) group work rating of problems areas by importance and of solutions by feasibility were discussed (cf. note 93). The before and after ratings showed some interesting differences. Perceived average importance of bottlenecks rose slightly, while the perceived average feasibility of bottleneck resolution remained unchanged, but variance in feasibility of bottleneck solutions rose notably. Shifts in perceived feasibility of bottleneck resolution were substantial as compared to perceived relative importance. Shifts in relative feasibility that were largest were for problem areas 7 (Awareness: from 3 to 8), and 5 (Demand: from 2 to 6)—both perceived substantially harder to solve after discussion—and for problem area 4 (Legal framework: from 8 to 2)—perceived to be hardest first but 2nd only problem area 1 in perceived relative ease to solve after group work.

Bottleneck area	Importance of bottleneck		Feasibility of solution		Expert ranking priority		•
1 Organization	1	4.5	4	2.5	1		
2 Reaching the poor	5	4.0	5	2.5	1		
3 Interoperability overall	6	3.9	7	2.6	1		
4 Legal framework	4	4.0	3	2.5		2	
5 Demand	7	3.8	2	2.4		2	
6 Enabling environment	8	3.5	6	2.6			3
7 Awareness	3	4.1	8	2.6			3
8 Interoperability MATD-MHSP	2	4.3	1	2.3	1		

The bottleneck area ratings in one view

Legend importance: Green—Most important, Yellow—Intermediate importance, Red—Least important Legend feasibility: Green—Most feasible Yellow—Intermediate solution feasibility, Red—Least feasible

In the consultants' view, to be validated by the main stakeholders, interventions with the highest priority would target 1) organizational bottlenecks—with special emphasis on those bottlenecks that cause the service to be exclusive (for the better-off) rather than inclusive and equitable, 2) the collaboration between the civil registration sector and health, and 3) the integration of civil registration and identification systems. In order that organizational improvements can be obtained quickly there is a need for legal work on two tracks, viz. a "quick fixes" decree and the more time-consuming drafting of a new legal framework. At the same time a 2nd order priority is to coalesce civil registration reform with the social transfer program (stimulating demand).

2.5 GOVERNMENT AND UNICEF PROGRAMMING

Given 1) the current status of the civil registration sector, 2) the knowledge that new elections for local government and the presidency will be held in 2014/2015, 3) that a biometric national ID will be introduced rather soon and 4) that Guinea will receive more than notional financial support for civil registration reform for the first time, lead us to the conclusion that Guinea is on a cross-roads. Guinea can choose for comprehensive reform of or it can (continue to) make incremental and uncoordinated repairs to its civil and electoral registration and national identification systems. Given the country's journey towards democracy and good governance since the elections of 2010, the choice ought to be for comprehensive reform. This will also receive staunch support from the donor community. The EUR 1.2M grant from the European Union to MATD and UNICEF for the improvement of civil registration in the prefectures of Kankan and N'zérékoré is much too small to cover the costs of civil registration reform (costs of which are estimated at USD 25M). But the grant is large enough to set the country on the right path.

The immediate follow-up for MATD/DNEC and UNICEF would be to undertake the lobbying and legwork to obtain high-level stakeholder buy-in, assemble the High-Level Committee (recommendation R1.2) and start work on developing the civil registration- and identification policy (R1.1).

The local mission of the European Union has proposed:

- 1) A feasibility study of the recommendations for the EU-funded project, with a focus on the technological elements and the enhanced role of the health sector, and
- 2) Development of a separate project for legal reform.

The recommendations arrived at in this report are shown on pages 7 through 12 within the MoRES framework. They are based on conclusions reached at the five-day participatory workshop held in Conakry in November 2013 and they were earlier presented and discussed in section 2.3. Recommendations marked with Rx(.x) are recommendations proposed for incorporation within or support to the EU-funded project. The project will find an optimal balance between the introduction of structural changes and urgency by focusing on "quick wins" some of which will need a legal basis. To provide that basis it is proposed that a decree is passed to enact those changes. The recommendations are presented according to the MoRES framework (which differs slightly with the order of sections in chapter 1).

END



ANNEX 1—PERSONS AND INSTITUTIONS CONSULTED

INSTITUTION	PERSON
Ministère de l'Administration Territoriale	Alhassane Condé, Ministre
et de la Décentralisation (MATD)	
	Dr. Condé Yamori—Secrétaire Général
do	Cissé Sekou Amadou—Chef du Cabinet du MATD
do	1—Moustafa Kobélé Keita, Conseiller Juridique MATD;
	2—Aminatat Sohra Bangouna, Assistante du SG; 3—
	Théophile Fenano—Focal point/National Consultant
MATD—Direction Nationale de l'Etat	1—Ibrahima Kaba—Director General; 2—Alpha
Civil (DNEC)	Amadou Touré—Directeur National Adjoint
Ministère d'Etat Chargé des Affaires	Laho Bangoura, Ambassadeur, Chef de Cabinet
Etrangères et des Guinéens de	
l'Etranger WHO (OMS)	1—Dr. Diallo Abdoul Karim, Administrateur National,
	Chargé de la Lutte contre la maladie; 2—Dr.
	Mara Karifa, MD. DESS, Administrateur National,
	Chargé du Système de Santé, Point Focal
	Fiancement de la Santé;
	3—Dr. Saliou Dian Diallo—Programme Santé
	Familiale; 4—Issihaga Konate, Communications
	Officer; 5—Dr. Cécé Vieux Solié—Consultant
	edn/oms
Commission Electorale Nationale	Bokar Cissoko—Secrétaire Général
Indépendante (CENI)	
Child Fund	Tim Césaire Guemou—Sponsorship Relations
	Manager
Plan Guinée & Plan Ireland	1—Ibrahima Touré—Country Director; 2—Akoy Dédé
	Béavogui—Directeur des Programmes—Stratégies;
	3—Tamba Banda Millimouno, Directeur National des
	Finances; 4—Idrissa Somparé—Grants Business Development Coordinator; 5—Aidan Leavy—Business
	Development Coordinator Plan Ireland
Ministère de la Santé et de l'Hygiene	Dr. Aissatou Diallo Director Nationale Adjointe de la
Publique	Santé Familiale
Ministère de la Justice Garde des	1—Mamadouba Keita—Directeur National Adjoint
Seaux (MJGS)	au Droit et de la Justice; 2—Bandiou Doumbaya—
	Greffier en Chef Court d'Appel
Ministère de l'Enseignement Pré-	1—Souleymane Camara—Directeur Générale; 2—
universtaire et de l'Education Civique	Alpha Aliou Barry; 3—Said Kandé
(MEPU-EC), Direction Générale de la	
Planification des Statistiques et du	
Développement de l'Education	1. M. Defe dá Kaita. Directo u Nationale Asiainte O
Ministère des Affaires Sociales, de la Promotion Féminine et de l'Enfance	1—M. Bafodé Keita—Directeur Nationale Adjoint; 2— Mme Diallo Fatimatou
(MASPFE); Direction Nationale de	
l'Education Préscolaire et de la	
Protection de l'Enfance	
Institut Nationale de la Statistique	
Autorité de Régulation des Postes et	1—Bah Mamadou Lamarana; 2—Diallo Ousmane
Télécommunications—1. Direction	Oury
Réseaux et Services; 2. Direction des	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,
Opérations de Régulation	
The World Bank	1—Cheick F. Kante, Country Manager; 2—Safiatou L.
	Diallo, Operations Officer; 3—Thierno Hamidou
	Diallo—Disbursement Assistant
Matoto Centre de l'Etat Civil	Ansoumane Satina Diallo—Chef de l'Etat Civil
UNHCR	1—Aimé Wata, Senior Protection Officer; 2—Hassatou
	Barry, Senior Protection Assistant
Fondation Internationale pour les	Elizabeth Côte, Répresentante
Systèmes Electoraux	

Même Droits pour Tous (MDT)	Pierra Camara, Chargé de programmes
European Union	1—Kristophe Casas, Chargé de programmes; 2—
	Beatriz Betegon-Ramiro, Chargé de programmes
	Economie & Gouvernance
INS—Institut National de la Statistique	1—Diallo Mamadou Badian, Directeur de la Direction
	Démographie et Conditions de Vie et Menages; 2-
	Mme M'Balou Berete, Sous-Directrice Etat Civil
Orange Guinée	Abdoul Karim Bangoura, Directeur Marketing et
	Communication
Tostan	Mouctar Oularé, National Coordinator
Sabou Guinée	1—Camara Moussa, Coordinateur de Projet; 2—
	Diené Bengah, Coordnateur; 3—Camara
	Aboubacar; 4—Tamba Joseph Tolno, Directeur
	Administratif; 5—Diallo Alpha Ousmane, Coordinatur
	Projets
USAID	1—Mark R.K. Wilson Democratie & Governance
USAID	Officer; 2—Francois Traore, Specialiste du
	Programme Démocratie & Gouvernance
Commune Urbaine de Kindia	1—Mme Joséphine Dore, Secrétaire Générale; 2—
	Kata Saran, Chargé de l'Etat Civil; 2—Fofana Alsény,
	Assistant l'Etat Civil
Tribunal Premiere Instance de Kindia	1—Seydou Keita, Magistrat/Président; 2—Kouwuma
	Mamady, Greffier
Commissariat Central de Police Kindia	Lena Saa Moty, Commissaire Divisionaire
Maternité Regional Alpha Oumar	1—Dr. Bakary Condé, Directeur Général Adjoint; 2—
Diallo, Kindia	Dr. Koita Natara
Visit Community Guerissoriaya	1—Moussa Sylla, Village Chief; 2—Fodé Camara,
	director pre-school; 3—Ramatoulaye Diallo, teacher
Torro dos Hommos	pre-school
Terre des Hommes	Olivier Feneyrol, Chef de Délégation
Groupe Media	Mamadou Tafsir Diallo
Sabari Technology	1—Mamdy Condé, Directeur Général; 2—Konate
	Dsiba, DGA; 3—Kalabane Oumar, Coordinateur; 4—
	Sow Samba, Conseiller; 5-Meme Triumph, Interprete
UNICEF	1—Mohamed Ag Ayoya, Répresentative; 2—Félix
	Ackebo, Deputy Representative; 3—Gervais
	Havyarimana Chef du Programme Education; 4—Dr.
	Salvador Nibitanga, Chef du Programme Santé ; 5—
	Guirlene Chérie Frédéric, Chef du Programme
	Protection de l'Enfant; 6—Raymonde Fomba (RF)—
	PA du Programme Protection de l'Enfant

ANNEX 2—BIRTH REGISTRATION AND THE GLOBAL RIGHTS AGENDA¹³⁰

Following the devastation of the two World Wars, the international human rights framework was founded on the concepts of the dignity, worth, equality and inalienable rights of human beings. There is consensus within the human rights framework on the importance of the right to birth registration and to a name and nationality, and these rights are recognised in several of the core instruments.

THE RIGHT TO BIRTH REGISTRATION, A NAME AND NATIONALITY

The right to a nationality was recognised in the Universal Declaration of Human Rights of 1948, and was expanded in the treaties that followed. The 1961 Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness provides for the right to a nationality by setting out rules for granting nationality to children who are born within a State's territory, and to children

born to a national living abroad, who would otherwise be stateless. This convention, which came into effect only in 1976, was the first to mention the link with registration. The right of the child to a name and nationality from birth was contained in Principle 3 of the 1959 Declaration of the Rights of the Child, which formed the basis for Convention on the Rights of the Child of 1989.

Main international human rights instruments that support the right of the child to birth registration, a name and nationality¹³¹

International instruments

1948: Universal Declaration of Human Rights, Article 15
1961: Convention on the Reduction of Statelessness, Article 1
1966: International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, Article 24
1979: Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women, Art. 9
1989: The Convention on the Rights of the Child, Article 7
1990: International Convention on the Protection of the Rights of all Migrant Workers and Members of their Families, Article 29.
2006: Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities, Article 18.

Regional instruments

- 1969: American Convention on Human Rights, Article 20
- 1990: African Charter on the Rights and Welfare of the Child, Article 6
- 1997: European Convention on Nationality, Article 6.

Use of the multiple references to birth registration in the international human rights framework for advocacy

The multiple references to the right to birth registration in the international human rights instruments can be used for advocacy purposes. Advocacy by PLAN contributed to Thailand dropping its reservation to Article 7 of the CRC in 2010, using the argument that Thailand was also party to the ICCPR which committed it to birth registration for all children within its jurisdiction¹³².

¹³⁰ Taken from Civil Registration Centre for Development (2013), pp. 9–11

¹³¹ Adapted from: UNICEF Innocenti research Centre (2002)

¹³² Plan (2010)

UNICEFs seminal article in *The Progress of Nations* 1998, highlighted birth registration as the 'first right' on which access to other rights was dependent, and gave impetus to UNICEF's current work on birth registration. UNICEF bases its work in support of birth registration principally on Articles 7 and 8 of the CRC, which give every child the right to be registered at birth by the State within whose jurisdiction the child was born, the right to a name and nationality and to the preservation of his or her identity.

Articles 7 and 8 of the CRC

Article 7

- 1. The child shall be registered immediately after birth and shall have the right from birth to a name, the right to acquire a nationality and, as far as possible, the right to know and be cared for by his or her parents.
- 2. States Parties shall ensure the implementation of these rights in accordance with their national law and their obligations under the relevant international instruments in this field, in particular where the child would otherwise be stateless.

Article 8

- 1. States Parties undertake to respect the right of the child to preserve his or her identity, including nationality, name and family relations as recognised by law without unlawful interference.
- 2. Where a child is illegally deprived of some or all of the elements of his or her identity, States Parties shall provide appropriate assistance and protection, with a view to speedily re-establishing his or her identity.

There are other articles of the CRC that should be used to inform the way in which the right to birth registration should be administered, for example, the principles of nondiscrimination (Article 2).

Articles of the CRC that inform the way birth registration should be administered¹³³

Article 1: Definition of the child Article 2: Non-discrimination Article 3: Best interests of the child Articles 4, 42, 44(6): General measures of implementation

There are many other provisions of the CRC that may require birth registration for their fulfilment. Birth registration by itself does not guarantee children's access to their other rights. This also depends on the existence of effective, inclusive systems of health, education, child protection, social welfare, justice, and social and economic development. However without birth certificates a child and his or her family are less likely to be able to realise many of their social, economic and civil rights.¹³⁴

¹³³ Adapted from: UNICEF Innocenti Research Centre (2002).

¹³⁴ Cf. for example UNICEF (1998), pp. 4-5, UNICEF Innocenti Research Centre (2002), pp. 5-8 and UNICEF (2007), pp. 97-119

Some of the articles of the CRC that may require birth registration for their fulfilment

Article 9 : Separation from parents Article 10: Entering or leaving countries for family preservation Article 19: Protection from all forms of violence Article 21: Adoption Article 24: Right to health and health services Article 28: Right to education Article 32: Child labour Article 34: Sexual exploitation of children Article 35: Prevention of abduction, sale and trafficking Article 38: Protection of children affected by armed conflict

The Committee on the Rights of the Child (CRC) addressed the issue of birth registration in its General Comment No. 7 on Implementing Child Rights in Early Childhood.¹³⁵ The Committee stated that comprehensive services for early childhood should begin at birth. It noted that provision of registration for all children at birth is still a major challenge in many countries and regions. This can impact negatively on a child's sense of personal identity, and children may be denied entitlements to basic health, education and social welfare. As a first step in ensuring rights to survival, development and access to quality services for all children (art. 6), the Committee recommended that States parties take all necessary measures to ensure that all children are registered at birth.

The United Nations Statistics Division (UNSD) is responsible for civil registration standards—including those for birth registration. While adhering to these standards, the Committee on the Rights of the Child formulated what have become de facto standards for PLAN in its General Comment No. 7 (see the box below).

UNICEF-Supported Birth Registration Standards formulated by the Committee on the Rights of the Child

Ensuring that all children are registered at birth can be achieved through a **universal**, **well-managed registration system** that is **accessible** to all and **free of charge**. An effective system must be **flexible and responsive to the circumstances of families**...¹³⁶ The Committee notes that children who are sick or disabled are less likely to be registered in some regions and emphasizes that **all children should be registered at birth**, **without discrimination of any kind** (art. 2). The Committee also reminds States parties of the importance of **facilitating late registration of birth**, and ensuring that **children who have not been registered have equal access to health care**, **protection**, **education and other social services**."

¹³⁵ Cf. United Nations, Committee on the Rights of the Child (2006), pp. 11-12. See also UNICEF (2007-1), pp-99-100 where UNICEF's implementation handbook for the CRC aligns itself with the Committee with regards to the standards for civil registration systems from a child rights perspective.

¹³⁶ The Committee on the Rights of the Child mentions mobile registration as an example of being responsive to the circumstances of parents. Mobile registration and awareness-raising campaigns have proven to be interventions with a problematic cost-benefit ratio in many situations.

ANNEX 3—AGE DISTRIBUTION OF DELAYED REGISTRATION IN KINDIA COMMUNE 137

It appears that less than 30% of jugements supplétifs issued by the court in Kindia are transcribed a verso at the Centre de l'Etat Civil. While almost all jugements suppletifs transcribed a verso are done so almost immediately, there are also a few (8 cases) court papers that only are transcribed more than a year later.

Very few of those transcriptions are for children and youth. Less than 10% of the transcriptions is for children and youth below the age of 17—see the diagram below. This raises a serious question: what identity documents are used for schoolchildren to sit their exam, or is the unregistered 40% of children (or the 60% without the birth certificate) not attending school, not sitting the exam or are counterfeit documents used? In the village of Guerrisoriaya in the Kindia prefecture reportedly none of the schoolchildren was registered.

If the Kindia data is used over the period January-August 2013 645 jugements supplétifs were issued in the same period as 4,202 births were registered within the legal timeframe. This is equivalent to 1 delayed registration per 7 timely birth registrations. If all unregistered births (about 40% of the total at age 5) would be submitted for delayed registration (jugement supplétif) one would expect a ratio of 2 in 3. <u>I.e.: about 80% (4 out of 5) of births not registered by age 5 will not be put up for delayed registration at all.</u>



¹³⁷ Viewing these court data allowed to also see some of the content errors that even in a good functioning office are happening: 1) 26 of 172 (1 in 6) records not useable because duplication, age or date jugement supplétif completely missing; 2) 34 of 152 (1 in 5) records have an estimated anniversary date and/or age for the applicant, illustrating the inaccuracy that slips in when vital events are not registered in time; 3) one person was born on 30 February (worse than being born in a leap year, never a birth day party!); 4) another person was almost a 100 years old (possible although rare, but why still have a jugement supplétif?).

ANNEX 4—ESTIMATES OF THE NUMBER OF UNREGISTERED CHILDREN AND CHILDREN WITHOUT A BIRTH CERTIFICATE

	Population 2014	Under-five birth registration rate 2012 1)	Under-five birth certification rate 2012 1)	Under-five unregistered 2014	Under-five without birth certificate 2014	Under-18 estimate unregistered 2014	Under-18 estimate without birth certificate 2014
[1] Région de Kankan	[5] 1,642,923	[6] 62.2	[7] 26.6	[11] 102,000	[12] 199,000	[13] 309,000	[14] 603,000
Kankan	446,458	02.2	20.0	27,700	54,100	84,000	163,900
Kérované	318,550			19,800	38,600	59,900	116,900
Kouroussa	226,054			14,000	27,400	42,500	83,000
Mandiana	299,813			18,600	36,300	56,400	110,000
Siguiri	352,047			21,900	42,600	66,200	129,200
Région de N'Zérékoré	2,788,483	60.7	43.8	181,000	259,000	549,000	785,000
Beyla	236,682			15,400	22,000	46,600	66,600
Gueckédou	912,385			59,200	84,700	179,600	256,900
Macenta	597,870			38,800	55,500	117,700	168,300
N'Zérékoré	409,244			26,600	38,000	80,600	115,200
Lola	247,071			16,000	22,900	48,600	69,600
Yomou	385,229			25,000	35,800	75,800	108,400
Vile de Conakry	1,837,659	86.4	78.4	41,000	65,000	124,000	197,000
Ensemble 3)	12,038,090	57.9	41.5	821,000	1,141,000	2,489,000	3,459,000

Sources: 1) Institut Nationale Statistique, Ministere d'Etat de la Sante et de l'Hygiene Publique. Guinea EDS-MICS. Conakry, Maryland (2013) 2) UNICEF. State of the World's Children. New York (2013): Total population 2012 11,451,000; population under five 1,856,000 and population under 18 5,627,000.

3) World Bank data, cf. http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/SP.POP.TOTL/countries

INFORMATION SOURCES

Association internationale des maires francophones. Le renforcement de la cooperation en matiere d'etat civil. Le role de l'Observatoire International de l'Etat Civil. Paris (2003)

- Barrientos et al. Social protection for the poor and poorest in developing countries: reflections on a quiet revolution, BWPI Working Paper 30, School of Environment and Development, University of Manchester, Manchester, p. 3.
- Civil Registration Centre for Development. Putting all the world's children on the map. A new guide to UNICEF's birth registration programming, The Hague (2013)
- Commission on the Legal Empowerment of the Poor and UNDP, Making the Law Work for Everyone, New York (2008)
- CSIRO, Ernst & Young, Public Records Office Victoria, Keeping Electronic Records Forever. Melbourne (1999)
- Department for International Development. Social transfers and chronic poverty. Emerging evidence and the challenge ahead. Practice paper. London (2005)
- De Soto, H. The Mystery of Capital, New York (2000)
- Europlus. [Unnamed report]. Annexe 3 Analyse des politiques sectorielles en lien avec le processus de décentralisation. Conakry [Unknown date]
- Gelb, Alan and Julia Clark. Center for Global Development. Identification for Development. The Biometrics Revolution. Preliminary draft. Washington (2013)
- High-Level Panel of Eminent Persons on the Post-2015 Development Agenda. A new global partnership. Eradicate poverty and transform economies through sustainable development. New York (2013)
- International Institute for Vital Registration and Statistics. Recommendations from Regional Conferences and seminars on civil registration and vitals statistics. Technical Paper No. 18. Bethesda, MD (1982)
- Landinfo. Country of origin information. Guinee. La police et le systeme judiciaire Oslo (2011)

Longman, Timothy. Identity cards, ethnic self-perception, and genocide in Rwanda. In: . In: Caplan, Jane and John Torpey. Documenting individual identity. Princeton (2001), pp. 345-357

Menski, W., Comparative law in a global context. The legal system of Africa and Asia (2006) Mission d'observation electorale de l'Union Europeenne Republique Guinee. Election

legislatives-28 Septembre 2013. Declaration preliminaire. Conakry (2013)

- Nations Unies. Conseil economique et social. Projet de descriptif de programme de pays Republique de Guinee. New York (2012)
- Njoka, John M., The rights at birth. Stock taking and agenda setting for Africa. Birth registration profiles for selected African countries. Nairobi (2009)
- Noiriel, Gérard. The identification of the citizen. The birth of republican civil status in France. In: Caplan, Jane and John Torpey. Documenting individual identity. Princeton (2001), pp. 28-48.
- Plan Guinée, Country strategic plan 2013-2017, Working for and with children to build safe, secure and empowering communities that provide quality basic education and health services to all. Conakry (2013)
- Panapress, Les données sur l'état civil de Conakry bientot informatisées, Conakry (2001)
- Republic of Guinea. Institute Nationale de la Statistique. Rapid poverty assessment survey 2007-2008. Conakry (2008)
- Republique de Guinee. Direction Nationale de la Statistique. Ministere du Plan. Enquete Démogaphie et de Sant Guinee. Calverton, Md (2006)
- République de Guinée, Ministère du Plan et de la Cooperation Internationale, Institut Nationale de la Statistique. Amélioration de l'enregistrement des naissances, décès et mariages, dans les cinq Communes de la ville de Conakry, Conakry (2010)
- République du Cameroun, Ministère de l'Administration du Territoire et de la Décentralisation, IFORD. Cartographie de l'État Civil. Rapport Final-1. Yaoundé (Undated)
- République de Guinée, Ministère de l'Administration du Territoire et de la Décentralisation, Rapport de visite de terrain sur 'étude "Analyse et Récommendations pour l'Amélioration de l'Etat Civil en Guinée. Lieu: N'zérékoré et Kankan. Par Fenano Karamo Théophile. Conakry (2013).
- Szreter, Simon. (2007). The right of registration. Development, identity registration and social security—A historical perspective. World Development. Vol. 35, No. 1, pp. 67-86 (2007) The World Bank. The World Development Report 2006, New York (2006)
- The World Bank. Resilience, Equity and Opportunity. The World Bank's Social Protection and Labor Strategy 2012-2022. Washington (2012-1)

- The World Bank. Project appraisal document on a proposed grant in the amount of SDR 16.2 million (US\$25 million equivalent) to the Republic of Guinea for a productive social safety net project. Washington (2012-2)
- The World Bank. Sierra Leone Social protection assessment. Washington (2013)
- The World Bank and the African Development Bank. The transformational use of information and communication technologies in Africa. Washington, Tunis (2012)
- Uganda Registration Services Bureau, European Union and UNICEF. Civil registration study tour in Uganda. Breaking with Broken Systems. EU-UNICEF partnership for the legal identity of African, Asian and Pacific children. Nairobi (2013)
- UNICEF. The Progress of Nations 1998. New York (1998)
- UNICEF, The State of the World's Children 2005, New York (2005)
- UNICEF. Programme, Policy and Procedure Manual. Programme Operations. Revised. New York (2007-1)
- UNICEF. Implementation Handbook for the Convention on the Rights of the Child. Geneva (2007-2)
- UNICEF, The State of the World's Children 2009, New York (2009)
- UNICEF, The State of the World's Children 2013, New York (2013-1)
- UNICEF. A Passport to Protection. A Guide to Birth Registration Programming.New York (2013-2)
- UNICEF. Every Child's Birth Right. Inequities and Trends in Birth Registration. New York (2013-3)
- UNICEF ESARO. Social Protection in Eastern and Southern Africa: A Framework and Strategy for UNICEF, Nairobi (2008)
- UNICEF Innocenti Research Centre. Birth registration, Right from the start, Innocenti Digest, No. 9. Florence (2002
- United Nations. Committee on the Rights of the Child. Convention on the Rights of the Child. Concluding observations. Geneva (1999)
- United Nations. Convention on the Rights of the Child. General Comment No. 7. Implementing child rights in early childhood. Geneva (2006)
- United Nations. Committee on the Rights of the Child. Convention on the Rights of the Child. Consideration of reports submitted by States parties under article 44 of the Convention. Second periodic reports of States due in 1997. Guinea. Geneva (2012)
- United Nations. Committee on the Rights of the Child. Convention on the Rights of the Child. Concluding observations. Geneva (2013)
- United Nations. Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Statistical Office, Handbook of Vital Statistics Methods. C9w7c8-Series_F7en New York (1955)
- United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Statistics Division, Handbook on Civil Registration and Vital Statistics Systems, Preparation of a Legal Framework. New York (1998-5)
- United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Statistics Division. Principles and Recommendations for a Vital Statistics System. Revision 2. Series M_19rev2E New York (2001)
- Vali, Nasr. The dispensable nation. New York (2013)
- Wata, Aimée, la protection international de l'enfant en droit congolais. Zurich (2013)